

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE

+ + + + +

NATIONAL OCEANIC AND ATMOSPHERIC
ADMINISTRATION

+ + + + +

MARINE FISHERIES ADVISORY COMMITTEE

+ + + + +

TUESDAY, MAY 24, 2011

The Marine Fisheries Advisory Committee met at the Florida Keys Eco-Discovery Center, 35 East Quay Road, Key West, Florida, Heather McCarty, Acting Chair, presiding.

MEMBERS PRESENT:

- HEATHER D. McCARTY, Acting Chair
- ERIC SCHWAAB, *ex officio* member
- TERRY ALEXANDER
- RANDY CATES
- ANTHONY CHATWIN
- PAUL CLAMPITT
- PAMELLA J. DANA
- BILL DEWEY
- PATRICIA DOERR
- PHILLIP J. DYSKOW
- EDWIN A. EBISUI
- MARTIN FISHER
- CATHERINE L. FOY
- KEN FRANKE
- STEVE JONER
- JULIE MORRIS
- GEORGE C. NARDI
- TOM RAFTICAN
- KEITH RIZZARDI
- VA'AMUA HENRY SESEPASARA

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

DAVID H. WALLACE

CONSULTANTS TO MAFAC:

JOHN V. O'SHEA

STAFF PRESENT:

MARK HOLLIDAY, Designated Federal Official

HEIDI LOVETT

JOSHUA STOLL

NICK VALENTINI

ALSO PRESENT:

JIM BALSIGER

ED BARHAM

SUSAN BUNSICK

BILLY CAUSEY

RON DEMES

JOHN FAIRWEATHER

NED FARQUHAR

ROBERT FOY

TONY IAROCCI

LORENZO JUAREZ

BILL KELLY

EMILY LINDOW

JONO MILLER

TIM O'HARA

MELODY RAY-CULP

GARY REISNER

LEAH RUSSIN

JIM SCHOLL

EILEEN SHEA

AMBER STONIC

BOB WILLIAMS

HEATHER YOUNG

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

C-O-N-T-E-N-T-S

| | |
|--|-------|
| Call to order | 7 |
| Heather D. McCarty Acting Chair | |
| Opening Remarks | 8, 21 |
| Eric Schwaab Assistant Administrator for Fisheries NOAA | |
| Introduction of New Members | 9 |
| Introductions | 11 |
| Agenda Review | 31 |
| Heather D. McCarty Acting Chair | |
| Key West Marine Policy Issues | 47 |
| Local Governance Perspective | 47 |
| Jim Scholl Key West City Manager | |
| Questions and Comments | 72 |
| Naval Air Station - Overview of Navy Environmental Changes | 79 |
| Ed Barham Environmental Director Naval Air Station, Key West | |
| Questions and Comments | 90 |
| Key West National Marine Sanctuary Overview | 94 |
| Billy Causey Regional Director National Marine Sanctuary Program (NOAA NOS) | |
| Questions and Comments | 115 |

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

C-O-N-T-E-N-T-S (CONTINUED)

| | |
|---------------------------------------|-----|
| Overview of NOAA Regional Issues | 126 |
| Roy Crabtree | |
| NMFS Southeast Regional Administrator | |
| Questions and Comments | 147 |
| National Ocean Policy Implementation | 166 |
| - Priority Objectives | |
| Mark Holliday | 166 |
| Director of Policy | |
| National Marine Fisheries Service | |
| Questions and Comments | 192 |
| Emily Lindow | 210 |
| NOAA Fisheries Senior Policy Analyst | |
| for Energy | |
| Questions and Comments | 227 |
| CMSP and Ocean Energy | 239 |
| DOI Smart from the Start Program | |
| Ned Farquhar | |
| Deputy Assistant Secretary | |
| Land and Minerals Management | |
| Leah Russin | 256 |
| Senior Advisor to the Director | |
| Bureau of Ocean Energy Management | |
| Questions and Comments | 272 |
| Committee Discussion | 317 |
| Climate Change Adaptation | 331 |
| State of Science and Policy | |
| Eileen Shea | |
| Chief, Climate Services and | |
| Monitoring Division (NESDIS) | |
| Questions and Comments | 369 |

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

C-O-N-T-E-N-T-S (CONTINUED)

| | |
|--|-----|
| Gulf Ecosystem Restoration Task Force | 399 |
| Heather Young NOAA Coordinator for the Gulf of Mexico Ecosystem Restoration Task Force On Behalf of John H. Hankinson, Jr. Executive Director Gulf Ecosystem Restoration Task Force | |
| Questions and Comments | 430 |
| Committee Discussion | 448 |

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

2 8:38 a.m.

3 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay, I think we
4 are ready to start.

5 My name is Heather McCarty. I am
6 from Juneau, Alaska, and I am the Acting
7 Chair.

8 I would like to welcome everybody,
9 especially those people who have come so far
10 to help us and speak to us today, and to all
11 the members. I think we are almost at full
12 strength here. I think we have got almost
13 everybody.

14 I would also like to thank the
15 staff, Mark, Heidi, and the other folks who
16 have been working so hard to get us all set
17 up. It is a beautiful venue. This is a
18 gorgeous meeting room, and we are really lucky
19 to be here.

20 And thank you, Pam, for helping us
21 with the lodging arrangements.

22 DR. DANA: And thank Ron Deans from

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the Navy.

2 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay.

3 I am going to turn it over first to
4 Eric Schwaab, who, as you know, is the
5 Assistant Administrator for Fisheries. He is
6 going to introduce the new members, and
7 welcome to those new members, and I think,
8 also, have people introduce themselves around
9 the table and give a few opening remarks.
10 Then, we are going to go through the agenda.

11 Eric?

12 MR. SCHWAAB: Thank you, Heather.
13 Thank you, all. It is a pleasure to be here
14 with you.

15 Let me do first the introductions
16 of new members and, then, we will go around
17 the table and around the outside of the table
18 to do general introductions.

19 This is a great group. I share
20 with Heather the excitement of having I think
21 a full contingent. One of the reasons we are
22 able to say that is because we do have three

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 new members with us. And so, we are very
2 pleased to welcome Phil Dyskow. And let me,
3 as I say that, maybe perhaps allow each of you
4 to just say a word or two about yourselves.

5 Phil, if you don't mind?

6 MR. DYSKOW: Thank you.

7 I have spent my entire life in the
8 recreational sport fishing industry at one
9 level or another. For the past 28 years, I
10 have worked for Yamaha Motor Corporation,
11 retiring last year as Group President of our
12 Marine Products Group. I still work for the
13 company as an advisor, and I sit on the Board
14 of another organization called the Center for
15 Coastal Conservation, the National Marine
16 Manufacturing Association, and am a past Board
17 member of the American Sportfishing
18 Association and I am a past Board member of
19 Recreational Boating and Fishing Foundation.

20 MR. SCHWAAB: Thank you, Phil.

21 DR. HOLLIDAY: Welcome.

22 MR. SCHWAAB: I'm sorry?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 DR. HOLLIDAY: I said welcome.

2 MR. SCHWAAB: Yes.

3 Then, Julie Morris. Julie,
4 welcome.

5 MS. MORRIS: I'm Julie Morris. I
6 live in Sarasota, Florida, which is just up
7 the coast from here.

8 I work at a small public liberal
9 arts college, New College of Florida, where I
10 do academic administration. I have just
11 completed my years as a Council member of the
12 Gulf of Mexico Fishery Management Council.
13 And before that, I was for 10 years with the
14 Florida Fish and Wildlife Commission, the
15 State agency that manages fish and wildlife in
16 Florida.

17 MR. SCHWAAB: Thank you, Julie.
18 Welcome.

19 And, Henry Seseapasara. Henry,
20 welcome.

21 Did I get that right?

22 MR. SESEPASARA: You got it right.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 (Laughter.)

2 I am from American Samoa, which is
3 only about 7500 miles from here.

4 (Laughter.)

5 The only U.S. soil south of the
6 equator.

7 I retired from working with our
8 Government for 38 years in many capacities. I
9 was the Director of the Fish and Wildlife
10 Department in American Samoa for 16 years. I
11 also worked as the Manager for the Coastal
12 Samoan Programs.

13 As I said, I retired. I am
14 presently a politician. I am a Representative
15 in our House of Representatives at home.

16 And I am very pleased to be here.

17 MR. SCHWAAB: All right, thank you.

18 So, why don't we just start, then,
19 and do introductions around the table first,
20 and then we will go around the outside?

21 Roy, do you want to start?

22 DR. CRABTREE: Sure. I am Roy

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Crabtree. I am the Southeast Regional
2 Administrator in St. Petersburg, Florida. I
3 sit on the Gulf of Mexico, South Atlantic, and
4 Caribbean Fishery Management Councils.

5 Thank you. It is good to be here.

6 DR. DANA: I am Pam Dana. I am the
7 owner of Sure Lure Charter Company out of
8 Destin, Florida. We do full-hire charter
9 fishing and, also, some commercial fishing.

10 MR. DYSKOW: Phil Dyskow. You
11 already know me.

12 MR. O'SHEA: Good morning. I am
13 Vince O'Shea, Executive Director of the
14 Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission.

15 MR. ALEXANDER: Terry Alexander. I
16 own commercial boats, one gillnetter, one
17 dragger.

18 MR. RAFTICAN: Tom Rafitcan, the
19 Sport Fishing Conservancy.

20 MR. CLAMPITT: My name is Paul
21 Clampitt. I am from Iverson Fisheries
22 Incorporated. I am a longline fisherman in

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Seattle, Washington.

2 MR. WALLACE: Dave Wallace. I
3 represent commercial fishing interests in the
4 Northeast and live in Maryland.

5 DR. CHATWIN: I'm Tony Chatwin.
6 I'm the Director of Marine and Coastal
7 Conservation at the National Fish and Wildlife
8 Foundation, and I live in Maryland.

9 MR. FISHER: Hi. I'm Martin
10 Fisher. I live in St. Pete, Florida. I'm a
11 vertically-integrated commercial fisherman.

12 CHAIR McCARTY: I already
13 introduced myself, but just to tell you a
14 little bit about myself, I represent
15 commercial fisheries and academic clients in
16 Alaska. I have a CDQ Group as a client. I
17 have the School of Fisheries and Ocean
18 Sciences as a client, and I also represent
19 fishermen's groups and processors' groups.
20 So, I am sort of across the commercial
21 spectrum.

22 MR. SCHWAAB: You're vertically-

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 integrated, too, then.

2 CHAIR McCARTY: I am horizontally.

3 (Laughter.)

4 DR. HOLLIDAY: Hi. I am Mark
5 Holliday. I work for Eric as his Director of
6 Policy for National Marine Fisheries Service.
7 I am also MAFAC's Designated Federal Officer.

8 MR. RIZZARDI: Keith Rizzardi. I
9 am a Florida environmental worker.

10 MR. EBISUI: Good morning.

11 I am Ed Ebisui from Hawaii. I fish
12 recreationally, but I also have a commercial
13 marine license. I am one of those in-the-gap-
14 type people.

15 I just want to add to Henry's
16 introduction that he is also a former member
17 of the Western Pacific Regional Fishery
18 Management Council. He and I went through the
19 longliner wars on that Council, but it all
20 turned out good.

21 MR. DEWEY: Good morning.

22 I am Bill Dewey with Taylor

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Shellfish Company. We are based in Washington
2 State. We have clam, oyster, mussel, and
3 geoduck farms throughout through Puget Sound
4 and the coast of Washington. I also have a
5 shellfish farm of my own.

6 MR. JONER: Good morning.

7 I am Steve Joner. I am from Port
8 Angeles, Washington. It took three of us from
9 Washington so we are equal to Florida.

10 (Laughter.)

11 MR. FISHER: We have four.

12 MR. JONER: You have four?

13 So, I represent the Waconia Indian
14 Tribe, which are not as far away as Henry, but
15 they are on the opposite corner of the
16 continental United States, 3750 miles from
17 here.

18 MR. NARDI: Hi. I'm George Nardi,
19 and I'm with GreatBay Aquaculture, a marine
20 species finfish hatchery. We also operate
21 farms as well and sell juveniles to third
22 parties.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. FOY: Hi. I'm Cathy Foy. I am
2 a marine mammal biologist from Kodiak, Alaska,
3 and come from a commercial fishing
4 environment.

5 MR. CATES: Randy Cates, Hawaii.
6 My background is marine mammals, commercial
7 fishing, and aquaculture.

8 MS. DOERR: Patty Doerr. I am
9 Director of Conservation Projects for the
10 Nature Conservancy in New Jersey.

11 MR. FRANKE: Kenneth Franke,
12 President of the Sportfishing Association of
13 California. I own Outer Limits Sportfishing
14 in San Diego.

15 MS. LOVETT: Heidi Lovett. I am in
16 the Office of Policy in the Fisheries Service.

17 MR. STOLL: Josh Stoll, Knauss
18 Fellow in the Office of Policy.

19 MR. VALENTINI: Nick Valentini,
20 intern, Office of Policy.

21 MS. RUSSIN: Leah Russin. I am a
22 Senior Advisor to the Director of the Bureau

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of Ocean Energy Management, Regulation, and
2 Enforcement, a very long title.

3 MR. IAROCCI: Tony Iarocci. I am a
4 past South Atlantic Council Member, presently
5 working in the Caribbean with the Caribbean
6 Council and the fishermen down there.

7 MR. FAIRWEATHER: John Fairweather,
8 Navy Port Ops Officer and Oil Spill Response
9 Officer-in-Charge from the Keys to Homestead.

10 Also, I am a former commercial fisherman and
11 charter boat captain from Morehead City, North
12 Carolina.

13 MR. KELLY: I'm Bill Kelly. I
14 represent the Florida Keys Commercial
15 Fishermen's Association.

16 MR. BALSIGER: I'm Jim Balsiger. I
17 work for Eric and am Regional Administrator in
18 Alaska.

19 MS. BURSINICK: I'm Lynn Bursinick.
20 I am the Program Coordinator for Region 10 in
21 Key West.

22 MR. REISNER: I am Gary Reisner. I

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 also work for Eric. I am the CFO for NOAA
2 Fisheries.

3 MR. O'HARA: I'm Tim O'Hara. I
4 cover commercial fishing and recreational
5 fishing for the Key West Citizen down here. I
6 am also a concerned diver and recreational
7 fisherman, good credibility causes also.

8 (Laughter.)

9 DR. SHEA: Hi. I'm Eileen Shea. I
10 am with the NOAA National Climatic Data Center
11 in Asheville, North Carolina, and the NOAA
12 IDEA Center in Honolulu, Hawaii.

13 MR. DEMES: I'm Ron Demes, the
14 Executive Director for Naval Air Station, Key
15 West, and Business Manager, and I'm here to
16 make sure you have a good time.

17 (Laughter.)

18 MR. SCHOLL: Jim Scholl. I am the
19 City Manager for Key West.

20 MR. BARHAM: Ed Barham. I am the
21 Environmental Director for the Naval Air
22 Station in Key West.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. RAY-CULP: Good morning.

2 My name is Melody Ray-Culp. I am
3 with the Fish and Wildlife Service, and I am
4 in a leadership training program shadowing
5 Billy Causey.

6 MR. CAUSEY: And good morning.

7 I'm Billy Causey. Welcome to the
8 Florida Keys and welcome to Key West.

9 I am the Southeast Regional
10 Director for NOAA's Office of National Marine
11 Sanctuaries. You are going to hear a little
12 bit from me in a short while.

13 But welcome. We have a big family
14 down here. I knew Jim when he was Dagwood,
15 and that was his call sign as Commander of the
16 Naval Air Station. We have had a great
17 relationship over the years here.

18 And Tony, we go way back, all of
19 us.

20 MR. SCHWAAB: Okay. Thank you,
21 everybody.

22 One of the great benefits of these

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 meetings is always the opportunity to get out
2 and see some of the local issues and some of
3 the local opportunities firsthand. I think
4 that is no more so true anywhere than here.

5 I think we have a particularly new
6 element this year, thanks to Pam and thanks to
7 Ron, having the opportunity to stay on the
8 Naval Base, which I think really made for all
9 of us the option of coming to Key West
10 possible.

11 So, Pam, thanks for putting that
12 together.

13 Ron, thanks to you and your team
14 for being so accommodating. We will try not
15 to call you in the middle of the night.

16 (Laughter.)

17 MR. DEMES: I'm used to it. I
18 drive people home, too. Thanks.

19 (Laughter.)

20 MR. SCHWAAB: Well, then, maybe
21 perhaps we will call you.

22 (Laughter.)

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Obviously, we also owe a great debt
2 to the National Marine Sanctuaries Team and
3 the Discovery Center. Thank you all for not
4 only helping us with these accommodations,
5 Billy, but hosting a wonderful trip yesterday
6 that, unfortunately, I was unable to make, but
7 I heard great things about. And thanks for
8 being here in force to help us with our agenda
9 as well.

10 MR. CAUSEY: Absolutely. It was
11 fun. The trip yesterday was a lot of fun.

12 MR. SCHWAAB: Yes. And I certainly
13 want to recognize the staff, Mark and Heidi
14 and the rest of the team, for everything you
15 guys have done to pull all of this together,
16 put together what I think is a very strong and
17 timely agenda, and get the right people here
18 to speak to us and with us about these various
19 topics.

20 I just do want to stop and say a
21 word, particularly for the new members and
22 perhaps for some of the guests, about MAFAC.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 We deal with, obviously, Fishery Management
2 Councils all over the country. Many of you
3 have had direct experience with those
4 Councils.

5 MAFAC is a bit of a different
6 group, and you can't help, when you just walk
7 around the room and listen to those
8 introductions, to recognize the incredible
9 diversity, the functional diversity, the
10 geographic diversity, and the breadth of
11 knowledge that is represented in this room on
12 this Committee.

13 And so, this is the one place
14 where, from our perspective, the agency has
15 the opportunity really to reach out and in a
16 very focused way speak to as broad a cross-
17 section of the U.S. public interested in
18 fisheries and ocean matters. We really do
19 appreciate the opportunity to take full
20 advantage of that. I think that the agenda
21 positions us well to do that.

22 Many of you know, in fact, I guess

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 there are a few of you still around from my
2 days as a MAFAC member. And so, I actually
3 was on this Committee for five years. And so,
4 I don't think that I have to convince anybody
5 regarding the level of importance that I place
6 in the work of this group.

7 So, I thank you for taking time out
8 of your busy personal and professional
9 schedules to be here with us. It is important
10 to us as an organization. You have a lot of
11 contribute, and we expect to take full
12 advantage of it. So, thank you.

13 So, I think the agenda does very
14 much reflect a number of the topical issues
15 that are important to us. They reflect the
16 number of issues that this Committee has
17 worked on in the past. And it is not accident
18 that issues that are front and center for us
19 as an agency are issues that this Committee
20 has worked on and continues to work on.

21 But we are at a very important time
22 as an agency, both from a number of policy

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 perspectives, but also from a budget
2 perspective. So, I did want to say a word or
3 two about budget, just to foreshadow that
4 portion of the agenda. And it is something
5 that will, I think, color a lot of our
6 discussions because we are very much in a
7 different budget time than we have been in for
8 a long time. Gary Reisner will say more about
9 that when we get to that point.

10 But for a long time we had periods
11 of building budgets, we had important work to
12 do, we had generally the opportunity to make
13 argument and gain resources to do that
14 important work. All of that was well and good
15 and justified.

16 Now we are at a place where we
17 still have important work to do, but it is
18 increasingly difficult, if not impossible, to
19 gain new resources on a consistent basis to do
20 all of that work. We are in a position where
21 we are having to make very difficult
22 prioritization decisions. We have to make

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 some tradeoffs that, frankly, we have not had
2 to make, at least in as comprehensive a way,
3 as we are being forced to make right now.

4 And so, I would just say, No. 1,
5 when we get to that point on the agenda where
6 we talk about budget, pay close attention.

7 But, No. 2, I think in the course
8 of our conversation you will see different
9 thinking around budget that will infuse many
10 of our approaches to the issues that come up
11 because of what we see as that overwhelming
12 pressure to really look at tradeoffs and to
13 manage in a flat or declining budget scenario
14 for the first time in a long time.

15 From a policy perspective, many of
16 you have participated with us in conversations
17 where we have talked about what an important
18 time this is in the history of fishery
19 management in the U.S. Because of the work of
20 the Councils, because of the work of people
21 throughout the agency, and because of the work
22 of fishermen and many others, we are now at a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 place where we can say that we have catch
2 limits and accountability measures in place
3 that will have ended overfishing in federally-
4 managed species, in domestic federally-managed
5 species. That is a turning point, puts us at
6 a turning point in the history of fisheries
7 management in the U.S.

8 So, by the end of this year, the
9 Councils will have in place catch limits and
10 accountability measures for all federally-
11 managed fisheries that will at least on paper,
12 subject to verification in the water over
13 time, have ended overfishing and have put
14 stocks on, where necessary, a rebuilding
15 trajectory.

16 And that is just an incredibly
17 momentous point. It is a point that we
18 should, No. 1, stop and take a moment to
19 appreciate.

20 But it is also a point, and I think
21 it is one particularly germane to this group,
22 around which to reflect what next, not suggest

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that the challenge of ending overfishing, of
2 maintaining sustainable fisheries is one that
3 we will have been able to tie up in a bow and
4 set aside. I mean it will always be with us.

5 It will always be something that we have to
6 attend to.

7 But, as we cross that threshold for
8 the first time, we have the opportunity to
9 think very aggressively about what the big
10 future challenges are for us. A number of
11 those are, again, also captured on your
12 agenda.

13 We are also right now very close to
14 putting out our final aquaculture policy.
15 This group was instrumental in putting us on,
16 I think, a pathway to aggressively address
17 that topic, aggressively seek to take
18 advantage of the opportunities that
19 aquaculture affords us, in conjunction with
20 our wildstock fisheries.

21 And so, we look forward not only to
22 moving beyond the policy adoption stage of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 that process, but the hard work ahead of
2 implementation in the many ways that we can
3 support implementation of the National
4 Aquaculture Policy.

5 We also, just last week or so,
6 released our one-year-out review of the
7 Recreational Action Plan that grew out of the
8 sportfishing summit that we held in Alexandria
9 just a little over a year ago. Again, this
10 Committee, through leadership provided by a
11 Subcommittee and a Working Group that you are
12 overseeing and managing for us, has been
13 instrumental in guiding not only the lead-up
14 into that summit, but the development of the
15 action agenda and, then, the work that has
16 transpired since then. I think that we have a
17 very positive story to tell with respect to
18 reframing, reprioritizing, and getting back to
19 work on some issues of high importance to the
20 recreational community.

21 We also have, of course,
22 prominently on this agenda ocean policy

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 issues. Ocean policy issues, obviously, run a
2 wide range of things that are important to all
3 of us. But they present to us a great
4 opportunity from the agency's perspective to
5 think about how we can engage with a broader
6 set of partners who are interested in ocean
7 issues in a way that will help us to advance
8 our agenda at the same time that they seek to
9 advance their agenda.

10 And so, whether you are talking
11 about things like large-scale coastal and
12 ocean habitat restoration or some of the
13 planning issues that exist out there as new
14 uses come against historic uses, and what do
15 we do about that, and how do we plan and
16 manage for that, under the umbrella of ocean
17 policy, we have tremendous opportunities to do
18 better work more comprehensively.

19 And, then, of course, I think also
20 prominently on the agenda, full circle to
21 being here in Key West is the opportunity to
22 focus in on some regional issues. And the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Southeast, the South Atlantic, the Gulf Coast
2 have just a tremendous number of regional
3 challenges that I think represent a microcosm
4 of many of the issues that we face all around
5 the country. Prominently among those are
6 still dealing with the restoration
7 responsibilities that emerged after the oil
8 spill of also a little over a year ago, but
9 many of the other issues with respect to
10 competing uses, habitat concerns, converging
11 around very valuable fisheries and ocean
12 habitats.

13 So, I think we have a great agenda.

14 I am going to be here with you for most of
15 the meeting. I will actually be leaving
16 around lunchtime on Thursday, but look forward
17 to the opportunity to participate in the
18 proceedings, but, also, to spend a little time
19 with you all on the side.

20 And again, thank you for being
21 here.

22 Heather, the gavel is back, yours.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIR McCARTY: Thanks, Eric.

2 MR. SCHWAAB: I'm sorry, I forgot
3 to particularly recognize Heather, who when I
4 talked about the staff working hard to put
5 this agenda together, Heather, you as well I
6 know have been instrumental in putting
7 together this agenda. So, thank you.

8 CHAIR McCARTY: Well, thank you.

9 MR. SCHWAAB: Yes.

10 CHAIR McCARTY: It means a lot to
11 all of us to have Eric here and to have the
12 interest of Eric in this group. I mean it
13 makes a huge difference. I think it makes a
14 difference in people's attitudes as to how
15 important they think their word is because it
16 is being listened to; it makes a difference.
17 Thank you. Thank you for being here.

18 We are going to use you, too, while
19 you are here.

20 (Laughter.)

21 As far as the agenda goes, one of
22 the first questions I had when I got on the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MAFAC was, where does the agenda come from?
2 Who does the agenda? How do we decide what we
3 are going to talk about? And now I know.

4 (Laughter.)

5 Partly, it comes from Eric and his
6 staff. Partly, it comes from Mark. This time
7 we all worked together on trying to come up
8 with some of the things that we knew we were
9 interested in, such as aquaculture, and some
10 of the things we have done before.

11 We also put out a call to the
12 members. For those of you who are new, I
13 don't think you have had that opportunity to
14 respond, but certainly a lot of people did
15 respond. And we tried to include those points
16 of interest in some of the agenda items.

17 We are going to go through them
18 very briefly, and, then, I am going to ask if
19 anybody has any comments or potential changes
20 or thoughts on the agenda, additions even, if
21 you have a pet topic you would like to bring
22 up at some point.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 As you can see, we are going to
2 have the local folks first. We are going to
3 have Roy Crabtree talk about NOAA regional
4 issues.

5 There is one change on the agenda
6 this morning. The Gulf Ecosystem Restoration
7 Task Force speaker that we were going to have,
8 John Hankinson, is not coming. I think we are
9 disappointed about that, but I understand that
10 a youngish woman called Heather Young -- she's
11 the young Heather -- she is coming instead.
12 But she is in the air right now. So, she is
13 not here yet and may not be by the time this
14 comes up on the agenda. So, we are probably
15 going to go from Roy Crabtree directly to the
16 National Ocean Policy implementation issues,
17 and, then, swing back around when Heather
18 Young shows up.

19 As you can see, we are going to
20 spend quite a bit of time this afternoon on
21 those National Ocean Policy issues. I won't
22 go through the whole list, but you can read

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 them here.

2 Eileen is going to speak to us
3 about climate change. That should be
4 interesting. That was one of the requests
5 that came from the members.

6 And, then, at the end of the day we
7 are going to have a joint meeting of Tom
8 Raftican's Ecosystem Subcommittee and the
9 Strategic Planning, Budget and Program
10 Management Subcommittee, which is my
11 Subcommittee.

12 I am thinking about appointing a
13 Chair, an Acting Chair, of that Subcommittee
14 that is not me, so that I don't have to do
15 that and this. And I think it might be more
16 efficient. So, think about, if you are on
17 that Committee and would like to be the Chair,
18 speak to me about that, or else I will just
19 choose somebody.

20 And, then, Wednesday we are going
21 to have a tour of this place, I think.

22 Then, we are going to talk about

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the potential new 2030 document. For the
2 people that are new, we have a 2020 document
3 that we arrived at after much work and
4 Subcommittee action. We are going to talk at
5 this meeting about perhaps updating that and
6 revising it and coming up with a new 2030
7 document. That is what that discussion is
8 going to be about.

9 Gary is going to speak to us about
10 the budget.

11 We are going to talk about
12 aquaculture after lunch.

13 Then, we are going to talk about
14 recreational fisheries. And actually, this is
15 Subcommittee meetings from 2:45 on. You don't
16 have to take up that whole time with your
17 Subcommittee, but Recreational Fisheries is
18 Ken Franke. Cathy Foy is the Chairman of the
19 Protected Resources Subcommittee, and Steve
20 Joner is, of course, Commerce. That is where
21 the aquaculture work has been done most
22 recently on the aquaculture policy comments

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 that came through this group.

2 For the new members, if you would
3 like to be members of one of those
4 Subcommittees or even more than one, sometimes
5 they meet simultaneously. So, it is easier to
6 just be sometimes on one, but you are
7 certainly welcome to float, if you would like
8 to see what you want to be on. Just let us
9 know up here.

10 And if people don't know what
11 Subcommittee they are on, I think there is a
12 list online, and we can check on that if you
13 don't remember which Committees you are on.

14 On Thursday we are going to have an
15 opportunity for public comment at the
16 beginning of the day.

17 And, then, we are going to talk
18 about Managing Fisheries III. Those of you
19 who have been involved in Managing Fisheries I
20 and Managing Fisheries II know a little bit
21 about those meetings. They are national
22 meetings having to do with managing the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 nation's fisheries.

2 The second one was particularly
3 interesting because it was during the workup
4 to the reauthorization of the Magnuson-Stevens
5 Act. And that was a big focus of that
6 meeting.

7 There is a group now who is looking
8 at, partly from the Councils and partly from
9 NMFS staff, looking at Managing Fisheries III,
10 when it might be, what it might be focused on.

11 And Eric, in fact, was instrumental in
12 putting this on the agenda because he believes
13 that MAFAC has a role to play in planning and
14 maybe implementation for Managing Fisheries
15 III. So, I look forward to that discussion.

16 I think you will still be here for
17 that, won't you?

18 MR. SCHWAAB: Yes.

19 CHAIR McCARTY: Yes, in the morning
20 of Thursday.

21 MR. SCHWAAB: Yes.

22 CHAIR McCARTY: Then, we are going

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to get a seafood safety update with a
2 particular emphasis on Gulf of Mexico and
3 Japan.

4 Then, further on that morning, we
5 are going to hear from Emily Menashes.

6 Are we still going to hear from
7 Emily?

8 MR. SCHWAAB: I am going to give
9 Emily's report.

10 CHAIR McCARTY: You are going to
11 give Emily's thing? Okay. Because I noticed
12 she wasn't here. Okay.

13 This is a newish topic and one that
14 I know several of you have mentioned to me and
15 has been the subject of discussion at the
16 Council Coordination Committee meetings that I
17 have been going to, the last couple of them
18 anyway. It is a very interesting topic. I
19 think it is informational, but we could
20 certainly comment.

21 We are going have the election
22 right before lunch.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 We are going to then talk about new
2 business, old business, and then we are going
3 to have the report-outs from the
4 Subcommittees, and, then, any action that is
5 left over from those Subcommittees, that is
6 being recommended by those Subcommittees, will
7 take place at that time.

8 I am going to see about juggling
9 that end of the day a little bit because I
10 don't see a whole lot of time for focusing on
11 action items, if we need to do that at that
12 time.

13 So, comments and additions or
14 questions are welcome. Yes?

15 MR. CATES: Can you give an update
16 on what you are referring on the election?
17 What is it? Where are we at?

18 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. If you
19 recall at the last meeting, we were going to
20 elect a Chair and we were told that the
21 Charter/rules for MAFAC may not allow a Chair
22 to be elected that was not going to be around

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 for more than a year.

2 And so, I was the Vice Chair, and I
3 became the Chair, I guess because people
4 wanted me to at that point, just to be honest.

5 (Laughter.)

6 MR. CATES: Right.

7 CHAIR McCARTY: And so, anyway,
8 there has now been a ruling that anybody can
9 be elected Chair. You don't have to have your
10 whole MAFAC career ahead of you in order to be
11 elected. So, we are going to elect a Chair.

12 DR. CRABTREE: Everybody's --

13 CHAIR McCARTY: Everybody's
14 eligible, yes. And presumably, we could also
15 elect a Vice Chair at that time.

16 I don't feel like we need a Vice
17 Chair, I thought about it a little bit, having
18 a Vice Chair, during this meeting, but there
19 are some old hands up here who can take over
20 if I have to go to the bathroom all of a
21 sudden. So, hopefully, we can get by without
22 a Vice Chair this time, at least for most of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the meeting.

2 Steve?

3 MR. JONER: Given our last
4 experience, is this likely to go smoothly? Is
5 it we just get a one-shot thing where whoever
6 wants to be Chair raise their hand and we will
7 vote on them or will we have an opportunity
8 for campaigning?

9 (Laughter.)

10 MR. RIZZARDI: I think you need to
11 get started.

12 (Laughter.)

13 CHAIR McCARTY: Well, I will speak
14 to that first. I hope it is not going to take
15 as long as it did last time. I would like to
16 be the Chair for the fall meeting. I would
17 like to be elected Chair. And, then, at the
18 end of this year, my term on MAFAC will be
19 done and I will be termed out. So, I will
20 just say that right now, if that simplifies
21 things for people.

22 MR. JONER: Okay. So, I will be

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 more direct.

2 (Laughter.)

3 Are you interested in being Chair,
4 so we could elect you for six months, I guess?

5 CHAIR McCARTY: For the rest of
6 this year.

7 MR. JONER: And, then, there would
8 be time at the fall meeting to elect the
9 following Chair?

10 CHAIR McCARTY: That's right. And,
11 then, I think it would be -- well, my personal
12 opinion is that would make it real tidy. But
13 I have been acting as Chair since January,
14 when Tom Billy left. So, it would be a year's
15 term, if that was to happen.

16 So, yes, I am interested in doing
17 that. I would like very much to do that. I
18 would like to finish out this year as Chair.
19 Thanks for asking. I appreciate it.

20 Mark, did you have a comment?

21 DR. HOLLIDAY: Yes. We had been
22 asked at the last meeting to develop a process

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to avoid repeating what we had experienced in
2 Annapolis. So, we had devised a way to try to
3 do this within 30 minutes. By the end of the
4 day, we can pass out sort of a lay of the land
5 of how the actual voting process would work.

6 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you.

7 Anybody else on the agenda? Any
8 other comments? Randy?

9 MR. CATES: Regarding the agenda,
10 how it is formulated, we are advising the
11 Secretary of Commerce. Does he or she in that
12 position ever in the past had an opportunity
13 to put something on the agenda?

14 CHAIR McCARTY: You know, Randy, I
15 can't answer that completely. As far as I
16 know, not directly, but I don't know that.
17 You know, the development of this agenda is
18 the only one that I have been involved in so
19 far, and it was working with Eric.
20 Originally, we had several conversations, and
21 Eric, as the representative of the Secretary,
22 certainly had a lot of suggestions.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 MR. SCHWAAB: So, I would say it is
2 more inherent than that, which is that the
3 Secretary's agenda for the agency manifests in
4 the work that we do. And so, the alignment
5 between the work that we do and the topics on
6 the agenda is consistent with the kind of
7 advice the Secretary is looking for.

8 I guess, presumably, the Secretary
9 could say, "There's something I want advice on
10 that the agency is not working on." I guess
11 it would be a little bit surprising if the
12 Secretary had an issue of interest that he
13 hadn't already put on our agenda that he would
14 want independently to put on your agenda.

15 MR. CATES: One of the other
16 things, from my experience regarding the
17 agenda, there are hot-button topics that come
18 up, like the oil spill, for example, was one.
19 And, then, there are other topics that we work
20 on, and it feels like we kind of get there on
21 the subject and, then, it just goes away. I
22 am wondering if it would be worthwhile to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 review some of the past work and see if it
2 pulls out the closet a little bit and complete
3 it.

4 One of those would be NOAA's
5 marketing of U.S.-produced seafood, is a good
6 example. We had a big issue about whether the
7 industry could use a NOAA label, if their
8 label is sustainable. It was vetted out.
9 There was a lot of debate on it. And, then,
10 it just never went anywhere. That is a good
11 example of maybe we should look at some of the
12 past issues.

13 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. You know
14 what might also be helpful, Randy, is at the
15 end of the meeting that might be something
16 that we should do regularly, is take a look at
17 what we have done and maybe suggest items for
18 the agenda for the next meeting.

19 And, also, during this interim
20 period, we tried using Subcommittees more than
21 we have in the past. And Steve's Subcommittee
22 with Bill and others on it did a lot of work

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 in between meetings. I think that is also
2 helpful.

3 Also, Mark has, I believe, begun
4 what, two or three meetings ago, Mark, you
5 began -- I don't know what you would call it
6 exactly. It is kind of a spreadsheet where
7 you keep track of all the issues and the
8 action and stuff.

9 DR. HOLLIDAY: Uh-hum.

10 CHAIR McCARTY: And so, we have
11 that available. I think that is really a
12 helpful tool as well. Because I agree with
13 you, I think it is good to have that
14 continuity.

15 Anyone else? Should we jump into
16 the agenda? We are already behind, but only
17 half an hour.

18 Okay. I think, Mr. Scholl, that
19 you are first up.

20 And where would you like to be?
21 Would you like to sit at the table?

22 MR. SCHOLL: Oh, I will stand.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. And you can
2 introduce yourself.

3 MR. SCHOLL: Good morning.

4 A brief introduction, you heard I
5 am the City Manager for Key West. But before
6 that, I spent 28 years in the United States
7 Navy, and my last duty assignment was here in
8 Key West as the Commander of the Naval Air
9 Station of Key West.

10 So, Ron still works for me. It is
11 a different capacity now.

12 (Laughter.)

13 And Billy had mentioned kindly in
14 his introduction that we have known each other
15 and been friends and working together as
16 colleagues since 2003, when I got here. I
17 think that is really important for Key West
18 because of the nature of the business that we
19 are in down here, and we are literally and
20 figuratively at the end of the road. And we
21 do have to work together to get things done
22 and do the right things.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 So, we have a great group of folks
2 down here, whether it is local government,
3 State government, Federal government, all
4 working together to get things accomplished.

5 But I do want to welcome you all
6 here to paradise, Madam Chairman, and, of
7 course, the MAFAC group. We are really glad
8 you could come down and glad Ron could take
9 care of you as well as he is.

10 Just real quick here, too, all that
11 time in the Navy, you know, they used to say,
12 join the Navy and see the world. And they are
13 not joking when they say three-quarters of the
14 world is water, and I have seen all of it.

15 (Laughter.)

16 I was an aviator and did a lot of
17 deployments on aircraft carriers, but had the
18 great opportunity of being north of the Arctic
19 Circle and sailing down around South America
20 and in the Pacific and in the Atlantic and the
21 Mediterranean and Indian Ocean, and all those
22 wonderful things.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 But it is probably fitting that I
2 am here addressing a Marine Fisheries Advisory
3 Committee today because, when you get to see a
4 lot of the planet and what goes on around the
5 world in the oceans, it is important that we
6 do understand and manage the resources.

7 This is the Island of Key West.
8 Like I say, you are at the end of the road.
9 And right now, we are all the way down at the
10 very end of the road here at Truman
11 Waterfront.

12 This is one of the really great
13 places, and Craig Wanous, who manages this
14 particular facility, was in here earlier. If
15 you all get a chance to meet Craig, he is a
16 great guy.

17 But take a look at this facility
18 while you are here, a really, really amazing
19 educational resource for the community. And
20 if you want to wander around a little farther,
21 for those of you that may be interested in
22 history, the USS Ingham, the Coast Guard

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Cutter Ingham is moored right here. That is a
2 museum ship right out the back here.

3 And, of course, I had the prop
4 brought in today, the Carnival of Imagination
5 out there. We are going to talk about cruise
6 ships a little bit today.

7 Fort Zachary Taylor, which is a
8 State Park right down here, the entrance is
9 almost straight ahead. If you go out the
10 front door and turn right, there is an
11 entrance road that goes down there. A very
12 interesting, old Civil War fort down here.

13 And if you get time and you are
14 adventurous, you can get on the boat or on the
15 plane and go out to Fort Jefferson out at the
16 Dry Tortugas, which is a National Park
17 facility.

18 But this is a wonderful place, and
19 we are out in the middle of the water. We
20 have got the Gulf of Mexico to the north, the
21 Atlantic Ocean to the south, and lots of
22 water-related industry down here, whether it

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 is commercial fishing or recreational fishing
2 or water sports or diving. All those things
3 are very, very important to Key West and our
4 economy.

5 We have a couple of marinas that
6 the City operates, Garrison Bight Marina and
7 the Key West Bight Marina. The majority of
8 the charter fishing fleets that operate out of
9 Key West operate out of them, and you may go
10 by them and you might think that, well,
11 there's not a lot of boats in there. That is
12 why I put the picture of the trailers there.
13 A lot of the local flats fishermen keep their
14 boats on the trailers, and they come to the
15 marinas to launch and take out their charters.

16 It doesn't matter if you are going
17 deep sea fishing, reef fishing, backcountry
18 and flats fishing; it is all done right here,
19 and it is all year around. It is amazing the
20 types of recreational fishing that are
21 available for whatever your fancy. You know,
22 you can bottom fish for dinner, if you like

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the grouper, although not right now, I don't
2 think. Maybe the season has opened up. We
3 did close that part of the year.

4 (Laughter.)

5 But we just had a sailfish
6 tournament. I will talk about that, the World
7 Sailfish Tournament is concluded here in
8 April, a \$255,000 grand prize. That is an
9 amazing organization.

10 It is only the ninth year they have
11 done this tournament down here in Key West,
12 and out of those nine years, they have already
13 exceeded the \$2 million mark in donating to
14 charities, including local charities here in
15 Key West.

16 But it is a great organization, and
17 they get some big-dollar entrants that come
18 down here and some big sponsors, but just part
19 of Key West's draw in bringing in professional
20 sportsmen, amateur sportsmen, and everything
21 else. But that is a huge tournament and one
22 that we like to have down here every year.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 But there's tournaments all year
2 long, tournaments, derbies, whatever. The
3 Dolphin Derby this weekend. If you are
4 affiliated with Naval Air Station, Key West,
5 as am I, I am going to be out fishing all day
6 this weekend, hopefully catch the biggest
7 fish, and win some money, although it won't be
8 \$255,000. It might pay for the gas for the
9 day.

10 But whether you are bonefishing in
11 the flats, or recently lionfish tournaments
12 and derbies, it's a big deal down here. That
13 invasive fish at the bottom is causing some
14 problems, and Billy or some of the other folks
15 might talk about that while you are here.

16 But just, I think it was last
17 weekend or the weekend before, there was a
18 lionfish derby, and they caught, I think, 531
19 lionfish out here. You got to be a little
20 careful with them, though, because they are
21 venomous, but they tell me they are great
22 eating. I haven't eaten one yet, but you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 definitely want to cut those dorsal spines off
2 before you filet them and eat them.

3 If you are not into tournaments,
4 you can just come down here and sit back,
5 relax, and enjoy the environment and fish, if
6 you want to, although tarpon fishing isn't
7 exactly relaxing at times, once you get hooked
8 up. But if you happen to be out here at
9 sunset, you can enjoy it, and hope you catch
10 one of those nice fish.

11 All right. Other things out here
12 in our environment that draw people to Key
13 West: the bugs; the spiny lobster. Way
14 different than the lobsters that most people
15 are aware of from the Northeast and Maine and
16 all that. These lobsters don't have claws,
17 but they are very tasty and they are fun to go
18 catch.

19 And it is important that places
20 like this facility exist and others, and the
21 fishermen get educated, that when we go out
22 there, the habitat for these lobsters are the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 coral reef, and you have got to be real
2 careful when you are out there on the reefs so
3 you don't damage the reef.

4 But bug season down here is from
5 the last two days of July. The sportsmen's
6 season we call it. You will never see more
7 boats in the water in the Florida Keys except
8 during those two days, that last Wednesday and
9 Thursday in July. They come from everywhere.

10 Every marina, every parking lot is filled
11 with trailers, and the people are out there
12 "bugging" for two days, and then the normal
13 season starts the beginning of August. But,
14 really, again, a big draw for a lot of folks.

15 Stone crabs, another great delicacy
16 in the water down here. We had the best season
17 we have ever had just south of my house up in
18 Cudjoe Key, where I live. Myself and the
19 neighbors put our traps out. That is what a
20 stone crab trap looks like. And we still have
21 the claws in the freezer, although the season
22 just ended on the 15th of May.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 But you talk about a great renewal
2 resource. You pull these babies out.
3 Hopefully, they don't grab you when you are
4 getting them out of the trap because those
5 claws are very powerful. But you pop a claw
6 off, the big one, and you toss them back into
7 the water, and they regenerate. They grow
8 them back. So, really a great delicacy. And
9 once you get pinched the first time, you get
10 real good at not letting that happen when you
11 get them out of there.

12 (Laughter.)

13 All right. Some of the details of
14 Key West:

15 We have a couple of City marinas
16 here, again, support the charter fishing
17 fleet. But to have a marina as a government
18 entity down here or even a private entity, you
19 have to have a bay bottom lease with the State
20 of Florida.

21 It is a revenue-sharing agreement
22 that we have that allows us to use that State

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 bay bottom for revenue purposes. And if we
2 provide 90 percent public access, then we get
3 a fairly good discount on what our revenue
4 share is. We give 10 percent of what we
5 collect to the State. If it was less than 90
6 percent public access, then that goes up to 30
7 percent of what we have to pay the State.

8 Both our marinas are Clean-Marina-
9 designated. That is a very important
10 environmental designation for how we operate
11 and maintain the marinas.

12 We do have a mooring field that is
13 permitted that is out here just north of Key
14 West, between Fleming Key and Sigsbee Park,
15 but that is part of our Clean Marina operation
16 as well. We have two pumpout boats that
17 service all, not just that mooring field, but
18 all moored boats out there. In some cases
19 some docks are there that need pumpouts.

20 Public boat ramps are here in Key
21 West, and I mentioned Fort Jefferson out
22 there. We have got their chartered ferry that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 operates daily to get out to Fort Jefferson
2 operations.

3 And the Key West Bight, which is
4 downtown here, which there are some great
5 restaurants over there and some other night
6 spots, like Schooner Wharf Bar and all those
7 other places.

8 But if you get over there, that all
9 actually belongs to the City. It was bought
10 through a bond issue about 20 years ago to fix
11 that blighted area and turn it into something
12 that would be economically viable.

13 It was an old commercial fishing
14 area. There is very little commercial fishing
15 there now, more sportfishing and those types
16 of things. But the upland piece that the City
17 owns has some good tenants that are generating
18 revenue for the City.

19 All right, ferry boats and cruise
20 ships, the people that bring passengers down
21 here, this is a tourist town. The economy is
22 really tourism-based. Our biggest employer

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 happens to be the United States Navy, but
2 absent that, there is very little large
3 numbers of employee employers down here.

4 But tourism is what draws or what
5 services the economy down here, whether it is
6 people driving down here, coming down the
7 overseas highway from 130 miles away in Miami,
8 which everybody knows the quiz, right? What's
9 the closest big city to Key West?

10 CHAIR McCARTY: Miami.

11 MR. SCHOLL: Havana. No, Havana,
12 90 miles south, is the closest big city.

13 But a lot of tourists here arrive
14 through our airport, and a lot of people come
15 on the cruise ships and the ferry boats. The
16 cruise ships, we are right down here right now
17 at the Eco-Discovery Center. This is the Navy
18 pier. We have a license agreement with the
19 Navy that allows us to put commercial cruise
20 ships there on that pier. Pier B, which is
21 over at the Westin Hotel, is the other large
22 cruise ship pier. There is not a ship in the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 photo there, but Mallory Square is the third
2 cruise ship pier that we have. There are also
3 anchorages out here in the harbor that we
4 could anchor cruise ships, and they can ferry
5 passengers back and forth, although that is
6 certainly not the preferred option.

7 But cruise ships are very
8 important, again, to the economy. We get
9 about, I'm sorry, that should be 850,000
10 passengers a year, a typo there.

11 I'm sorry, ferry terminal slot, let
12 me get my slides right. The ferry terminal is
13 downtown here. We have got two ferry routes
14 that run from Fort Myers and Marco Island,
15 about 85,000 passengers a year through the
16 ferry terminal.

17 As you can imagine, with the
18 largest city, as I mentioned, Havana, just
19 south of here, and the constant rumors about
20 potentially normalizing some relations there
21 and creating some open international travel,
22 that could be an important international ferry

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 terminal. And we have got plans at work to
2 upgrade that and support those operations.

3 Cruise ships, major, major impact
4 to the Key West economy. We net \$2 million
5 into our general fund. That is \$2 million of
6 property taxes that is offset that I don't
7 have to put on the millage for the City of Key
8 West. That is a big deal in a town of 25,000
9 people.

10 So, I mentioned the three cruise
11 ships piers. Three hundred and fifty ship
12 visits a year average, plus or minus. When
13 the weather changes, the schedules change and
14 we accommodate that. Have about 850,000
15 scheduled passengers. It usually creeps up a
16 little bit because of schedule changes, but
17 that is about all the town can handle.

18 We have got a physical capacity.
19 There are only so many tourist places you can
20 go and so many barstools you can sit on on any
21 given day. So, we have to sort of manage the
22 number of people in town at any given time.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 The channel-widening proposal that
2 is out there, we have got a main ship channel
3 that runs, basically, seven miles from the
4 reef into the harbor here. That channel at
5 its narrowest point is 300-feet wide. And the
6 ships now are bigger. The Panama Canal is
7 building new locks. They are going to open up
8 in a couple of years.

9 So, the cruise ship industry is
10 taking advantage of that fact and allow the
11 ships to get larger, more efficient, more
12 people, less crew, whatever, but the ships are
13 getting bigger.

14 And on a perfect day in Key West,
15 it is no problem getting in and out of here
16 with a 300-foot wide channel with some of the
17 newer class cruise ships out there. But,
18 unfortunately, we don't have a lot of perfect
19 days. If you get a wind out of the east and a
20 current out of the east, it makes it a little
21 more difficult because the ship has to crab,
22 and a 300-foot-wide channel just doesn't get

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 very wide when you have got a 1,000-foot-long
2 ship, and we worry about scraping the nose and
3 the tail to get in and out of Key West.

4 So, that is the reason why we have
5 done an Army Corps of Engineers reconnaissance
6 study, and we need to do a feasibility study.
7 But, to do that, we have got some hurdles to
8 cross.

9 The estimated cost of the project
10 would be \$35 million to do a portion of this
11 channel, again, not the whole channel. But,
12 obviously, there is federal law that says you
13 can't dredge in a marine sanctuary. Billy
14 Causey will be sure to remind me of that, but,
15 of course, we will have to seek an exception
16 if we are going to go forward. And that could
17 be all part of the feasibility study to do
18 that along with all the environmental
19 compliance work that would be done there.

20 But, again, it is a very, very
21 important piece of the economy in Key West.
22 If Key West can't support those cruise ships,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 there is no other U.S. port-of-call that they
2 can go to. So, all of that revenue that gets
3 generated, millions of dollars, is going to go
4 somewhere else outside the U.S.

5 So, they do all of the
6 reconnaissance study based on economic value.
7 The justification in the reconnaissance study
8 was well over double what they needed. And
9 they are willing to go forward, but I have got
10 a lot of homework to do with a lot of federal
11 officials and others to get it recognized and
12 be able to go forward.

13 This is just a graphic depiction of
14 our channel and the small area where the
15 channel-widening would have to take place, to
16 give you a little reference here, the crab
17 angle of the ship when we get the winds and
18 currents working against it to navigate in and
19 out of Key West.

20 Diving, another big draw to Key
21 West, scuba divers, snorkelers, too. The reef
22 is a fantastic place. If you get the time

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 while you are down here, get on one of the
2 boats, go out there, and take a look. It is
3 fantastic. Obviously, the marine sanctuary
4 and the natural reef are true national
5 treasures.

6 But, recently, we added the second
7 largest artificial reef in the State of
8 Florida, the Vandenberg. We sank it almost
9 two years ago. It will be two years ago on
10 the 27th, I think, of May here. A 520-foot-
11 long ship in 140 feet of water six miles out.

12 The largest artificial reef in
13 Florida is a former Navy aircraft carrier, the
14 USS Oriskany. It is about 20 miles south of
15 Pensacola, up there in the northern Gulf.

16 But these artificial reefs have
17 proved to be quite valuable, not only for
18 recreation, but for the marine environment.

19 And, Billy, we do have
20 documentation of this. But it has been a real
21 boon to the dive industry down here. There
22 are some photographs of it when we sank it.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Obviously, have explosive charges on the hull,
2 and this thing went down in less than two
3 minutes once they blew all the holes in it,
4 but it went down exactly in the spot it was
5 supposed to go down, and it went down exactly
6 like the marine engineers that did the
7 modeling for how it would sink said, once the
8 holes were in it. It was probably the best
9 sinking of an artificial reef that went as
10 planned that has happened in the U.S. One of
11 the big draws was these huge radar antennas
12 they had on this ship, and they are still down
13 there today, that attract the divers and the
14 fish down there.

15 Just some of the preliminary data.
16 This particular document of socioeconomic
17 analysis is going through peer review. You
18 can see, before and after, the annual number
19 of divers went from 22,000 up to 57,000, and
20 from an economic impact down here just in the
21 lower Keys of, basically, double, from \$2.8
22 million to \$5.7 million. That is proving the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 value of having done this artificial reef
2 project.

3 All right, I am getting close to
4 the end here, but for consideration: boating,
5 fishing, diving, anything that has to do with
6 the water down here is very, very, very
7 important to Key West. Tourism is the blood
8 of our economy down here, and we need to
9 continue to be able to have people come down
10 here and enjoy this environment.

11 We need thoughtful, but necessary
12 actions to balance the economy and the
13 environment, no matter what we do. You know,
14 being too conservative or too cautious can
15 devastate the fragile economy.

16 This is a big deal in Key West,
17 Usually, just after midnight or something, but
18 education first, enforcement second. Please
19 put that beer bottle in the trash can. But
20 that works no matter what we are dealing with.
21 And again, this facility is an incredible
22 asset providing education to everybody,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 whether it is locals, whether it is the
2 industry folks, or whether it is visitors, on
3 just how important it is to understand the
4 real fragile elements of our reef and that
5 environment, and how to enjoy them, and do it
6 properly and not cause damage.

7 Whether it is seagrass, which is a
8 big deal around here because of the habitat,
9 or the corals out there, all of us that are
10 divers, we know not to touch the corals. And
11 we know it because we have been educated.

12 Fishing regulations for the
13 multiple dimensions of that whole fisheries
14 environment, whether it is recreational or
15 commercial, or whatever, I know the big deal
16 down here this last year was the ban on
17 grouper fishing starting in January, that
18 portion of the year from winter to early
19 spring.

20 There are people that come to Key
21 West in the winter just to fish for grouper.
22 And they are not happy because, obviously, the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 impression down here is we are trying to
2 protect one or two species of the grouper, but
3 the ban is on all of them. There seems to be,
4 at least from the local perspective, enough of
5 the black groupers and the red groupers that
6 we ought to be able to fish for those and,
7 then, obviously, release the ones that are
8 protected.

9 Port facility sustainment, I
10 briefed that a little bit here. That channel-
11 widening is a huge project. It is going to
12 take 10 to 15 years, if I can get it started
13 into the next step to get it recognized as an
14 Army Corps project and work on that.

15 Offshore drilling, the next three
16 or four Committees. No, the offshore
17 drilling, another really big issue and
18 certainly the exclamation point on that was
19 the Deepwater Horizon issue that caused all
20 sorts of economic problems for the entire Gulf
21 of Mexico.

22 It is amazing, we never detected

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 any of those hydrocarbon products down here in
2 the Florida Keys, but the Florida Keys economy
3 was devastated because of the national news
4 media and what they said. And it took
5 millions of dollars of public relations work
6 to try to convince people to come down, and
7 working with the hoteliers and everybody else,
8 to basically provide a guarantee on the stay
9 and a rebate or a refund if there were any
10 problems from the oil spill. But very, very
11 devastating, I just mentioned that.

12 And, then, also, the next chapter
13 of this may be -- and Billy probably knows a
14 lot more about this -- but the issue with Cuba
15 wanting to do deepwater oil exploration north
16 of their island. You know, the line of
17 demarcation is halfway down here between the
18 Florida Straits. So, 45 miles away, we could
19 have deepwater oil rigs from this very, very
20 fragile environment. And that is not
21 something we really look forward to
22 optimistically at all.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 And, then, climate change, good
2 luck. We are the canary in the coal mine,
3 though, down here. There is very little
4 relief in the terrain down here. The highest
5 point at elevation in the whole Keys is maybe
6 14 or 15 feet.

7 So, we do have the empirical data.
8 In the last hundred years, the sea level has
9 come up about 9 inches or so. That is 9
10 inches vertical. That is a whole lot more
11 horizontal, as you all know.

12 But it is a big issue, and I don't
13 know that, as humans, we are going to be able
14 to do much about it. I don't know that. But
15 we certainly need to recognize it and figure
16 out how to plan for that. But, again, that
17 will be a few Committees down the road
18 probably.

19 But, anyway, I think that's it.
20 Any questions for me?

21 MR. CATES: I have a question.

22 MR. SCHOLL: Yes, sir?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MR. CATES: I was down here 20 years
2 ago, maybe not quite 20 years, actually, on
3 the Navy Marine Mammal Program. The first
4 thing I noticed, Key West is a lot cleaner
5 than it used to be.

6 MR. SCHOLL: Thank you.

7 MR. CATES: You have done a good
8 job.

9 (Laughter.)

10 Can you describe what is the
11 mission, generally, for the Navy down here? I
12 knew what it was when I was here.

13 MR. SCHOLL: Training. The primary
14 mission is training. It is primarily aviation
15 training.

16 This is the largest unencumbered
17 aviation training area in the United States
18 for being able to launch, go out beyond the
19 training range, get your training done, and
20 come back without any interference from
21 commercial air routes or any other air traffic
22 of any kind.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 And the weather is pliable year
2 around. You may get one or two days, two days
3 max in a row, at any one time when you can't
4 fly.

5 So, down here, the Naval Air
6 Station, Key West, the primary folks that come
7 here are from the East Coast Navy bases and
8 Marine Corps bases and Air Forces bases,
9 although we do get a few from the West Coast
10 bases as well.

11 But East Coast, the winter and the
12 spring up in Oceania Naval Air Station,
13 Oceania, which is in Virginia Beach, Virginia,
14 the weather is bad. The type of training they
15 do down here, you have to have 10,000 foot
16 between cloud layers minimum vertical, and it
17 takes three months up there to get done what
18 you could do in a week down here sometimes.

19 So, the training throughput is very
20 important.

21 MR. CATES: And what about, when I
22 was here, it was intelligence in Cuba and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 drugs, drug running.

2 MR. SCHOLL: Well, one of the
3 tenant commands here -- and I am not allowed
4 to officially speak for the Navy; Ron will
5 make me say that (laughter) -- but I can tell
6 you from my own past, the Joint Interagency
7 Task Force South is one of the tenant commands
8 here. They have got about 500 employees,
9 military and civilian. They have a Coast
10 Guard two-star admiral that is the Director
11 there.

12 That is the nation's counter-
13 narcotics and counter-smuggling fusion center.
14 They operate for SOUTHCOM, which is
15 headquartered up in Miami, but they do all of
16 the intelligence work and some operational
17 employment of assets to still work on
18 smuggling of narcotics and, also, smuggling of
19 people. But that is the fusion center and
20 that is here.

21 Yes, sir?

22 MR. O'SHEA: Captain, knowing what

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 I heard when it comes to Miami, what about
2 sewage?

3 MR. SCHOLL: We have got an
4 advanced wastewater treatment plant we have
5 had for over 20 years here in Key West.
6 Monroe County is under a mandate from the
7 State of Florida to upgrade all of their
8 sanitary sewer systems, the advanced
9 wastewater treatment.

10 There are still a lot of septic
11 tanks in the Keys, but the Keys have been
12 working very, very hard. Unfortunately, it is
13 a billion-dollar project, and it has been
14 quite expensive. We have got some money from
15 the State and from the federal government.

16 But Key West has had the wastewater
17 treatment plant here for over 20 years, and it
18 works very well. It has been AWT for quite a
19 long time.

20 MR. O'SHEA: Thanks.

21 MR. SCHOLL: Yes, sir?

22 MR. JONER: I was impressed that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 you are actually sinking vessels, making
2 artificial reefs, because Tom can tell you in
3 California you have got all those oil rigs
4 that are great for productive reefs, but the
5 mentality there is to get them out.

6 MR. DEWEY: That changed --

7 MR. JONER: Oh, did it? What? Did
8 a bunch of people from Florida move there?

9 (Laughter.)

10 MR. SCHOLL: I can tell you, just
11 from my own personal experience, doing an
12 artificial reef project is not an easy thing.
13 It takes a lot of coordination. And Billy was
14 instrumental, certainly, in working with us
15 and getting this project done.

16 It started out as a private group
17 that wanted to do this. It was going to be at
18 no cost to the government, like many of these
19 things start out. But, eventually, we got
20 some grant money from the State of Florida and
21 from Monroe County to be able to support it.

22 But it was a challenging project

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 and a little bit stressful at times for Billy
2 and myself and working on the coordination and
3 ensuring that, No. 1, we were going to do it
4 properly and safely and, then, No. 2, that we
5 were going to properly document and carry
6 through with the reporting requirements, which
7 is easy to say and hard to do.

8 But I did get those numbers from
9 that recent preliminary report. You should
10 have a copy of the preliminary, I think.

11 MR. STOLL: So, obviously, the
12 State was very supportive of it?

13 MR. SCHOLL: Yes, absolutely.
14 Absolutely. The Fish and Wildlife Commission,
15 in fact, Commissioner Barreto was down here
16 when we sank it. That, and Ted, through Fish
17 and Wildlife, gave us some grant money. Then,
18 Monroe County Tourist Development Council gave
19 us some money, too.

20 But it was a very long-time
21 project. We are in court in Virginia with the
22 shipyard over that, too, but that is a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 different story. Sorry.

2 (Laughter.)

3 CHAIR McCARTY: Thanks, Jim. I
4 think we are going to move on.

5 MR. SCHOLL: Yes. Thank you very
6 much.

7 DR. DANA: Can I just say one
8 thing?

9 CHAIR McCARTY: Oh, sure.

10 DR. DANA: As usual, awesome job.
11 Thanks for taking the time to make such a
12 nice, comprehensive overview of your
13 community.

14 There are many people in this room
15 that have never been to Key West, and you
16 probably elevated their excitement. They were
17 excited yesterday.

18 But thank you so much. You are an
19 awesome professional.

20 MR. SCHOLL: I think we have got
21 300 bars and I think we have got 300 churches.
22 So, it all balances out.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 (Laughter.)

2 (Applause.)

3 CHAIR McCARTY: Now we are going to
4 hear from Ed Barham.

5 MR. BARHAM: Hi. My name is Ed
6 Barham. I am the Environmental Director at
7 the Naval Air Station in Key West here.

8 I am going to do my best to get you
9 back on track with your schedule. So, I will
10 go pretty quickly.

11 Again, I want to thank you for
12 giving me the opportunity to speak to you
13 today.

14 As Captain Scholl has already
15 mentioned, we are a training base down here.
16 We are the commuter training facility for
17 naval aviation on the East Coast. We train
18 everyone from beginner pilots all the way up
19 to the top-end pilots.

20 Located in the lower Florida Keys,
21 we are spread out through several annexes here
22 in the lower part of the Keys, and these are

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 some of them.

2 Our crown jewel is our airfield
3 located in Boca Chica Key, which is about
4 eight miles up the road. We are going to talk
5 a little bit more about the airfield in a few
6 minutes.

7 As you can see from this photo
8 here, the airfield is basically surrounded by
9 wetlands and surface waters.

10 And, then, our port facility, which
11 I don't have to really point on the map
12 because you can just look out the window and
13 see it right out here.

14 (Laughter.)

15 That is our Truman Annex. That is
16 our port.

17 Here is just a photo of it with
18 some Navy ships in port. But, again, you can
19 just look out.

20 All right. I want to switch topics
21 now. All military installations that have any
22 type of significant natural resources within

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 their boundaries are required under the Sikes
2 Act to have an Integrated Natural Resources
3 Management Plan [INRMP]. It is basically a
4 planning document that outlines how we are
5 going to manage our natural resources using an
6 ecosystem management approach.

7 The Sikes Act, it also requires
8 that the development of that INRMP, the
9 implementation of that INRMP, and, then, the
10 annual reviews, we are required to coordinate
11 with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service and,
12 also, the state wildlife agency, which in our
13 case is the Florida Fish and Wildlife
14 Conservation Commission.

15 Here NAS at Key West, because of
16 the significant marine resources that we have,
17 we have gone ahead and actually included NOAA
18 as a signatory on our INRMP, our Integrated
19 Natural Resources Management Plan. In our
20 last update of that plan, NOAA, Fish and
21 Wildlife, and the State were all partners in
22 the update of that plan, and, then, they all

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 signed off on that plan.

2 And again, this is just the
3 objectives of the plan, which includes
4 conservation and enhancement of the marine
5 resources that are within our control.

6 Okay. Here is a good example of
7 how the INRMP did help in the conservation of
8 resources. When the *Acropora* coral were
9 listed and, then, in follow-on the critical
10 habitat designation for the species, our INRMP
11 has projects in it and has activities that we
12 are required to follow that minimize any
13 potential impacts to the near-shore habitat
14 from, in this case, upland activities. So, we
15 need to make sure we manage all of our
16 activities to prevent erosion, to prevent
17 turbidity, minimizing impacts, actually, in
18 the surface waters.

19 And through the National Defense
20 Authorization Act, based on the management
21 practices that we were already doing as part
22 of our Integrated Natural Resources Management

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Plan, we were able to request from NOAA
2 exclusion from the near-shore waters around
3 the installation from being designated as
4 critical habitat. NOAA concurred, and we do
5 now have an exclusion. It only goes out like
6 100 yards from our shoreline, but, basically,
7 those areas that are shown here on this map
8 are excluded from the critical habitat
9 designation for those coral species.

10 We also are going to talk about two
11 consultations that we recently completed. We
12 are doing a large-scale restoration of our
13 airfield up in Boca Chica, clearing the clear
14 zones that have been overgrown with mangrove
15 wetlands and other woody vegetation.

16 So, that process was started
17 actually in 2004 when we initiated our
18 Environmental Impact Statement. Through that
19 process, we consulted with NOAA on the
20 smalltooth sawfish, an endangered species. We
21 concluded that consultation with NOAA.

22 Conservation measures that came out

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 of that consultation included minimizing
2 impacts to the open water mangroves, wherever
3 possible, on the airfield and, then, doing a
4 lot of mitigation, which I will show you a
5 slide in a few minutes.

6 But, also, when this species was
7 listed in our last update of our Integrated
8 Natural Resources Management Plan, we went
9 ahead and included projects to start surveying
10 for the smalltooth sawfish. Actually, the
11 University of Florida we contracted with to do
12 these surveys. They were here; I think they
13 are still here today. They are actually out
14 fishing for smalltooth sawfish. We haven't
15 seen any down here. So, this picture is not
16 from down here, but that is their boat and
17 that crew. They haven't documented any
18 sawfish in our mangrove shoreline.

19 We have also consulted with NOAA on
20 Essential Fish Habitat, EFH. Again, using
21 that airfield project as an example, through
22 the consultation process, again, we were able

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to minimize and reduce any impacts to EFH.
2 And again, in this case, mostly mangrove
3 wetlands that are accessible to open water
4 mangroves that are isolated and cut off on the
5 interior of the airfield. So, we were able to
6 impact those, but we minimized the impact of
7 the open water mangroves. And, then, again,
8 we also -- and I will show you in a second --
9 we are doing quite a bit of mitigation.

10 Here is just a photo of what we did
11 in a pilot project. Basically, it appears
12 under the airfield we have got in some cases
13 mangrove trees that are 35-feet tall. There's
14 a couple 100 feet from the runways. That is a
15 very big safety issue, obviously, because, as
16 was mentioned earlier, we don't only train
17 experienced pilots, but we are training new
18 pilots. And we have had issues where pilots
19 have hit the trees.

20 So, what we are doing, basically,
21 is we are converting mangrove wetlands to salt
22 marsh wetlands. This is just a slide showing

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 what we have been doing, what we have to do,
2 and what we have done in this pilot project.

3 It is also a benefit to another
4 endangered species we have, which is the
5 Lowers Key marsh rabbit, a critically-
6 endangered species. The preferred habitat of
7 the rabbit is the salt marsh wetlands. So,
8 here we are converting from one wetland type
9 to another, but it is also benefitting a
10 critically-endangered species.

11 Again, this airfield project is
12 approximately 250 acres of wetland impacts,
13 and our mitigation includes about 900 acres of
14 mitigation, including almost 100 acres of
15 mangrove restoration or creation and a lot of
16 hydrologic improvements in the wetlands around
17 the airfields that are controlled by the Navy.

18 And again, we started the EIS
19 process in 2004, an Environmental Impact
20 Statement. Now we are hoping to get all of
21 our permits, our Corps permits and our State
22 permits, hopefully, within the next couple of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 months and actually begin construction
2 sometime later this year, a long process.

3 Now kind of switching topics, out
4 here on the Mole Pier here, we do have some
5 concerns with corals. Being a Navy base, we
6 have a lot of docks, pilings, seawalls,
7 bulkheads, piers, bridge pilings. These
8 structures have been in place for many years.
9 They don't get that much use. The piers don't
10 get that much use. Coral habitat has been
11 created, and we have got a lot of corals on
12 our structures.

13 The problem is we need to do
14 repairs to the structures or maintenance to
15 the structures. We need permits, and part of
16 the permitting process is mitigation, and we
17 have to address the potential impacts of
18 corals on these structures. And if you have
19 to replace a sheet pile seawall, you are going
20 to have impacts to corals.

21 So, we have a great relationship
22 with the Sanctuary and NOAA and the Army Corps

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 of Engineers and all the agencies. What we
2 want to do is to continue partnering with them
3 to figure out how we can offset the impacts to
4 the species, to the coral, but the issue we
5 have is that the habitat is going to remain.
6 The seawall that is there now will be replaced
7 with a new seawall. So, the habitat will be
8 there, and several years from now it will be
9 full of coral again.

10 So, we understand we need to
11 mitigate and offset the impacts to those
12 corals that are there now, but we shouldn't
13 have to mitigate as if that habitat is being
14 eliminated altogether. And again, we are
15 working at the local level with the agencies
16 to address that.

17 Again, it is a perfect example
18 right out here. We need to repair a section
19 of the Mole Pier, the sheet pile wall that is
20 falling in. It is that blue section right up
21 there. We have surveyed. We have done a
22 survey of the wall, that 400-foot section, and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 the Sanctuary has actually been out there and
2 dove it. There's hundreds of coral along the
3 wall. This is a photo of coral.

4 So, where we are right now is we
5 are meeting with the resource agencies and the
6 permitting agencies and trying to figure out
7 what do we need to do as a team to address the
8 impact, but, also, allow the Navy to complete
9 its mission, which in this case is repairing
10 this critically-important structure.

11 I did want to also mention we also
12 have two marinas on the installation. Both of
13 them have also been designated as Clean
14 Marinas. Boca Chica Marina was the first
15 federal facility in the State of Florida to be
16 designated a Clean Marina.

17 Any questions?

18 CHAIR McCARTY: I have a question.
19 There is a place over there that you can't go
20 there, you can't touch the ground. There is a
21 sign that says it's contaminated. What is
22 that?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 MR. BARHAM: Okay. Well, being a
2 military base and having been here for many,
3 many years, there have been past practices.
4 There have been open landfills where they
5 basically just dumped trash on the ground.
6 There have been pesticide-mixing areas.

7 So, they are contaminated sites
8 that the Navy has identified. On all the
9 sites on our base we have identified them all.
10 We have cleaned up most of them to a point
11 where there is no longer any type of
12 restriction. We have removed all the
13 contaminants.

14 Some of the sites still have
15 contaminants in the ground. We have either
16 removed the surface contaminants, so it is
17 safe to walk on, or we are doing some type of
18 monitoring to make sure the contaminants are
19 not spreading.

20 But in those types of sites where
21 we haven't fully cleaned it up, we have what
22 we call land use restrictions. We basically

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 fence them off or put signs up, just to make
2 people aware that there is a contaminated area
3 there. We did get a lot of digging in that
4 area. So, that is probably what it is.

5 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. Thank you.

6 Go ahead.

7 MR. CATES: Can you give me an idea
8 of what is the added time and cost to your
9 project where you can't do your repair?

10 MR. BARHAM: Well, excellent
11 question. We have done, for example, and
12 Captain Scholl mentioned it, we did the
13 initial maintenance dredging of the channel
14 several years ago. That project, the price
15 probably doubled. We are talking on the
16 order, I think it ended up being like \$80
17 million. And it was due to the mongering of
18 the corals and the environmental permit
19 conditions that were placed on us.

20 So, the seawall repair, again, I
21 don't know, we are talking hundreds of
22 thousands of dollars in additional costs

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 probably to address the coral issue.

2 On this big airfield restoration
3 project, again, in that case we are not only
4 dealing with the marine species, but, like I
5 mentioned, we have a rabbit, an endangered
6 species out there that we can't impact. And
7 that is one of the reasons why we are
8 converting from one wetlands to another. We
9 weren't allowed to, like most airports,
10 basically build it into a field. We have to
11 keep it wetlands for the rabbits. So, it is
12 very significant cost to address all the
13 environmental issues down here.

14 And as you obviously know, we are
15 surrounded by the big National Marine
16 Sanctuary. We are an area of critical State
17 concern designated by the State of Florida.
18 The waters around here are considered
19 outstanding Florida waters, the State of
20 Florida, a lot of them. And that is why it
21 takes 10 years to get through the process of
22 planning and permitting.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 DR. CHATWIN: So, were there any
2 mitigation projects done for exempting the
3 critical habitat?

4 MR. BARHAM: I mean there is no
5 mitigation required. Again, what the INRMP
6 includes now, what it requires us to follow is
7 basically best management practices for the
8 activities we would have on the uplands that
9 could potentially impact the surface water.

10 So, again, like I said, it goes
11 above and beyond with regard to turbidity
12 controls, sediment/erosion types of controls,
13 minimizing -- really, the good thing with the
14 situation we are in is most of the mangrove
15 habitat, which is the habitat for the sawfish,
16 is in areas where we have no intentions to do
17 anything. So, it is really just protecting
18 those areas.

19 All of those areas are restricted
20 access, both to boaters and the public. And
21 most of those areas are posted, and it is in
22 The Federal Register on the chart. So, it is

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 really that those areas should be left pretty
2 much alone, no impacts, other than what the
3 Navy might do on the upper peninsula where we
4 are controlling.

5 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you.

6 MR. BARHAM: Thank you.

7 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you so much.
8 That was interesting.

9 We are going to move to Billy
10 Causey.

11 MR. CAUSEY: Good morning again and
12 welcome to Key West and the Florida Keys.

13 I revised my presentation yesterday
14 after going on the boat. And now, after
15 hearing Jim and Ed, I feel like I need to
16 revise it again.

17 As you can see, there has been a
18 lot of projects where we have worked together
19 over the years. But, you know, Jim's
20 presentation really set the groundwork for
21 what I want to cover.

22 And that is just talk about the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Keys and the impacts that we have from various
2 uses, and what we have done to address those
3 uses over the years.

4 Let's see here. There we go. All
5 right.

6 Just a little bit about the
7 Sanctuary programs. We have 13 National
8 Marine Sanctuaries and one National Marine
9 Monument. I am going to be specifically
10 talking about this area, predominantly the
11 Florida Keys.

12 I don't know how many of you know
13 about the Sanctuaries, but we are authorized
14 under the National Marine Sanctuaries Act, and
15 both the Magnuson-Stevens Act and other acts
16 in NOAA.

17 We are a multiple-use program. A
18 lot of people don't understand what
19 Sanctuaries are, and they hear the term and
20 they react. Particularly here in south
21 Florida in Spanish, it translates very
22 prohibitively. And so, when people hear the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 word "sanctuary", they wonder what that means.

2 We are a multiple-use program. We
3 protect special areas. But we also have a lot
4 of uses that go on.

5 We have three Sanctuaries in this
6 region, the Flower Garden Banks 100 miles due
7 south of Texas and Louisiana border; Gray's
8 Reef, a sedimentary rock reef just off of the
9 coast of Georgia, Savannah, that area, and,
10 then, I am going to be talking from now on
11 about the Florida Keys.

12 The Florida Keys Sanctuary is 2900
13 square nautical miles in size. You cannot put
14 your foot in the water without being in a part
15 of the Sanctuary anywhere in the Florida Keys.
16 And it runs 220 miles from off of Miami down
17 around Tortugas, all the way back up to
18 Everglades National Park.

19 This was the first Sanctuary to be
20 congressionally-designated. It was the first
21 Sanctuary to totally surround a community. It
22 was the first Sanctuary to have the majority

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of its waters in State waters.

2 It also had a lot of other firsts
3 that came with it, but we also manage this
4 Sanctuary through a co-trustee agreement with
5 the State of Florida. We have all of the
6 habitats, all of the essential habitats that
7 make up the coral reef ecosystem, from the
8 mangroves out to the outer coral reefs. We
9 have all the critters, all the habitats that
10 are critically important to coral reefs.

11 And I will point out now, and I
12 will say it again, our coral reefs here in the
13 Florida Keys are the most threatened coral
14 reefs in the world. But we are also the most
15 diverse coral reefs in the Caribbean, the
16 wider Caribbean, and we also have the greatest
17 amount of use. And that is what I wanted to
18 stress.

19 Jim set the stage for this. We get
20 over 4 million visitors a year that spend 14
21 million visitor days. In other words, one
22 visitor might spend five days.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 The environment and the economy are
2 inextricably linked here in the Keys, in
3 particular.

4 Key Largo claims to be the dive
5 capital of the world, and I think they may be.
6 There are some sites up there that are dived
7 more than any other site around.

8 Islamorada claims to be the
9 sportfishing capital of the world, and I think
10 they probably are.

11 Key West has it all, and Key West
12 has all these activities going on. And as Jim
13 very well pointed out, it is all happening in
14 a very small area with a great deal of
15 interest.

16 Tourism is our No. 1 industry in
17 the Keys. The tourists spend about \$1.2
18 billion, and that is before the economic
19 multipliers kick in. So, this is hugely
20 important to the area.

21 And people have heard me say this.

22 I get up to go to work in the morning to keep

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 these people in business. Now that is a
2 little different than most other programs.
3 But we are so aligned with recreational users
4 that we want to make sure that these
5 activities continue on into the future.

6 We have over 60 dive shops, over
7 30-plus bait and tackle stores. The numbers
8 go on and on.

9 Scuba diving/snorkeling is the No.
10 1 interest here in the Keys. It might be
11 falling behind with some of the other
12 activities that are going on.

13 Recreational fishing is No. 2 of
14 interest of tourists coming down here.

15 But now we have people coming down
16 for a lot more activities. We are seeing more
17 of the diversity of ecotourism going on. We
18 are seeing dolphins -- when I moved here,
19 there were no dolphin encounter operations,
20 and then there was about half a dozen. Now
21 there's well over two dozen operators just
22 right here out of the Keys alone, Key West

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 alone.

2 Parasailing. Some days I can count
3 nine of these in the air out of my office
4 window upstairs.

5 Personal watercraft. They would
6 probably put a bronze statue of me over here
7 at Mallory Square, some of the locals, if we
8 got rid of the personal watercraft.

9 (Laughter.)

10 If we banned jet skis, everyone
11 would be happy.

12 (Laughter.)

13 But there are 36 operations here in
14 the Keys. So, how do you deal with those? I
15 have never been on one. The people who get up
16 in the morning just hate those things.

17 (Laughter.)

18 Cruise ships. Now Jim's numbers, I
19 heard the numbers had gone down, but when I
20 moved here, there were zero landings in 1973.

21 About 20 years ago, there were still very,
22 very few, maybe one periodically. In 2005, we

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 had 525 cruise ship landings. So, the numbers
2 have been going up as far as cruise ship
3 activities.

4 The No. 2 most important industry
5 in the Keys is commercial fishing. And our
6 fishermen will land between \$50 and \$70
7 million worth of seafood products every year.

8 The Keys are threatened by a number
9 of different things. I could spend a couple
10 of days on each one of these, and I'm not
11 because I don't have time.

12 (Laughter.)

13 The Sanctuary was designed by an
14 act of Congress in 1990. And in that Act,
15 Congress did three things that were very wise
16 right off. They created an area to be avoided
17 for ships greater than 50 meters in length.
18 They prohibited oil and gas exploration. They
19 directed EPA to work with the State and NOAA
20 to develop a protection program.

21 But most importantly is that they
22 directed NOAA to develop a comprehensive

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 management plan to manage these resources.
2 So, we started working right away.

3 You have heard a lot of the use of
4 the term Coastal and Marine Spatial Planning.

5 I know you are going to be discussing some of
6 that, and that is why I changed my talk
7 yesterday. From here on, it is all new.

8 Because I felt that I needed to
9 talk about what we have done. We inherited
10 some things that were common sense. No oil
11 and gas development. And these are all tools
12 that could be considered to be CMSP tools.

13 We had particularly sensitive sea
14 areas. We have marine zoning, and we have a
15 Sanctuary-wide no discharge zone now.

16 People in the Keys are very fearful
17 of oil drilling. People in Florida, the west
18 coast, are fearful because it is a household
19 word now, "Loop Current." Everyone knows of
20 Loop Current now.

21 During the Deepwater Horizon,
22 during the hurricanes, every waterfront, every

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 dive captain, every charter captain all become
2 meteorologists, and they all predict the
3 hurricanes.

4 (Laughter.)

5 During Deepwater Horizon, they all
6 became oceanographers.

7 (Laughter.)

8 And they were all predicting what
9 was going to happen. And we all know that we
10 are vulnerable.

11 Leading up to the designation of
12 the Florida Keys Sanctuary, on the heels of
13 the Exxon-Valdez, we had three major ship
14 groundings in 17 days. And that moved
15 Congress. Our local Congressional
16 Representative Dante Fascell and Senator
17 Graham even worked with George Miller from
18 California to do something about that.

19 So, they designated an area to be
20 avoided that keeps the ships greater than 50
21 meters about six miles off our reef track.
22 There are quarters where they can still come

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 into Key West. They can still return here and
2 head up towards Tampa and that area or go
3 around the Tortugas. But these yellow lines
4 that you see there is the area to be avoided.

5 Just to show you that coastal and
6 marine spatial planning, these sorts of
7 things, these tools work. Leading up to the
8 designation of the Sanctuary, we had a major
9 grounding about every year. We have gone 21
10 years now since we have had a major one. We
11 have only had two in a 21-year period, and
12 those were right at the very beginning.

13 So, now we are seeing huge success,
14 no major ship groundings. We still have
15 vessel groundings.

16 One of the things on the last
17 grounding is that we worked with the Propeller
18 Club locally and some others and got with the
19 Coast Guard, and we purchased some RACON
20 beacons, put those out on the reef track, and
21 those send up a signal that really helped
22 those ships identify what was going on.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 It's a Particularly Sensitive Sea
2 Area, which gives it international clout. The
3 International Maritime Organization, although
4 they approve the areas we avoid, they also go
5 through -- the Keys were the fourth
6 Particularly Sensitive Sea Area designated.

7 In the Act, Congress directed NOAA
8 to consider temporal and geographic zoning in
9 managing the resources. So, all those
10 activities that Jim talked about, all those
11 activities that I pointed out, how do you go
12 about reducing the threats from those?

13 I could give you two- or three-day
14 workshops on each one of these, but we are
15 just going to talk about this one right here.
16 And that is marine zoning.

17 This is the way you divide in the
18 management plan. I am not going to read it to
19 you, but it really is a common-sense thing.
20 It is looking at the interests, the commercial
21 and recreational interests, and how do you
22 break up those uses? How do you bring some

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 common sense about how it is going along?

2 We have five different types of
3 zone types in the Sanctuary, and I will
4 quickly go through those. Three of those five
5 result in no-take, no fishing activity, but
6 they have different purposes and they are
7 designed for different uses.

8 The Sanctuary Preservation Areas,
9 there are 18 Sanctuary Preservation Areas
10 currently, four research-only areas, two
11 ecological reserves. This one, the wildlife
12 management areas has turned out to be one of
13 our stealth tools. It is really effective.

14 The no-take, Sanctuary Preservation
15 Areas restrict all fishing activities.
16 Trappers can't set their traps. Divers can't
17 even touch the coral. You can't spearfish.
18 You can't take anything.

19 There used to be conflicts on these
20 shallow areas, and these are the areas that
21 are most densely used by recreational divers
22 during most of the year, except the first two

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 weeks of lobster season. And so, by setting
2 aside areas that range from a half square mile
3 up to two square miles has reduced a lot of
4 user conflicts.

5 It is the top of the reefs. It is
6 areas where we have put the mooring buoys.
7 Eighty-five percent of the snorkelers and
8 divers go to those areas throughout most of
9 the year. And it is where most of our
10 protected and threatened species, such as the
11 elkhorn coral, are currently located, although
12 there are some areas where they are not.

13 Snorkeling/diving is totally
14 allowed in these areas; whereas, any kind of
15 fishing activities, which is a conflict --
16 even fishermen just get hooked up on the
17 bottom and they are not really good places to
18 fish. But since the morning grouper are
19 there, they tend to attract fishermen.

20 The four research-only areas were
21 set aside for research purposes only. And
22 that is so we could compare what is going on

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 in the dive areas versus the areas where we
2 have no diving going on whatsoever. Only
3 permitted entry is allowed in those.

4 We have two ecological reserves.
5 We implemented one in 1997 when we originally
6 implemented our plan. And these are set aside
7 to protect a larger range of habitats or to
8 protect areas that are critical to the entire
9 ecosystem. They are not just for fishery
10 purposes, but this really drags us into
11 working with fisheries, each one of these no-
12 take areas, because each of those requires a
13 level of consultation both with the State and
14 federal fishery managers.

15 These areas encompass a larger
16 range of habitats, spawning areas, important
17 areas, and these are what people very often
18 think of when you think of marine reserves,
19 fully protected areas for fishery purposes.

20 The Western Sambo Ecological
21 Reserve was the first that we implemented. I
22 can tell you wonderful stories about the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 immediate success there. More lobster, bigger
2 lobster, banner-sized lobster, a lot more
3 fish. Great things have happened from that.

4 We came back after 1997, after we
5 implemented our original management plan, with
6 a promise to do something within two years in
7 the Tortugas Region. And we worked with all
8 the fisheries managers through our Sanctuary
9 Advisory Council, went through a lengthy --
10 well, it wasn't so bad -- about two and a half
11 years of spatial meetings, and so on.

12 But we had the fishermen onboard
13 with us, working with us at that time. We had
14 all the fisheries managers involved.

15 And by the way, I will say it right
16 here. From where we are standing at this
17 point, within 10 miles there are three
18 jurisdictions. There's the South Atlantic
19 jurisdiction, there's the State of Florida,
20 Fish and Water Conservation jurisdiction, as
21 well as the Gulf jurisdiction.

22 I won't go through the details. I

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 will just point out that we ended up with a
2 world-class ecological reserve, Tortugas
3 North, Tortugas South. We worked with seven
4 jurisdictions out there.

5 And I will say Julie was leading
6 the State of Florida. Thank you so much. She
7 was the Chair of the State of Florida Fish and
8 Wildlife Conservation Commission.

9 But, of the jurisdictions, four of
10 them had veto capability and could have
11 stopped that process. So, we got through it,
12 and now we have a world-class ecological
13 reserve that anything spawning in the Tortugas
14 area, the larvae get sent up the Keys. We are
15 having record banner years on mutton snapper
16 fishing.

17 There is a fish spawning
18 conservation site out here for many species,
19 mutton snapper in particular. Previously, the
20 numbers got down to just dozens of individual
21 fish were being counted each year. The
22 assessments counted thousands of fish spawning

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 this year. So, the numbers are coming back.

2 And what is really great is
3 fishermen are starting to take credit for this
4 up the Keys. And, you know, when they are
5 taking credit, that helps.

6 (Laughter.)

7 Wildlife management areas, I
8 mentioned this one. These are areas that we
9 worked with Fish and Wildlife Service to set
10 up these areas. We started off with 19. Our
11 Advisory Council liked them so much, they
12 added more. They are primarily no-access
13 areas, no-motorized areas. They are tiny in
14 size. If you look at these little purple
15 dots, they are not huge, but most of the flats
16 where the bonefishermen go are now no-
17 motorized zones.

18 And so, by working with Fish and
19 Wildlife Service, by establishing a few of
20 these areas, we have had a lot of requests for
21 more of those because people can still go out
22 and fish. The bonefishermen can be out there

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 fishing, but the jet skis have to stay out.
2 So, we have separated those two uses that used
3 to be a conflict.

4 This guy could be paying \$500 to be
5 out there, and one of these come by, and I
6 used to get these calls that I cannot repeat
7 what they were like.

8 (Laughter.)

9 But I would hear things like, "If I
10 had had a gun, I would have shot them." And I
11 could imagine both of them would be shooting
12 at each other. It was just a huge conflict
13 that, once we marked them, we started getting
14 reports that they were working, to the point
15 that a reporter, a writer came down with
16 saltwater fly fishermen, and he came down to
17 do a negative article and actually came back
18 with an article that points out that no-
19 motorized zones revived Keys fishing.

20 The existing management areas, this
21 is sort of a no-brainer, but you have to state
22 it because we overlap two existing

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Sanctuaries, four Wildlife Refuges, six State
2 Parks. We don't usurp anyone else's
3 jurisdiction, but we use our jurisdiction to
4 complement what we have out there.

5 So, this is what we ended up with
6 in the way of different overlapping
7 jurisdictions. The green areas are Wildlife
8 Refuges, and I won't go through each and every
9 one. But we do work together.

10 Just as the Magnuson Act and the
11 Sanctuaries Act can be very complementary when
12 we apply them together, we do that same thing
13 with Pennekamp Park and some of the other
14 areas.

15 This was our last zone, just
16 recently designated. The entire Keys are a
17 No-Discharge Zone. It is a problem. A lot of
18 these little boats out here -- this photograph
19 was taken right out here, by the way.

20 And I don't know if you can see it,
21 but that is water right through there.

22 (Laughter.)

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 And so, enforcement is our next
2 issue to deal with on this issue. But we have
3 just implemented it, and we are going to start
4 seeking compliance. We are going to use
5 education and outreach. But we will work with
6 the Coast Guard and FWC and other authorities.

7 Do these things work? People ask
8 me. They say it sounds confusing, all these
9 no-take areas, all these zones. This was the
10 first lobster season after we implemented our
11 zone, and that is one of our buoys. That's a
12 buoy and that's a buoy. And these boats are
13 fishing right along that line, all the way
14 around it.

15 We have enforcement. We do
16 enforcement in the Tortugas Reserve, up and
17 down the Keys. I wish we had more time.

18 Thank you.

19 CHAIR McCARTY: Any questions?

20 MR. DEWEY: Billy, we talked a
21 little bit about the No-Discharge Zone
22 yesterday. But one of the thoughts that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 crossed my mind, the boats, and so on, I think
2 you can deal with, the pump-out boats, and so
3 on. But these flats boats that are going out,
4 these day boats that are going out, how are
5 they going to deal with that? What are
6 they doing?

7 MR. CAUSEY: I think there are ways
8 they can get back to shore.

9 MR. DEWEY: Really?

10 (Laughter.)

11 MR. CAUSEY: We don't mean to be
12 flippant, but you don't have all those
13 facilities onboard.

14 The issue of its being close to the
15 mooring fields and things like that, the
16 boats, that is a huge problem.

17 DR. CRABTREE: What has happened
18 with your commercial fisheries over the last
19 20 years? It seems that there is a major
20 shift to recreational. Are they displaced or
21 do you still have commercial fishing?

22 MR. CAUSEY: I am doing this with

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 some of my commercial fishing colleagues here
2 in the room. I will let them respond. I will
3 say we have seen the commercial fisheries
4 become more professional, and we have seen
5 them move towards a diversity of individual
6 fishermen doing more different things in some
7 instances. But definitely I have seen fewer
8 fishermen in all the fisheries, but with a
9 greater level of professionalism about what
10 they are doing.

11 Is that fair?

12 CHAIR McCARTY: We are going to let
13 Tony speak. Tony, if you would like to
14 comment on that?

15 MR. IAROCCI: Boy, Billy, this
16 brings back memories.

17 Billy started at the beginning with
18 a definition of a Sanctuary. I can remember
19 back when I was a hard-core fisherman and had
20 just moved down here from New England because
21 of the cold and the regulations, and there was
22 no Sanctuary, no net ban, no traffic

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 separation program.

2 We started the Sanctuary. Once it
3 came out, a lot of the fishermen, especially
4 the Hispanics who did not understand the
5 concept of a Sanctuary, were saying no to
6 NOAA.

7 Billy can remember the battles when
8 we first did this. It was a long battle, but
9 we were very well-represented. It took time.

10 The fishermen were very respected at the
11 meetings. Their input was put in, especially
12 into the Tortugas and part of the closed
13 areas, because we knew where the habitats
14 were. We knew the bottom. We had key
15 representatives on the Sanctuary Advisory
16 Council, the Working Group on Tortugas.

17 And Billy was a lot of the key to
18 that. He bent over backwards to try to make
19 this thing work. You have to have somebody in
20 the lead, and he took the heat. They burned
21 him in effigy and a lot of things were said
22 back then.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 But this industry has
2 professionalized. We have seen this Sanctuary
3 to date, it has only helped industry. Some of
4 the closed areas, like Billy stated, there are
5 some great areas, spawning closures, great
6 habitat.

7 We are working closely right now
8 with them on impacts to coral, going on with
9 coral right now, with our trap fish leaders'
10 meetings. I think Billy and Roy both will be
11 meeting with industry tomorrow, dealing with
12 these issues.

13 It has brought us a long way. And
14 only by working together did this happen. And
15 it was a long, hard road, Billy, when we used
16 to hoot and holler and argue with one another
17 and deal with this. But today --

18 MR. CAUSEY: I didn't hoot and
19 holler.

20 (Laughter.)

21 MR. IAROCCI: No, but I did. We
22 all did.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 But, really, it has brought
2 everybody together here. I think today still
3 with the Sanctuary Advisory Council, things
4 are moving forward.

5 CHAIR McCARTY: Thanks, Tony.

6 If people want to talk to Tony in
7 the break, that would be great, too.

8 Any more questions?

9 MR. JONER: So, you mentioned that
10 this was established with a co-trustee
11 relationship with the State. Is that in
12 place?

13 MR. CAUSEY: Yes. It is a very
14 important part of the success.

15 MR. JONER: So, if you can briefly,
16 describe how that functions.

17 MR. CAUSEY: Well, it is 100
18 percent NOAA funding that comes into the
19 Sanctuary. Most of the folks that were on the
20 boat yesterday, we don't talk about it, but
21 most of them work for the State of Florida,
22 Department of Environmental Protection.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 So, our staff in the whole Florida
2 Keys Sanctuary is made up of about a third
3 federal staff, about a third DEP, and about a
4 third Fish and Wildlife Conservation
5 Commission.

6 In order to establish this
7 Sanctuary, the State of Florida was concerned
8 because there was a huge uproar down here. In
9 1996, there was a non-binding referendum to
10 have a vote on whether or not the Sanctuary
11 would be supported locally.

12 We lost that. The Sanctuary lost
13 that by 53 to 47 percent. We thought we were
14 going to win it. But I won't go into the
15 details. It was a very bad period for us.

16 We went to the State of Florida,
17 and they had heard all of the rumors coming
18 out of the Keys. And they said, hey, that's a
19 mandate coming from the Florida Keys; we will
20 take 53 percent or 47.

21 And we started working with them,
22 and they put an agreement together that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 spelled out the things that the people were
2 most concerned about locally. Those items in
3 that co-trustee agreement mean that we have to
4 go back to the Governor and the Cabinet, which
5 is an elected body, to get their approval for
6 certain things, like should we start user
7 fees. I just can't wake up some morning and
8 decide to do user fees in the Florida Keys.
9 We would have to go back to the Governor and
10 the Cabinet, as the trustees over submerged
11 sovereign lands.

12 So, it has worked out really good.
13 Hawaii did the same thing. Our Governors,
14 Governors Chiles and the Governor of Hawaii,
15 were talking at the same time, and we did
16 something very similar in Hawaii, as well as
17 at Thunder Bay National Marine Sanctuary.
18 They are all a little different, but the co-
19 trustee agreement worked.

20 MR. CLAMPITT: So, is there any
21 commercial fishing allowed at all in the
22 Sanctuaries?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MR. CAUSEY: Oh, yes, throughout,
2 everywhere except 6 percent of the Sanctuary
3 that is closed to any kind of fishing, there
4 is commercial fishing.

5 MR. CLAMPITT: And so, the next
6 thing, was there a switch in gear type? Like,
7 was certain gear types eliminated from the
8 Sanctuary?

9 MR. CAUSEY: There had already been
10 gear types, and I didn't go through the whole
11 history, but the Pennekamp Park and the Key
12 Largo Sanctuaries early on, beginning in 1960,
13 had already prohibited spearfishing, tropical
14 fish collecting, trawling, dredging, and the
15 setting of traps in certain areas, and the
16 setting of marine fish traps. Those gear
17 types were inherited at Looe Key when it
18 became a Sanctuary in 1981.

19 We kept some of those in place for
20 those sites as we moved into the 90s and if
21 you notice, the dates I just gave you even
22 preceded some of the Councils and some of the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 fisheries management activities. So, we
2 already had a precedent set in the Keys for
3 doing a lot of things that affected fishing.
4 Anything that we do now that would affect
5 fishing, anything, we go back to the Gulf
6 Council or to the South Atlantic Council or to
7 the State of Florida and go through the
8 consultation process.

9 And at the end of it, we hope that
10 we -- and we have been very successful in
11 lining up our interests to achieve greater
12 protection/conservation. But you heard what I
13 presented as far as keeping people in
14 business, and that means commercial fishermen,
15 professional fishermen.

16 MR. CLAMPITT: Thanks.

17 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you, Billy.
18 Thank you to everyone.

19 I think we are going to take a
20 short break before we take Roy. We will take
21 10 minutes and then come back.

22 And thank you to all three of the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 presenters. It was great.

2 (Applause.)

3 (Whereupon, the foregoing matter
4 went off the record at 10:26 a.m. and went
5 back on the record at 10:38 a.m.)

6 CHAIR McCARTY: While we are
7 getting back in our seats, the sound man has
8 asked us to please sign in. People who have
9 not yet signed in, there is a sign-in sheet up
10 here.

11 Do we need members to sign in?
12 Just the guests? Okay.

13 So, if you haven't signed in,
14 please do so.

15 And Mark has an announcement as
16 well.

17 DR. HOLLIDAY: Right. Just to your
18 last point, Heather, there is a court
19 reporter. So, for the new members, we are
20 recording the entire meeting and we produce a
21 transcript and post that. It is part of the
22 public disclosure requirements for our

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Committee. So, this is why we have the sound
2 person and the court reporter, to help us get
3 the notes of the meeting.

4 Just a bit of housekeeping with
5 respect to the food and beverages. Heidi is
6 collecting money from everybody. If you are
7 here just for the day and you are helping
8 yourself to the coffee, please do so. We ask
9 you to kick in, I think Heidi said \$5, to help
10 defray the cost, if you are just here as a
11 guest for the day and sharing in the food and
12 drink.

13 So, with that, back to you.

14 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. Thanks.

15 We are going to hear from Roy
16 Crabtree.

17 Where did he go? Oh, there he is.

18 DR. CRABTREE: Here I am.

19 CHAIR McCARTY: Are you ready, Roy?

20 DR. CRABTREE: Yes.

21 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay.

22 DR. CRABTREE: Good morning.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 And I don't have a PowerPoint
2 presentation, but I am going to talk some
3 about some of the issues down here in the
4 Florida Keys.

5 But let me start by saying that
6 grouper is open and it opened on May 1.

7 (Laughter.)

8 And I think it has been one of the
9 most least-popular regulations that we have
10 had, mostly right here in Key West. And what
11 it is, is that a South Atlantic Council
12 regulation was put in place, and it closed
13 shallow-water grouper during January,
14 February, March, and April. And that is
15 because we have about eight species of
16 shallow-water grouper that we manage, but they
17 all spawn during that winter/early spring
18 timeframe.

19 And most of them form aggregations
20 where they spawn. And so, they are really
21 susceptible to be fished down. So, the
22 Council felt like it wasn't a good practice to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 fish on spawning aggregations of fish and that
2 we ought to leave them alone for that time
3 period.

4 Unfortunately, that also coincides
5 with a big tourist season down here in the
6 Keys. But, as Billy mentioned, the Keys are a
7 complicated place from a fishery perspective
8 because we have so many jurisdictional
9 boundaries. In fact, if you drove down U.S. 1
10 into the Keys, you were driving on the
11 boundary line between the Gulf and South
12 Atlantic Council. So, if you catch it on the
13 ocean side of the highway, you are in the
14 South Atlantic, and the other side you are in
15 the Gulf.

16 And, then, superimposed on that you
17 have Florida State waters. And interestingly,
18 Florida State waters have a three-mile
19 jurisdiction on the South Atlantic side and
20 nine-mile State water jurisdiction on the Gulf
21 side. And the Council boundary follows that
22 break where it shifts from nine miles to three

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 miles.

2 So, the fishermen down here have a
3 lot of challenges because, depending on which
4 side of the line they are fishing on, they
5 have different permitting requirements. And
6 try as we might to get consistent regulations,
7 we have a lot of inconsistent regulations from
8 the two Councils. And so, they have to comply
9 with a lot of different factors.

10 We have some catch-share programs,
11 some IFQ programs in place for grouper and red
12 snapper in the Gulf, but not in the South
13 Atlantic. We have VMS requirements in the
14 Gulf, but not in the South Atlantic.

15 So, it is a confusing set of
16 boundaries down there that fishermen do have
17 to deal with. I am very sympathetic to some
18 of those concerns, but the solutions to them
19 are not easily done.

20 I got an email a few minutes ago
21 from a fisherman about red snapper. Billy
22 said something about mutton snapper. Well, I

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 got an email this morning that red snapper are
2 invading the Keys and driving the mutton
3 snapper off their aggregation sites.

4 So, part of what we are seeing in
5 the Gulf and the South Atlantic are successful
6 rebuilding plans, and probably red snapper is
7 the most notable one. We think we ended
8 overfishing a couple of years ago with red
9 snapper in the Gulf of Mexico. And after
10 going through several years of very painful
11 reductions in the total allowable catch, we
12 are now in a position where we are increasing
13 the total allowable catch every year. And I
14 think the vast majority of people who fish for
15 red snapper in the Gulf will tell you that the
16 fishing is probably the best they have ever
17 seen.

18 We closed down red snapper in the
19 South Atlantic more than a year ago, and we
20 are already hearing similar statements in the
21 South Atlantic about how good the fishing is.

22 And so, what happens with that is

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 you see these species start expanding their
2 range. And red snapper in the Gulf of Mexico
3 used to come all the way down to the Tortugas
4 area in the Keys because the fishery in the
5 Gulf has been around for 150 years or more.
6 But when the stock collapsed, it collapsed up
7 into the northern Gulf portion of the range,
8 and red snapper largely disappeared off the
9 Florida peninsula, which is a huge area of
10 shallow water. And it is the area where most
11 of the grouper fishermen make their living.

12 Well, red snapper have re-occupied
13 that area, and they are pretty much down to
14 the Keys now. And they are very abundant in
15 many areas.

16 But what we have seen is rebuilding
17 stocks and having their ranges expand, it is a
18 good thing, but it creates a whole set of new
19 problems that you have to deal with in terms
20 of managing these fisheries. I think it
21 probably also has any number of ecosystem and
22 species interactions that things are going to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 change because one species is now much more
2 abundant than it used to be. And we don't
3 really understand what those are. But it
4 creates a lot of new situations for fishermen
5 that can be difficult.

6 I think in the fisheries
7 perspective here in the Southeast all three of
8 our Councils, and the Southeast Region is the
9 Gulf of Mexico Fisheries Management Council,
10 the South Atlantic Council, and also the
11 Caribbean Council, which is Puerto Rico and
12 the U.S. Virgin Islands.

13 And I think our biggest struggle
14 over the last couple of years in terms of
15 ending overfishing has been implementing the
16 new requirement for annual catch limits. We
17 are still working with that.

18 And probably our biggest challenge
19 has been the number of data poor stocks that
20 we have now. We have stock assessments for
21 only a very small number of our fisheries in
22 the Southeast, and they are generally our

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 biggest fisheries. But we have large numbers
2 of reef fish snapper/grouper species that are
3 under management and have never been assessed,
4 but, nonetheless, we are still required to put
5 in place annual catch limits in all those
6 fisheries. And that has led to a lot of back-
7 and-forth with the scientists trying to figure
8 out what those catch limits would be. And we
9 are still working through that.

10 We have also had a number of
11 difficult regulations and closures and
12 restrictions that have gone in place in the
13 last couple of years. I mentioned red
14 snapper, but we have had big issues with
15 grouper, both in the South Atlantic and in the
16 Gulf.

17 Gag grouper is the No. 2 species in
18 terms of landings in the Gulf of Mexico, and
19 it is the No. 1 species sought by recreational
20 fishermen in the Gulf. And that has been
21 closed since January of this year, and we will
22 have a two-month recreational season later

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 this summer.

2 We are putting in place a
3 rebuilding plan and we are hopeful that we are
4 going to have a little bit longer recreational
5 season next year, but the Council has got to
6 make some decisions about when that
7 recreational season should take place.

8 We have also had issues in the Gulf
9 of Mexico with red grouper over the last few
10 years. We have just had an assessment for one
11 of the deepwater grouper species. In the
12 South Atlantic, red grouper, we had a new
13 assessment. It is overfished. We are putting
14 in place a rebuilding plan for red grouper.
15 And we have had some issues with gag
16 undergoing overfishing in the South Atlantic
17 as well.

18 So, probably those grouper and red
19 snapper issues have been the most difficult
20 ones we are faced with. But we have closures
21 in place with black seabass in the South
22 Atlantic now, which is also in a rebuilding

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 plan. And that fishery closed, I think, back
2 in late January of this year and will re-open
3 on June the 1st.

4 So, it is a difficult time for
5 fishermen, particularly charter boat fishermen
6 who in some cases literally have very little
7 that they can go fishing for in terms of
8 bottom fisheries.

9 On the other hand, in the 15-20
10 years I have been involved with fisheries
11 management, I don't remember seeing so many
12 emails from fishermen complaining to me about
13 there are so many fish out there. "How can
14 you keep doing this? I have never seen this
15 many fish." And I am getting those kinds of
16 emails on a lot of different species.

17 So, what we are doing is working.
18 I am not sure that we are implementing it in
19 ways that are economically as beneficial for
20 fishermen as they ought to be. And I think we
21 have a lot to figure out about how the charter
22 boat fishery is going to deal with recovering

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 stocks, because in some cases we are seeing in
2 the Gulf with red snapper that the taps are
3 going up, the fishing is getting much better,
4 but the season is not getting any longer
5 because the fish are bigger; the catch rates
6 are much higher, and the trips just coalesce
7 into a very short season. And they catch all
8 of the annual catch limits that are available
9 to them.

10 And so, I think we are going to
11 have to work through some of these issues and
12 figure out how to better adapt to improved
13 fishing in recovering fisheries.

14 So, that is probably the biggest
15 challenge that we are dealing with here in the
16 Southeast.

17 I am sure everyone has heard about
18 at many meetings now the oil spill in the Gulf
19 of Mexico, the implications from that. We did
20 re-open all the waters in the Gulf of Mexico
21 early this year after extensive seafood safety
22 testing and sampling programs were in place.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 So, those areas are open and fishermen are
2 back out on the water.

3 We are hearing reports, and there
4 have been some reports in the media, about
5 lesions on fish, particularly with red
6 snapper. We are watching that closely. We
7 are working with a number of universities as
8 well as our own Science Center in terms of
9 putting out some sampling programs in order to
10 get a better feel for what the incidence of
11 this type of thing is and where it is
12 distributed. So, I think we are going to know
13 a lot more about that very quickly.

14 Lesions on fish in the Gulf of
15 Mexico isn't a new thing. It has always been
16 there. And all of the state labs in the Gulf
17 every year have fish brought in to them that
18 have lesions and things.

19 What we don't know is the
20 prevalence of this any greater now than it was
21 prior to the oil spill, or are people just
22 more sensitive and looking harder for these

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 types of things?

2 And so, I think we have got some
3 things to learn with that, but I think we are
4 getting the programs in place. In fact, we
5 had a group from the University of South
6 Alabama going out to do some intensive
7 sampling off the coast of Alabama, which is an
8 area that was one of the areas most affected
9 by the oil spill and was closed for a great
10 amount of time. And they are going to be out
11 doing quite a bit of sampling this year or
12 this week.

13 We have a lot of ESA issues in the
14 Southeast. Sea turtles, we still are dealing
15 with assessing the impacts of the oil spill on
16 sea turtles. We have had issues with
17 strandings of Kemp Ridleys in the
18 Mississippi/Louisiana area. There are a lot
19 of Kemp Ridley turtles in that area. We are
20 not sure what exactly is going on causing
21 those strandings, but we continue to watch
22 that and we are getting ready to or we are

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 working on a new biological opinion on sea
2 turtles and interactions in the shrimp fishery
3 that we are going to try to get done sometime
4 this year, and we may be looking at some
5 additional regulations in some parts of the
6 shrimp fishery.

7 We have a large number of listing
8 petitions that have been filed with us from
9 various environmental groups in the aftermath
10 of the oil spill. They range from things like
11 bluefin tuna to a Louisiana topminnow, and we
12 have one for the dwarf seahorse. We have been
13 petitioned to list several species in grouper.

14 Interestingly, we were petitioned
15 to list the goliath grouper, which is probably
16 one of our biggest success stories in
17 management that we have had over the years.
18 And I think most fishermen down here in the
19 Keys and in the Gulf of Mexico will tell you
20 there are more of the goliath grouper out
21 there than there has been in 20-25 years or
22 so.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 But, nonetheless, we are going
2 through reviews of large number listing. And
3 one of the most notably ones for down near the
4 Keys is we have a fishing petition to list 82
5 different species of corals. I think about
6 nine of them occur in the Caribbean, and the
7 rest are Indo-Pacific corals.

8 We already have two species of
9 corals, two species of acropora that are
10 listed as threatened here in the Florida Keys.

11 Billy talked about that. They are shallow-
12 water corals. They are in the Sanctuary. A
13 lot of the Sanctuary is designated as critical
14 habitat for those two corals.

15 And a lot of the back-country area,
16 Florida Bay in the Keys has been designated as
17 critical habitat for smalltooth sawfish, which
18 is another species down here.

19 So, we have a lot of issues, a lot
20 of consultations with those. We work as close
21 as we can with the Navy, with Billy's folks,
22 trying to deal with the consultations and all

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of this.

2 One of the other issues in the
3 Southeast is the broader, not a south Florida
4 so much, but we are working with the FERC,
5 which is the federal agency that relicenses
6 dams and power companies and things. We have
7 a lot of dams in the Southeast. Most of the
8 major river systems in South Carolina and
9 North Carolina, Georgia, have multiple dams on
10 them, and many of them are coming up for
11 relicensing.

12 We have endangered species, most
13 notably, shortnose sturgeon that are affected
14 by the dams. Shortnose sturgeon forage in the
15 lower reaches of the rivers and, then, they
16 move up into rockier, shallow areas which can
17 be hundreds of miles inland and most of the
18 areas that they need to spawn in.

19 And I would say probably most of
20 their former spawning habitat is no longer
21 accessible to them because they can't get them
22 out of the dams. So, we are working with

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 power companies to try and achieve fish
2 passage and move the sturgeon around these
3 dams. And that is proving to be a pretty
4 challenging thing because sturgeon are big and
5 they are difficult to build fish passages.
6 You are essentially building a small river
7 that goes around the dam to try to bring the
8 sturgeons up on it. We have a number of
9 projects that we are working on to look at
10 that.

11 I believe earlier there was some
12 discussion of the Panama Canal widening that
13 is going on and larger ships coming through
14 and some dredging projects here. What is
15 happening are many ports are wanting to deepen
16 their harbors to take advantage of the larger
17 vessels that are coming through the Panama
18 Canal down the road.

19 So, there are a number of port
20 expansion projects that are underway. The one
21 that is most developed and furthest along in
22 the Southeast is in the Savannah

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 River/Savannah Harbor expansion project, where
2 they are looking at deepening the harbor by
3 four to five feet.

4 But I know Governor Scott has
5 talked about the Port of Miami. He has
6 expressed interest in deepening the harbor.
7 So, I think it is going to be one of those
8 things where all of the major ports are going
9 to want to look at those.

10 And all of those have impacts,
11 particularly on sturgeon, but also on the
12 other species that we are managing. So, we
13 have to work with those groups to do
14 biological opinions to make sure that those
15 aren't having excessive impacts on endangered
16 species.

17 And the other big part of those is
18 when you put fish passage around a dam, you
19 have to have enough water going through the
20 fish passage because it is the water flow that
21 draws the fish up into those areas. So, with
22 power companies, you get into issues about how

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 much water goes to the turbines and how much
2 goes to the fish passage. That results in a
3 lot of dollars sometimes. So, there are
4 challenging issues.

5 So, that is a summary of kind of
6 some of the bigger-picture issues that are
7 going on down here in the Southeast.

8 And just to tell you a little bit,
9 because Billy put up a bunch of pictures about
10 the back-country fishing back in the old days.

11 I am a former Florida Keys fishing guide
12 myself and a former member of the Florida Keys
13 Fishing Guides Association. I was the
14 secretary of that bunch for a couple of years.

15 But that was before Billy and the
16 Sanctuaries came down. I fished down here out
17 of Islamorada, which Billy rightfully put up
18 as the sportfishing capital of the world. And
19 I was down here in the early eighties and did
20 that. I think I moved out of the Keys in 1987
21 or something like that, a few years before the
22 Sanctuary things really got started on the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Keys.

2 But it is a unique place, huge
3 diversity, fishing going on. It has held up,
4 I think, remarkably well over the years, when
5 you look at the amount of pressure that goes
6 on down here.

7 But I don't think I have ever been
8 anywhere that had the range of the types of
9 fishing ranging from largemouth bass in the
10 Everglades, red fish and speckled trout back
11 in Florida Bay, bonefish, tarpon, and, then,
12 all of the blue-water and reef fish species
13 that we have. So, it really is a remarkable
14 place, and I hope we can continue to maintain
15 the fishing down here.

16 And we will keep working on the
17 grouper ban to see if we can achieve some
18 accommodations.

19 (Laughter.)

20 You know, I sometimes think really
21 what we need in Florida is to identify some of
22 these south Florida fisheries that are really

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 just here, because right now we have got part
2 of it managed by one Council, part managed by
3 the other Council. Some of them are managed
4 by joint plans, but some of them aren't.

5 And one thing I have learned about
6 Councils, they hate joint plans. And it is
7 funny how the two Councils, they just don't
8 want to have to deal with each other. But for
9 a lot of these fisheries, I think the only way
10 to work out some of these interjurisdictional
11 issues is to have more joint management of
12 some of these fisheries and working with the
13 State of Florida.

14 Because, really, our success in
15 managing recreational fisheries in federal
16 waters is just linked at the hip with what the
17 Florida Fish and Wildlife Commission does.
18 Because particularly in the Gulf with nine-
19 mile jurisdiction in State waters, if we put
20 regulations in place in recreational fisheries
21 in federal waters, bag limit reductions,
22 closed season, unless we can get Florida to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 hang with us and put the same regulations in
2 place, we are going to have a huge enforcement
3 issue and just huge problems working with
4 that.

5 So, we work very closely with the
6 Fish and Wildlife Commission on a lot of
7 really difficult issues. We are going to
8 continue to do that because we have got to all
9 stay together on these things or it really
10 just starts coming unglued, which is not good
11 for the resource or the fishermen.

12 But I would be happy to try to
13 answer any questions that you might have.

14 CHAIR McCARTY: Thanks, Roy. I am
15 so glad you were able to come and talk to us.

16 DR. CRABTREE: Glad to be here.

17 CHAIR McCARTY: Can you talk a
18 little bit more about the stock assessment
19 issue? You said that there were a number of
20 species that didn't get stock assessments? Or
21 is it surveys or what is it exactly?

22 DR. CRABTREE: We have a lot of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 species under management because we have with
2 reef fish a very diverse group of fisheries.
3 A lot of the species support very small
4 fisheries.

5 You know, you come in the
6 Southeast, and a big fishery down here is 4 to
7 5 million pounds; whereas, I guess in Alaska
8 they would catch that in an afternoon maybe.

9 (Laughter.)

10 So, we have a large number of
11 fisheries, but they are all relatively small.

12 And we have limited capacity to produce stock
13 assessments. So, that means we are going to
14 get three or four assessments a year in the
15 South Atlantic and a few more in the Gulf. We
16 have yet to really do a conclusive stock
17 assessment on much of anything in the
18 Caribbean.

19 So, that leaves us with, for
20 example, in the South Atlantic we have 72
21 species, I think, of snapper/grouper under
22 management and probably have only assessed six

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 or seven of them.

2 One of the biggest problems that we
3 have in our stock assessments is there's very
4 little fishery independent survey data. So,
5 for a number of species, the whole assessment
6 is based on landings and information that
7 comes from the fisheries. And we may have a
8 good number of ages or we may not, but we
9 don't have any data that is independent of the
10 fisheries.

11 So, to take that information and
12 produce a stock assessment from it, you have
13 to make assumptions about the vulnerability at
14 age of the fish to the fishery. Those can
15 become quite contentious sometimes, and they
16 can have significant impacts on the outcome of
17 the assessment.

18 So, we have made some improvements
19 of expanding some of the surveys in the South
20 Atlantic and in the Gulf, but, obviously,
21 everybody is concerned with the budget issues
22 we are facing about our being able to continue

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 those out into the future.

2 We have also hired a number of new
3 assessment folks at the Science Center to help
4 produce more assessments. But, realistically,
5 with the number of species we have in
6 management, we are never going to assess all
7 of them because they are just such small
8 fisheries. But, hopefully, we are going to
9 produce more assessments.

10 And the other problem we have had
11 is we have gone five to six years between
12 assessments in many cases, and that is really
13 too long, particularly in fish that are in
14 rebuilding plans to go, because a whole lot
15 can change in that course of time.

16 And that has led to a lot of
17 friction and some of the disconnects between
18 what fishermen are seeing in the water and the
19 assessments because they will see a big pulse
20 in recruitment, they will see a lot more fish,
21 but because the assessment is years old now,
22 we don't have any science that supports that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 and we don't have the fishery-independent
2 survey we can point out and say, oh, yes, we
3 are picking up those, too. And so, that
4 creates problems for us.

5 CHAIR McCARTY: So, you tend to
6 manage more cautiously because of those
7 issues?

8 DR. CRABTREE: The theory is that
9 that is what you should do. We have probably
10 done that with varying degrees of success.

11 I think, for example, the grouper
12 ban that was brought up earlier, not very
13 popular, but that was, in part, an attempt by
14 the Council to manage cautiously because we
15 don't have assessments for the rest of those
16 grouper species, and we don't really know what
17 their status is.

18 But it is difficult. It sounds
19 good to talk about, in the face of
20 uncertainty, being more precautionary, but,
21 then, when you have got to actually put that
22 in your practice, it is very difficult.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. Thanks.

2 MR. FISHER: I have an offering for
3 a solution to a conflict between management
4 councils and trying to do joint management.
5 The Keys are certainly a very unique
6 environment, and the stocks that inhabit the
7 Keys are often local just to the Keys area.
8 Why not create a Keys Management Council?

9 DR. CRABTREE: Well, that would
10 take action by Congress to do that. So, if
11 they do that, then that is what we will do.

12 But I think it would be hard to
13 figure out exactly where the boundaries are.
14 And, then, we have got a lot of fisheries
15 that, yes, they are in the Keys, but they are
16 also north and south of here. But, you know,
17 we have had any number of discussions about
18 potentially changing the jurisdictional
19 boundary between the Councils and those kinds
20 of things, but they are all very complicated
21 and probably would require Congress to take
22 action over it to do it.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Yes?

2 MR. DEWEY: Roy, there is at least
3 a few of us on the MAFAC here that are
4 interested in aquaculture, and you didn't
5 specifically address that in your comments. I
6 wonder if you could maybe touch on that and,
7 then, some of the work that the Aquaculture
8 Coordinator does.

9 DR. CRABTREE: Well, we have an
10 aquaculture policy that I am sure you are
11 aware NOAA put out for comments.

12 Eric, are we still in the comment
13 period?

14 MR. SCHWAAB: No, the comment
15 period is closed. We are very close, I think,
16 to releasing the final.

17 DR. CRABTREE: And, then, the Gulf
18 Council did produce an Aquaculture Fishery
19 Management Plan a while back. That plan has
20 gone into effect. The regulations are still
21 under review, being looked at. And I think
22 there have been concerns to make sure that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 things are consistent with the Aquaculture
2 Policy.

3 And, really, shortly after the Gulf
4 Council approved the Aquaculture Plan, the
5 economy took a nosedive and, then, the oil
6 spill happened, and things just got pulled off
7 of that. But those things are in play, and I
8 expect that we may see some activity there.

9 Most of the interest in aquaculture
10 in the Southeast has been in the Gulf of
11 Mexico. There has been some interest in
12 Puerto Rico, I think, in territorial waters
13 down there. But a lot of it has been really
14 affected by the economy and, of course, the
15 oil spill.

16 MR. CATES: I'm confused. Isn't it
17 the Gulf Council passed the aquaculture plan,
18 but NOAA stepped in and said we have got to
19 create the best management practices, so to
20 speak, and so it is on hold until NOAA comes
21 up with the guidelines?

22 MR. SCHWAAB: Do you want me to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 speak to that?

2 DR. CRABTREE: Sure.

3 MR. SCHWAAB: So, essentially,
4 right, the plan took effect and, then, we
5 would take rulemaking action. The agency held
6 off on taking rulemaking action pending
7 completion of the policy, so that whatever
8 rulemaking action we take can be consistent
9 nationally.

10 And so, the expectation is that,
11 upon release of the policy, we would evaluate,
12 then, the Gulf actions against the policy, and
13 assuming we find it consistent, proceed with
14 the rulemaking process.

15 MR. CATES: So, the economy didn't
16 stop that. It is getting all the pieces in
17 play?

18 DR. CRABTREE: Well, I think the
19 economy affected interest in doing aquaculture
20 in the Gulf, but I don't think the economy
21 affected the pace of the rulemaking, if that
22 is what you are getting at. That was more the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 administration shifted. The Council approved
2 the plan, I think, shortly after the election.

3 CHAIR McCARTY: Ed?

4 MR. EBISUI: Yes, thank you.

5 I would like to bounce back to
6 Heather's question about stock assessments.
7 And specifically with respect to I guess it is
8 the Warsaw grouper and the speckled hind, you
9 know, with the congressional mandates for ACLs
10 and the other acronyms, obviously, you need
11 the science in order to develop those values.

12 I also understand, I mean I hear, you know,
13 what Eric said about the budgetary climate and
14 fiscal constraints at this time, but what kind
15 of priority has the Service given to a good
16 assessment, a current assessment on these two
17 fish?

18 And the reason I ask is that,
19 although I am in Hawaii, I have actually had a
20 lot of communication from people on the
21 Atlantic Coast telling me about 17(b).

22 And it's like, what? They did

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 what?

2 (Laughter.)

3 DR. CRABTREE: Yes. Well, so the
4 assessment priorities are done by the
5 Councils. Our assessment process is called
6 SEDAR. It stands for Southeastern Data,
7 Assessment, and Review.

8 MR. EBISUI: Yes.

9 DR. CRABTREE: And there is a
10 Steering Committee that is made up of the
11 Chairman of the Council and the Executive
12 Directors. Vince is on it and Larry Simpson.

13 And we negotiate, essentially, the
14 assessment priorities. Speckled hind and
15 Warsaw have been on the list to do assessments
16 on, but they probably got bumped back by some
17 of the concerns about red snapper in the South
18 Atlantic and the desire to do a new benchmark
19 assessment on red snapper. So, they are still
20 in the mix, and I don't remember exactly when
21 those are going to happen.

22 So, what the regulations in

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Amendment 17(b) he was referring to, that was
2 the amendment, then, for the South Atlantic
3 Council that put in the annual catch limits
4 for stocks undergoing overfishing. We had ABC
5 recommendations from the SSC of zero for
6 speckled hind and Warsaw grouper, and we had a
7 recommendation from them that we needed to do
8 more to reduce bycatch because these are
9 grouper that live in relatively deep water.
10 And probably most of them that are caught and
11 released aren't going to survive.

12 So, the Council put in place a
13 closure at depths greater than 240 feet for
14 Warsaw grouper, speckled hind, snowy grouper,
15 blueline tile, silk snapper, queen snapper,
16 and I think yellowedge grouper, most of which
17 had relatively-low landings in the Gulf.
18 Snowy grouper has a trip limit of 100 pounds.
19 So, no one has really targeted them anyway.

20 Well, what it turns out is there
21 was a fishery developing in North Carolina for
22 blueline tile which is affected by this. And

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 so, we have had a lot of concerns from North
2 Carolina fishermen that in the area they want
3 to fish, which is north of Cape Hatteras, that
4 they don't have bycatch of speckled hind and
5 Warsaw grouper up there. And so, they ought
6 to be able to go out and fish for blueline
7 tilefish.

8 And so, we have had various
9 requests for emergency rules and those types
10 of things. The Council is working on a
11 framework of action to look at modifications
12 to that closure. We are working with the
13 Division of Marine Fisheries in North Carolina
14 on a possible exempted fishing permit to allow
15 some vessels with observers to go into that
16 area and fish and see if they do have bycatch
17 of speckled hind and Warsaw grouper.

18 And all that is going to be on the
19 agenda at the South Atlantic Council meeting,
20 which will be here in Key West I think the
21 second week in June. We are having the Gulf
22 Council meet here in Key West the first week

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of June, and, then, the next week the South
2 Atlantic Council is going to meet.

3 So, I am aware of the concerns
4 about that. There are also some concerns here
5 in the Florida Keys about that provision with
6 deepwater grouper. Mostly, I think, these
7 guys want to go out and fish and be able to
8 bring some snowy grouper in.

9 And so, the Council is trying to
10 juggle how to let people fish for one species
11 of deepwater grouper without having
12 unacceptable levels of bycatch for the
13 remaining ones that you can't really discard.

14 It has been a difficult challenge.

15 My concern about the assessment, my
16 fear is what will happen is, when we do an
17 assessment for Warsaw and speckled hind, there
18 simply won't be enough information on it.
19 They have never been common in the catches at
20 all. There's no fishery-independent survey
21 data that is going to be of much use to us.
22 And I think those will be very uncertain

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 assessments at best when they are done.

2 MR. EBISUI: Actually, very
3 briefly, I am sure you know about this, but we
4 have very recently, this year, finished up a
5 stock assessment in Hawaii for our deepwater
6 snappers. And the assessment was done, I
7 believe, in about 75 fathoms, which is like
8 450 feet.

9 What they did is they combined
10 bottom cameras with scanners overlaid with
11 cooperative research. In other words, they
12 would set the cameras. They would scan, and
13 the fishermen would immediately go in and
14 fish.

15 The upshot of that study was that
16 there is a lot more, the stock is in a lot
17 better shape than previously thought. And
18 parts of that, were, of course, dependent on
19 landings data, our stock assessments.

20 DR. CRABTREE: Well, I will check
21 into that.

22 MR. EBISUI: Yes. I mean it caused

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 our total allowable catch to go up
2 significantly.

3 DR. CRABTREE: Right.

4 MR. EBISUI: I mean really
5 significantly. And it was really good because
6 it followed the heels of us losing the
7 northwestern Hawaiian Islands to monument
8 status and total exclusion of fishing.

9 DR. CRABTREE: Well, I am hoping we
10 can finagle something like that into a general
11 fishing permit.

12 MR. EBISUI: Thank you.

13 CHAIR McCARTY: We are going to
14 have one more question, and, then, we have to
15 move.

16 Go ahead, Martin.

17 MR. FISHER: Thank you.

18 There is deepening concern among
19 the stakeholders that are involved about the
20 lasting effects of the Deepwater Horizon
21 event. And I was wondering if NOAA or SERO,
22 the Southeast Region, had a battle plan ready

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to go on how to deal with -- let's just, God
2 forbid, say that it actually is true that 75
3 percent of the oil is on the bottom or in
4 underwater plumes, and will have a negative
5 effect on marine resources.

6 If that occurs, do you guys have a
7 plan to deal with the commerce aspect, the
8 food safety aspect? Do you guys have a
9 protocol ready to go or are you just waiting
10 to see what happens?

11 DR. CRABTREE: Well, we have had
12 protocols to deal with the food safety aspect,
13 and all that has shown that the seafood is
14 safe. What we don't know yet are what the
15 long-term impacts may be on recruitment and
16 reproduction and those kinds of things.

17 I am told, but don't have numbers
18 on it, that we had a very large crop of shrimp
19 in Louisiana/Mississippi right now.
20 Unfortunately, we have got the largest flood
21 in history coming down the Mississippi River,
22 which may change some of that.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 We have expanded the fishery
2 surveys that we are doing in the Gulf using
3 supplemental funding that came out of it.
4 Every time I have had the opportunity, I
5 brought up the need for fishery-independent
6 surveys as part of this whole response.

7 Is someone from John Hankinson's --
8 is John here?

9 CHAIR McCARTY: Yes. Not yet, but
10 they are going to be attending this afternoon.

11 DR. CRABTREE: Well, I talked to
12 John about that as well, who is kind of
13 coordinating a lot of the funding on it.

14 What happened when the spill
15 occurred, we got a lot of questions about,
16 okay, what is the impact on red snapper, on
17 this fishery? Can you do a stock assessment
18 and tell us?

19 And the answer was, no, we don't
20 know, and, no, we can't do a stock assessment
21 because our assessments are largely driven by
22 data from the fishery, and the fishery is

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 closed.

2 So, I think the key to better stock
3 assessments, and the key to being able to
4 judge what the impacts of natural disasters,
5 to things like the oil spill -- and we had
6 similar questions when Hurricane Katrina
7 happened -- but the key to all of that, to be
8 able to judge what the impact on the stocks
9 is, is to have systematic fishery surveys that
10 take place year after year after year, so that
11 you can actually see.

12 Without that -- and this is the
13 situation we are in -- I think, unless we see
14 very dramatic declines in the stock, we may
15 not be able to detect it with the assessments
16 because of the range of uncertainty that we
17 have.

18 So, you know, the key to better
19 stock assessments down here is fishery-
20 independent surveys. We are working on that
21 now, and I hope the funding will remain there.

22 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 DR. CRABTREE: Thank you.

2 CHAIR McCARTY: We need to move on.

3 Thank you. Thank you, Roy.

4 (Applause.)

5 So, we are about, I don't know, an
6 hour late so far on the agenda. But I think
7 we have time at maybe the end of the day. So,
8 I am not horrendously worried yet.

9 As we said earlier, we are not
10 going to do the Gulf Ecosystem Restoration
11 Task Force now. We are going to go to Mark.

12 I believe, Mark, you are going to
13 start off with the National Ocean Policy
14 implementation section.

15 Eric had to step out for a call,
16 but he will be back, he said.

17 So, Mark is going to start off.

18 And we also have Ned with us, I
19 believe.

20 MR. FARQUHAR: That's right.

21 DR. HOLLIDAY: Ned has been on the
22 road for 24 hours. He got in at 1:30 this

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 morning, and is bright-eyed and bushy-tailed.

2 He is our featured speaker this afternoon,
3 but I wanted to introduce him to everybody and
4 have him see the presentation.

5 The purpose of my talk, and just a
6 reminder to folks that, as we move into the
7 agenda, we normally produce what is called an
8 annotated agenda. It is a one-page summary of
9 what the discussion topic is all about, what
10 the purpose is, and whether it is information,
11 whether it is a decision.

12 So, if you look, you see the
13 annotated agenda for this discussion was
14 really to try to look at where we have been
15 with the National Ocean Policy since we last
16 met in Annapolis. As you recall, there Sam
17 Rauch presented the origins of the National
18 Ocean Policy, the setup of the National Ocean
19 Council, and the Strategic Objectives and the
20 Strategic Action Plan.

21 What we are trying to do is set up
22 for this afternoon's discussion, we are going

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to be drilling down into a couple of the
2 strategy areas. In particular, ocean energy
3 is going to be one of them. And my talk is
4 really going to just try to set the stage for
5 that and remind you where we have come and,
6 hopefully, answer any questions for the
7 purposes of this afternoon's discussion.

8 So, I want to focus on updating on
9 the National Ocean Policy, the development of
10 the Strategic Action Plan. One of the
11 questions that I want to have you think about
12 is, what is the role of the Committee? What
13 kind of role will the Committee have in
14 looking at these sort of high-level policy
15 issues that are going on at the federal level,
16 interacting with the states and regional
17 governance bodies. And so, when you hear
18 these discussions, keep that question in the
19 back of your mind.

20 We will be talking about setting up
21 discussions for this afternoon about the
22 energy activities. We also, as a result of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 having a discussion with the membership, want
2 to spend some time focusing on climate change,
3 climate adaptation, which is also one of the
4 nine strategies in the National Ocean Policy.

5 So, this presentation is really
6 kind of a setup, and we can probably get
7 through it this morning. And, then, we can
8 get back on track this afternoon after lunch.

9 This is a wiring diagram. It sort
10 of summarizes on one page the structure of the
11 National Ocean Policy and the National Ocean
12 Council. Again, it is the result of an
13 Interagency Working Group that reported out to
14 the President last year.

15 In July, he issued an Executive
16 Order establishing the National Ocean Policy
17 as a strategic initiative in his
18 Administration and set up a structure,
19 membership at NOAA at various levels, from the
20 very high level of the Council itself, the
21 Steering Committees. The Governance
22 Coordinating Committee is a federal advisory

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 committee that was named in the Executive
2 Order to help advise the Ocean Council itself,
3 made up of very specific named representatives
4 from states and people from around the
5 country.

6 We have subcommittees at our
7 agency, subcommittees at both the science
8 level and at the policy level. Eric serves on
9 one of the integrative subcommittees.

10 I would also note that at the
11 National Ocean Council both the Department of
12 Commerce and NOAA have memberships on that.
13 NOAA has a very unique role in trying to be a
14 leader in the ocean. It is part of our reason
15 for being. And so, that was acknowledged in
16 the development of the policy as well as the
17 structure of the Council itself.

18 Recall from Sam's presentation back
19 in our Annapolis meeting, there are nine
20 priority objectives, and they are really
21 divided into two types. There are four issues
22 that talk to principles and process about how

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 we propose to do business, how we are going to
2 manage and govern oceans into the future. And
3 we are going to adopt the principle of
4 ecosystem-based management. We are going to
5 use a tool, coastal and marine spatial
6 planning. We are going to focus on science-
7 based decisionmaking.

8 So, with informed decisions, it is
9 to help us improve the understanding of all
10 the dynamics that are going on in the ocean.
11 And obviously, I guess we would be writing the
12 agency report you have seen. There are
13 literally hundreds of organizations, bureaus,
14 agencies that have some effect on ocean
15 policy, and the coordination and the
16 integration of that is one of the processes
17 that we have to be very effective and
18 efficient at in terms of how we conduct
19 business to ensure the long-term stewardship
20 of responsibilities for our nation's ocean
21 resources.

22 In addition to the process of how

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 we do business, we also had these areas of
2 special emphasis. These were hot issues or
3 current issues that are on the table for
4 public discussion that were things that we
5 needed to bring to the forefront and focus on.

6 So, we have identified the areas
7 you see. The Task Force identified these five
8 areas of special emphasis, the first being
9 resiliency and adaptation to climate change
10 and, in particular, to ocean acidification as
11 an example of that.

12 We will go through these, each in a
13 little more detail on the next slide.

14 Regional ecosystem protection and
15 restoration. In other words, one of the
16 ideas, we are involved in living resources at
17 the species level, but the habitat, the
18 conservation and the restoration of that, and
19 the functioning of those healthy, resilient
20 ecosystems, an area that we need to pay
21 particular attention to.

22 Water quality, for water is the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 source of much concern, and this intersection
2 between land and the oceans, the sustainable
3 practices on land and what they do for our
4 mission and what they do against our mission
5 of trying to be stewards of the living marine
6 resources.

7 In particular, another area of
8 emphasis, is the changing conditions in the
9 Arctic. Again, changing circumstances in
10 terms of access, loss of sea ice, providing an
11 economic driver for people to develop as part
12 of the gas exploration, fishing exploration,
13 transit, marine transportation. These are all
14 issues that are currently at play. We need to
15 be very cognizant of what our choices are in
16 terms of developing our policy to be aware of
17 that in the Arctic.

18 And finally, ocean coasts, the
19 Great Lakes, observations. Again, collecting
20 data, observations, mapping, the
21 infrastructure to get to the science-based
22 policy decisions that we want to incorporate

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 in how we do business.

2 So, that is the overview. If you
3 remember any of the slides, we have got nine
4 priority objectives. For each one of these
5 priority objectives, the Administration has
6 set out to develop a Strategic Action Plan.
7 We will talk about that in the course of the
8 next few minutes. That is one of the
9 opportunity areas that MAFAC maybe will find
10 is an opportunity to participate more directly
11 in this process.

12 I think the next few slides just
13 provide, from these outlines for the Strategic
14 Action Plans, we have copied what the
15 objective is. So, these Action Plans are
16 really the blueprint for the future, where the
17 National Policy is saying we want to take a
18 road for building out our policies, our
19 regulations, our governance, our partnerships.

20 And so, there is a process underway
21 that is going to result in this Strategic
22 Action Plan for each of these nine priority

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 objectives. An objective for the ecosystem-
2 based benefit, as a principle, this will be a
3 foundational part of how we do business in the
4 future, looking at the broader ecosystem
5 perspective, rather than just single species
6 or single assets of it.

7 And just some areas here in the
8 Action Plan: an integrated approach to
9 resource management, not just looking at the
10 biology, not just looking at a single species,
11 but we have different authorities at Fish and
12 Wildlife than NOAA does. And so, the
13 integration of our different activities across
14 this.

15 And it is also integration not only
16 the biological and natural science, but the
17 social sciences, the economy, social,
18 cultural, traditions, other goals,
19 incorporating them into the larger landscape
20 of decisionmaking.

21 The tool that I mentioned earlier,
22 coastal and marine spatial planning, we spent

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 a lot of time talking about this in Annapolis.

2 And way back for those who were on the
3 Committee when we were Monterey, we heard
4 first of coastal and marine spatial planning
5 from Charlie Wahle at that point.

6 Charlie gave a heads-up about what
7 it is all about. We heard it in various
8 presentations this morning. But the objective
9 here is to implement a comprehensive,
10 integrated, based on an ecosystem principle,
11 coastal and marine spatial planning process
12 for the United States. And it is about
13 planning. I mean that is really what it is
14 trying to do. So, it is all about planning.

15 Based on sound science, bringing
16 together different federal partnerships. It
17 is done at a regional level. It is not done
18 out of Washington, D.C., or the Beltway. It
19 is around the country in regional approaches.

20 Again, across federal, state, and
21 local, to provide greater certainty and help
22 reduce some of the conflicts that are out

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 there, whether they are having to do with
2 fisheries management, having to do with marine
3 transportation, having to do with oil and gas
4 development, alternative energy development.
5 People who want to make the best use, the
6 optimal use of the oceans resources, sometimes
7 they are in conflict, sometimes they are
8 complementary. We want to have a strategy
9 that uses this tool to help us make good
10 decisions that are also informed by science
11 and that are looking at the cumulative impacts
12 of these decisions in an integrated fashion,
13 rather than one at a time.

14 For coastal and marine spatial
15 planning, as I said, we are going to be
16 developing regional planning bodies across the
17 country. And NOAA is well-positioned to help
18 do that effort.

19 There will be, again, combinations
20 of federal, state, and local organizations
21 that are going to be working on it. These are
22 NOAA leads for coastal and marine spatial

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 planning across the nine areas, and we can see
2 most of the NMFS people are named and called
3 out. So, these are people who are frontline
4 staff, senior leaders in the National Marine
5 Fishery Service organization that are going to
6 be representing NOAA on these regional
7 planning bodies.

8 So, the point here is there is a
9 good connection. It is not some distant,
10 arms-length effort on the part of NOAA. We
11 are front and center in helping to shape both
12 the content and the process of the regional
13 planning bodies as they get developed over the
14 next year.

15 Another one of the priorities for
16 how we do business is inform decisions, and
17 improve understanding. Again, looking to make
18 science-based decisions, making sure that it
19 is driven by high-quality science, sufficient
20 information, and trying to take advantage of
21 the data that are out there in terms of
22 pulling it together.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 But, also, it is not just the
2 people who are making decisions. It is
3 improving ocean literacy and education and
4 understanding in the general public as well.
5 And these resources, and again, a large part
6 of the mission of the Sanctuary program, a
7 large part of NOAA's mission, is trying to
8 improve people's understanding about how this
9 science informs not only people in grade
10 schools and in K-through-12 curriculum, but
11 people's general knowledge about how important
12 oceans are to their lives.

13 The goods and services, we hear
14 about ecological services that help regulate
15 our weather, help regulate our climate. These
16 are all things that are very important for the
17 general population to know, because things are
18 at risk if we don't do our planning and our
19 policies well. And we can have a higher level
20 of benefits from the ecosystem if we do and
21 take advantage of the science and knowledge
22 that we have got, but it has to be brought

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 together.

2 And part of that bringing it
3 together, again, coordination and support,
4 that is the purpose of this how we do
5 business. And it will include assisting
6 states, providing increased capacities for
7 both people at the state level as well as
8 these things cross international borders. So,
9 partnerships with those north and south of us,
10 and, then, on the international level, many of
11 the questions and concerns about ocean policy
12 go beyond our borders.

13 Yes, Heather?

14 CHAIR McCARTY: Let me interrupt
15 just for a moment.

16 DR. HOLLIDAY: Yes.

17 CHAIR McCARTY: A while ago, two
18 weeks ago, you sent out an email to the MAFAC
19 members that had these Strategic Action Plans
20 detailed. I just wanted to point that out to
21 everyone, in case they were wondering where
22 this material was, because I am not sure it is

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 clickable on the website. I think you have to
2 go to the separate email. So, I just wanted
3 to make sure everybody knew where this
4 material was.

5 DR. HOLLIDAY: Thank you.

6 I will explain that a little more
7 before I finish our little talk.

8 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay.

9 DR. HOLLIDAY: I have got six more
10 slides. We are almost there.

11 Coordination and support, reducing
12 conflicts, trying to bring the right people to
13 the table, the purpose of how we do business
14 here.

15 We are going to hear this
16 afternoon, we have a speaker we have brought
17 in to talk specifically about this idea of
18 climate change, resiliency, our ability to
19 adapt to these changes, both at the science
20 level, at the agency level, but also at the
21 general public level.

22 So, understanding and forecasting

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 impacts of climate change. And in particular,
2 we have had briefings in the past specifically
3 on ocean acidification at the MAFAC in prior
4 meetings. How do we move forward on this?
5 Again, it requires a lot of science, a lot of
6 authoritative information, providing timely,
7 accessible, and relevant information and tools
8 to people in order to develop good policy and
9 good strategies.

10 The regional ecosystem protection
11 and restoration/The objective is an integrated
12 strategy, science-based again, looking at
13 protecting nationally-significant marine
14 areas, conservation partnerships, minimizing
15 wetland loss, looking at trying to ensure we
16 have mitigation for injuries to sensitive
17 sites, and, also, including reducing the risk
18 of vulnerability to invasive species. These
19 are all ideas that were formulated in the
20 interagency level and are now as part of the
21 area of special emphasis that we will be
22 looking to implement.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Water quality, sustainable
2 practices on the land, again, it doesn't start
3 at the ocean. That is just the transfer
4 between what is happening with pollution,
5 sources on land, effluent, hypoxia, harmful
6 algal blooms, all of these types of origins on
7 the shore side that impact our ability to
8 develop long-term strategies for living marine
9 resources. The health impacts, water quality
10 from water quality impairments, looking at
11 reducing the consequences of trash, marine
12 debris, and, again, protecting high-quality
13 areas of both the ocean, coastal, and the
14 Great Lakes waters.

15 Changing conditions in the Arctic,
16 we mentioned a moment ago. This is a very
17 sensitive and critical time in the juncture of
18 developing a policy because we have such
19 changing circumstances in the Arctic, and
20 looking across the regions and trying to
21 balance both the demand for economic activity,
22 energy activity, and the risks and the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 vulnerabilities associated with development
2 associated with taking advantage of some of
3 those opportunities for commercial purposes,
4 for economic and transportation purposes.

5 We also want to be making sure that
6 we are collecting sufficient information to
7 know when we are pushing beyond the envelope
8 for the Arctic and what some of those signals
9 would be, and helping to understand the
10 science basis for making a policy of allowing
11 use or disallowing use.

12 The information and the observation
13 infrastructure. We will hear this afternoon
14 some of the efforts that are ongoing to try to
15 capture information and to put it into a
16 usable format. You have the integrated
17 national system, a spatial data system that
18 allows people to take advantage of the
19 thousands, millions of observations that are
20 out there by different federal/state agencies,
21 trying to provide a national infrastructure
22 for that.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 On ocean observations, taking
2 advantage of the different fleets that are out
3 there, the platforms, whether they are ships,
4 satellites, other sensors, remote sensors, to
5 try to capture information into an integrated
6 national information management system.

7 And again, using tools and coastal
8 and marine spatial planning to visualize that,
9 putting it out, displaying it, see where
10 overlaps are, see where complementary
11 activities exist, see where conflicts may
12 arise.

13 So, July 19th was when the
14 Executive Order was signed last year. We are
15 coming up on a year. What has happened since
16 last year?

17 Most of the focus has been getting
18 the National Ocean Policy infrastructure up
19 and running by getting the federal family in
20 order. So, you have these hundreds of
21 different federal agencies trying to get
22 themselves to a table to have these

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 conversations, to set up an infrastructure, to
2 set up a process by which we can begin some of
3 these conversations.

4 We have a National Ocean Council.
5 They have met several times. We created this
6 new Governance Coordinating Committee, the
7 substructure. So, we have sort of the
8 architecture, the skeleton, the framework, if
9 you would, set up in the last six or eight
10 months.

11 We have developed some early
12 actions on this National Information
13 Management System, setting up agreements,
14 Memorandum of Understanding, some pretty, I
15 would say, significant agreements on the part
16 of a lot of agencies in terms of sharing data.

17 You might not think that is a very hard thing
18 to do, but a lot of agencies are protective or
19 at least very parochial in their data. And
20 getting them to agree on a common format and a
21 common way to exchange that information has
22 been a big challenge for them, and they have

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 done that.

2 For drafting these Strategic Action
3 Plans there is a schedule. We work backwards.

4 The target for developing the Strategic
5 Action Plans, these blueprints for these nine
6 areas is this time next year. So, these
7 deadlines were set in the Executive Order and
8 the report out of the interagency teams.

9 So, working back from there, the
10 public process to get at and look at the
11 draft, to get back to looking at the outline
12 of what would be in the draft, all of this
13 requires and necessitates public input.

14 A couple of weeks ago, a draft of
15 these outlines was circulated to one of those
16 earlier boxes I put on the chart. And I sent
17 it out by email rather than posting it because
18 it was a draft. It is not the one that is
19 going to be released to the public. This is
20 the 23rd, the 24th. About a week from now,
21 the first week of June, the public will be
22 given these draft outlines. It is not the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 full report. It is just the draft outline,
2 but it is 82 pages of outlines.

3 So, when you saw that email, I said
4 I didn't want you to try to read it all or
5 digest it, or even to comment on it, because
6 the outline is going to be changing between
7 that version that I saw, that you had seen,
8 and what is going to be given publicly. But I
9 wanted you to get a flavor of what was in
10 there. I have tried to capture the highlights
11 of that in those last few slides.

12 There will be a public comment
13 period where the public is welcome to comment.

14 Are those the right topics that are being
15 covered? Are those the right objectives?
16 That is an opportunity for you to consider how
17 you want to play in that realm.

18 But that is one of the things that
19 we have been very, at the federal level, we
20 have been working very hard on developing and
21 trying to do it in a way that is going to
22 ensure maximum participation. We will look at

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 participation opportunities again in a moment.

2 One of the other opportunities for
3 participation is this National Coastal and
4 Marine Spatial Planning Workshop. This is a
5 three-day workshop. Back a month ago when
6 this opportunity first came up, we sent an
7 email saying the first day is a public
8 session. People can participate. and, If you
9 want to be a participant to that public
10 session on the first day, it is kind of a
11 first-come, first-serve.

12 It will also be webcast, so you can
13 check it, then, on the internet if you are not
14 able to get to Washington, D.C. But, again,
15 almost every step in this process has a public
16 component or an advisory component where there
17 is opportunity for the public to weigh-in.

18 As NOAA's Advisory Committee, we
19 are looking to you to advise NOAA about our
20 positions to take to the table. So, like we
21 have done with aquaculture policies, like we
22 have done with catch-share policies, you have

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 the opportunity to comment as an individual,
2 but, also, as a member of MAFAC through NOAA
3 and the Secretary, to have your Advisory
4 Council and your perspective incorporated into
5 the making of the NOAA's, the Department's
6 views on these various pieces.

7 After the Workshop on Coastal and
8 Marine Spatial Planning, the next step would
9 be to help launch the creation of these
10 regional planning authorities for coastal and
11 marine spatial planning. I showed you earlier
12 who the NOAA reps will be, and these various
13 organizations will begin to be stood up in the
14 next six or eight months, following the
15 conclusion of that national workshop.

16 One or two more slides. So, as
17 part of the Strategic Action Plan, this full
18 content and outline is going to be open for
19 public comment. Will MAFAC comment and how?

20 In addition, once that is released,
21 the Administration and the various federal
22 agencies will be holding public-listening

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 sessions. So, we will be going out into the
2 field -- there is a map around the country --
3 during the month of June, various places where
4 they will be taking public input face-to-face
5 from these different sites in Alaska. There
6 is no particular date or time set yet for the
7 Caribbean, but around the country there are
8 various opportunities for people to be
9 involved and, again, question whether or not
10 MAFAC has an interest or not, an ability to
11 participate in that.

12 And, then, the last question here,
13 the slide here that I had was, after the
14 workshop, we will capture all of the comments
15 that come in during this Strategic Action Plan
16 outline review. They will then release the
17 draft of the plan itself. Another round of
18 public review will come in the fall. And that
19 falls just after our October meeting. So, we
20 have some thinking to do about the planning
21 and logistics for that.

22 And, then, the final release of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 this blueprint, which is the reason I am
2 focusing on it so heavily, is because I think
3 this is the time to get your kind of oar in
4 the water. If you are interested in
5 influencing what that blueprint is going to be
6 for the next five or ten years, the time is
7 now, and it is at the planning stage, not
8 after it has come out and, then, after the ink
9 is dry.

10 So, I have kind of beat this to
11 death, but that is what I am focusing on.
12 This is the time where I think a high-level
13 Advisory Committee like MAFAC needs to play.

14 So, I tried to set the stage about
15 where we stand on the Strategic Action Plans,
16 what the process is. This afternoon, again,
17 we are going to hear some speakers talk about
18 an energy focus, both traditional and
19 alternative energy, and the climate science
20 side of climate adaptation and climate change,
21 and some of the more specifics to help inform,
22 to improve our own knowledge about some of the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 details of the areas of special emphasis.

2 CHAIR McCARTY: Thanks, Mark.

3 DR. HOLLIDAY: Yes.

4 CHAIR McCARTY: Can I just ask a
5 couple of questions?

6 You, rightly, are saying that MAFAC
7 should get involved in this. And I am just
8 looking at the timing and wondering how much
9 involvement we should have at this meeting in
10 the drafts that are really, really drafty that
11 you sent out and cautioned us were really
12 draft drafts.

13 Or does it make more sense to wait
14 for the October meeting to do the more
15 detailed comment on a more evolved draft? Do
16 you have any advice on that?

17 DR. HOLLIDAY: I do.

18 (Laughter.)

19 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay.

20 DR. HOLLIDAY: I think what would
21 be most useful is for the Committee, and we
22 talked about this in prior meetings, there

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 needs to be some work between meetings and to
2 take advantage of our Subcommittees. We have
3 done this a number of times, where there has
4 been a particular assignment that took place
5 by the Subcommittee on behalf of the full
6 Committee during this interval between
7 meetings.

8 I think at this meeting, if there
9 is a consensus on the part of the group,
10 either assign it to one of the Subcommittees
11 or an ad hoc working group, so that when June
12 the 1st rolls around, and there is this 30-day
13 comment period, a Subcommittee or a small
14 group could undertake that on behalf of the
15 full Committee. We could, again, do phone
16 work to try to reach consensus on whatever
17 their finding is.

18 Because our intervals for meetings
19 are not going to intersect with these
20 externally-driven timeframes, my advice would
21 be, if you are interested in participating, I
22 think that mechanism of review successfully

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 used for aquaculture, for 2020, for the catch-
2 share policy, is assign it to a particular
3 subgroup or an existing standing Subcommittee
4 or an ad hoc group, and work that. And, then,
5 we can fill in to meet the deadlines for
6 comments.

7 I think if you wait until October,
8 you have missed a lot of opportunity for
9 impact. So, I think the best course would be,
10 if there is an interest, to try to have some
11 smaller group work on it.

12 CHAIR McCARTY: That makes sense.
13 Thank you. That is what struck me.

14 Vince?

15 MR. O'SHEA: Thank you.

16 Mark, I understand this last
17 discussion was about engaging the MAFAC, but I
18 am getting an earful of concern, certainly
19 from my states, and I think if Randy Fisher
20 were here, he would say the same thing.

21 What I didn't get a sense from this
22 process is whether there is going to be sort

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of a reach-out to the states to ensure that
2 they are integrated in how this thing goes
3 forward or whether it is a bit like what you
4 sort of said on MAFAC. Hey, June 1st is
5 coming up, or the 21st is coming up. If you
6 want to have influence on what happens in the
7 policy, you had better sign up to be at the
8 table.

9 I was wondering if you could give
10 me some guidance on that. In other words, is
11 it going to be one of these deals, "Hey, guys,
12 the door was open and you didn't show up, so,
13 you're out" or are they are going to recognize
14 the states are a critical part of this whole
15 deal. "Here's our plan to make sure the
16 states are engaged."?

17 DR. HOLLIDAY: Right. So, I think
18 that is a great point. If I can really get
19 back to that picture, all right, so a couple
20 of things come to mind.

21 This group here, this is sort of
22 the federal picture, and the Governance

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Coordinating Committee has direct state
2 participants on it that have been appointed by
3 Governors at the state level across the
4 country.

5 And so, this is the primary
6 structure for input from states with a direct
7 line to the policymakers. Okay? So, there is
8 a direct link there.

9 This Ocean Research and Resources
10 Advisory Panel that is also advising the
11 National Ocean Council, Randy Fisher is on
12 that group. And so, as a representative of
13 the Interstate Commission, he is another
14 conduit that has a direct line right into the
15 advisory group.

16 But, in a more general sense, I
17 think the structure of how this is playing
18 out, in particular, with coastal and marine
19 spatial planning, is the states are front and
20 center. They are not an afterthought. They
21 are the ones who, as part of these
22 associations, whether they are MARCO in the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Mid-Atlantic or NROC in the Northeast or the
2 Gulf efforts, some six out of the nine areas
3 have these existing governance bodies that
4 have been looking at perhaps taking on the
5 responsibility of being a regional planning
6 body for coastal and marine spatial planning.

7 All deference is given to those
8 existing regional and state-led efforts.
9 Those are driven by the Governors of the
10 individual states. They are deciding how to
11 proceed, whether they want to proceed or not,
12 and this is all being delegated to them to
13 decide, how do they want to play, who do they
14 want to involve.

15 The Feds are just saying, "We're
16 ready when this happens to help facilitate
17 that," but it is not being driven as a federal
18 effort. It is being driven, again,
19 regionally, and the principal focus is at the
20 state level. So, it is not if you show up;
21 there is a direct intervention to try to make
22 the states the leaders of this activity.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 MR. O'SHEA: Okay. Great. Thank
2 you.

3 CHAIR McCARTY: Mark, I have
4 another question. On the Coastal and Marine
5 Spatial Planning Workshop on the 21st, 22nd,
6 23rd of June, we got the invitation, and I
7 think everybody got it, to come to the first
8 day. I hope lots of people can come.

9 I know the rest of it is by
10 invitation-only. How is that going to be
11 disseminated or made available to the rest of
12 the folks who can't go? I am sure it is
13 space-limited. So, even if you wanted to go,
14 you probably couldn't because the invitations
15 are being limited.

16 DR. HOLLIDAY: Right.

17 CHAIR McCARTY: How are we going to
18 find out what happened then and when?

19 DR. HOLLIDAY: Well, there are two
20 immediate things that are going to happen.
21 You are right, the first big, national meeting
22 was directed to those people who were likely

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to be the direct participants and members of
2 those regional planning bodies. So, it is
3 almost an in-service training.

4 The people from MARCO or these
5 regional governance associations, from state
6 agencies, those are the ones who were targeted
7 for being the participants at the national
8 meeting.

9 And I think NOAA -- I mean there's
10 several hundred people who are being invited
11 -- and I think NOAA only has like four or five
12 people. So, it is not federal-only. The vast
13 majority of the people are from outside of the
14 federal government, from outside of
15 Washington, D.C., that are being brought in,
16 wanting to get everybody up-to-speed and
17 comfortable with the idea about what coastal
18 and marine spatial planning is and is not, and
19 to provide training.

20 They are going to be doing
21 exercises, simulation exercises. That is part
22 of the second and third day of that workshop,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to help get people to that level.

2 So, once that is done, your
3 question is, what happens next? There is
4 going to be regional workshops that are going
5 to take that information, and it is like
6 training the trainer. Those people who have
7 gone to those workshops will be used,
8 utilized, to have regional workshops around
9 the country during the course of the summer to
10 help launch and kick off the next step of the
11 development of those regional planning bodies.

12 So, it is not the only time there
13 is going to be a workshop. It is the start of
14 a series of interactions with people. It
15 takes the form of workshops. Then, of course,
16 the proceedings and the information would be
17 posted, and a set of different products, not
18 just a website, but products that would talk
19 about the tools that they are using and the
20 techniques that they are talking about at the
21 national workshop, will be given as tools for
22 these next generation of people to use in the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 regions.

2 CHAIR McCARTY: It would be
3 helpful, I think, for many of us to know who
4 those folks were from our region that are
5 going to go to this thing. So that we could
6 know ahead of time, you know, speak to them,
7 and say whatever you want to say to them
8 before they go. I think that would be useful
9 to know.

10 DR. HOLLIDAY: I am confident that
11 we can get that information out to people.

12 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. Who is going
13 to go to that first day, the 21st? Raise your
14 hand. Do you know? Anybody else from MAFAC?
15 Okay. I'm signed up to go.

16 MR. DEWEY: I signed up, but I am
17 not sure.

18 CHAIR McCARTY: Yes, I am not -- it
19 is expensive.

20 Other questions of Mark?

21 MR. RIZZARDI: If you are attending
22 electronically, is there an opportunity to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 participate on the 21st? I mean to send
2 questions in that can be answered by the
3 panel, anything like that?

4 MS. LOVETT: The meeting is going
5 to be held at the Department of Interior's
6 office space. So, I am not quite sure what
7 the current situation for the teleconferencing
8 is, but we could find that out and provide
9 that back to you.

10 CHAIR McCARTY: Go ahead.

11 MS. DOERR: Could you put up the
12 slide with the dates? I am just trying to get
13 it straight in my mind.

14 DR. HOLLIDAY: Yes. These are the
15 dates. MS. DOERR: Maybe it was
16 the previous slide, one of those slides that
17 had the October dates. So, the outline is
18 going out for comment next month, in a couple
19 of weeks?

20 DR. HOLLIDAY: In a couple of
21 weeks. That is the outline, and, then, people
22 are asked to comment after that, for 30 days.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Then, we are going to hold these public
2 meetings. Theses are public-listening
3 sessions on the whole --

4 MS. DOERR: Okay.

5 DR. HOLLIDAY: So, while it is open
6 for public comment, we are going to actually
7 go out and hold these regional workshops where
8 people can come and listen in and talk and
9 exchange their ideas, their input, all about
10 the outline.

11 And, then, on the next slide we
12 talk about the release of the draft. So,
13 after the public comment period closes in
14 July, August, and September, and we will get
15 this draft of the actual document ready for
16 public review sometime toward the end of
17 October. And, then, that document itself will
18 be posted for public review, and I am sure
19 that there will be additional listening
20 sessions after that as well. I didn't have a
21 schedule for that.

22 MS. DOERR: Okay.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 DR. HOLLIDAY: So, there is a
2 comprehensive plan. Every step of the way in
3 this process is very heavily oriented towards
4 ensuring transparency and public involvement,
5 both from the general public as well as the
6 partners and the stakeholders that have a
7 maximum opportunity to provide input.

8 CHAIR McCARTY: So, Mark, is this
9 PowerPoint on the website yet, the one you
10 just gave?

11 DR. HOLLIDAY: No, it is not.

12 CHAIR McCARTY: Could you post
13 that, so that we can have the dates right in
14 front of us --

15 DR. HOLLIDAY: Sure.

16 CHAIR McCARTY: -- if we want to
17 have it for later on?

18 Also, is the outline that you are
19 referring to similar to what we had in that
20 email from you? Is that what you are calling
21 the outline?

22 DR. HOLLIDAY: That was what was

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 sent in the email, what is going to be the
2 equivalent of the updated version that we send
3 out for public review.

4 CHAIR McCARTY: June 1?

5 DR. HOLLIDAY: On June 1.

6 CHAIR McCARTY: So, here is what I
7 am thinking, you guys. You're done, right,
8 Mark, with this particular section?

9 It is almost noon. We are going to
10 need, I think, an hour and a quarter for lunch
11 because we need to go offsite. Captain Scholl
12 has said that there is a good place on Duval,
13 one of the closest places, called Jack Flats,
14 I think he said was really good.

15 MR. SCHOLL: That's good.

16 CHAIR McCARTY: Go to Duval and
17 turn left?

18 MR. FISHER: Sandwiches and salads.

19 MR. CAUSEY: It is not that big,
20 but I think you could fit in there.

21 CHAIR McCARTY: So, just before we
22 break, I would like to just say what I think

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 maybe we should do. And, then, I would like a
2 little bit of comment from the rest of the
3 members.

4 I like the idea of having an ad hoc
5 committee work on this, rather than one of the
6 already-formulated Subcommittees, because I
7 think this kind of crosses several different
8 areas. And so, I would hate to give it just
9 to the Ecosystem Committee or just to the
10 Commerce Committee or just to the Strategic
11 Planning Committee.

12 And so, over lunch, maybe if you
13 think that is a good idea, think about whether
14 you want to be on that ad hoc subcommittee,
15 and follow Mark's recommendation of having
16 meetings of that subcommittee electronically
17 over the next few months, or at least a month
18 and a half, to make a recommendation to the
19 full Committee, similar to what we did with
20 the aquaculture policy.

21 I thought that worked pretty well,
22 to have an electronic meeting of MAFAC to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 approve or to comment on what we might comment
2 on. So, think about that during lunch.

3 And, then, when we come back, we
4 will hear from the rest of the presenters
5 maybe, Mark? Does that work?

6 DR. HOLLIDAY: Yes. That's good.

7 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay.

8 Billy?

9 MR. CAUSEY: One more option for
10 lunch, I don't know if you are trying to all
11 go to the same place.

12 CHAIR McCARTY: Not necessarily.

13 MR. CAUSEY: Okay. If you go
14 straight out, just like you go past the Green
15 Parrot and cross Duval Street, on the left
16 hand side there is a vegetarian/vegan
17 restaurant. I don't know how many of you are
18 of that persuasion.

19 And right across the street from
20 that is a little area with a lot of sandwich
21 shops that are very accessible. Jack Flat's
22 is good, but if you want to spread out, that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 area right there along Duval has a lot of
2 options.

3 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you.

4 Mark, did you have something you
5 wanted to point out to us?

6 DR. HOLLIDAY: Well, we have a
7 small map of the area and the restaurants.

8 CHAIR McCARTY: Oh, cool.

9 DR. HOLLIDAY: But there's tons of
10 places within easy walking distance.

11 These are on the table there.

12 CHAIR McCARTY: See you then.

13 (Whereupon, the foregoing matter
14 went off the record for lunch at 11:57 a.m.
15 and went back on the record at 1:22 p.m.)

16

17

18 A-F-T-E-R-N-O-O-N S-E-S-S-I-O-N

19 1:22 p.m.

20 CHAIR McCARTY: Thanks. I hope you
21 all got lunch.

22 Emily, I believe you are up next.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Emily Lindow, do you want to introduce
2 yourself?

3 MS. LINDOW: Sure. My name is
4 Emily Lindow. I work for Eric as a Senior
5 Policy Analyst, and I handle the energy
6 portfolio across all of the Fishery Service
7 and, also, actually, handle the energy
8 portfolio across NOAA as well.

9 So, we thought, since there was
10 interest in the offshore wind issue, that it
11 might be good to provide a little bit of water
12 context as to things that NOAA is working on
13 and, also, Fisheries, so that you can put the
14 wind component of that into a broader context.

15 So, I am going to talk a little bit
16 about the context in terms of high-level
17 interest, mostly presidential, Administration
18 interest, which is driving a lot of the
19 activities that are going on right now.

20 Just a couple of highlights from
21 some of the NOAA internal activities. Then,
22 we will talk about some of the partnership

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 activities we have got going on. And quite
2 frankly, there is a lot of it.

3 And, then, I just wanted to tee-up
4 a couple of issues that, if you would like to
5 discuss them within your Subcommittees, I
6 would be really happy to get some feedback for
7 you. This is set up as an informational
8 briefing, but, also, if you are interested in
9 providing feedback, I would be very open to
10 receiving that.

11 So, just starting with the context
12 here, back a little over a year ago, the
13 Department of the Interior and the
14 Administration announced its Comprehensive
15 Strategy for Offshore Oil and Gas Development
16 and Exploration. That really launched this
17 idea of doing expanded development in the Gulf
18 of Mexico, off the Atlantic Coast, also, up in
19 the Arctic.

20 Just a few weeks later, we had the
21 Deepwater Horizon explosion, which really did
22 change the way that we looked at all these

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 offshore oil and gas activities.

2 That was followed up a few months
3 later by the President's announcement on
4 Coastal and Marine Spatial Planning, the
5 broader Ocean Policy Task Force.

6 And, then, followed up just earlier
7 this year, the State-of-the-Union challenge
8 when the President mentioned having 80 percent
9 of electricity from clean energy sources by
10 2035 as a challenge to the country.

11 So, over the past year or so, we
12 have really had this mix of both kind of a
13 high-level push on renewable energy and on oil
14 and gas.

15 The White House released back in
16 March of this year a Blueprint for a Secure
17 Energy Future. In your documents, I included
18 a link to that document, if you are interested
19 in it.

20 But, generally, it is the idea that
21 you do regional-specific facilities to
22 facilitate offshore energy development and,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 also, this push for offshore Atlantic wind
2 energy.

3 And, then, just a couple of weeks
4 ago, the President made an announcement during
5 his weekly address that was really focused on
6 energy issues. In a lot of ways, this
7 reiterated a lot of things that were already
8 in the Blueprint. So, that is also available
9 online, if people are interested in the
10 details.

11 The other piece I wanted just to
12 put into context, because we are talking about
13 this under the broader context of the National
14 Ocean Council, is the fact that you do have a
15 lot of links between the different priority
16 objectives and efficient energy. These are
17 four where I think it is a little more clear,
18 but really energy does touch on a number of
19 issues within the work of the Task Force and
20 the work of all these groups going forward.

21 The big question, though, really is
22 how energy issues are going to be addressed in

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 these Action Plans moving forward. That is
2 something that we are still kind of waiting to
3 see. So, it will be interesting to see how
4 that moves forward.

5 So, I am going to talk about two
6 internal activities that NOAA has been working
7 on. One is the Strategic Energy Review, and
8 the second is the NOAA Energy Plan. And the
9 Energy Plan is where I would love to get some
10 feedback from you guys, once you have a chance
11 to kind of hear about it and think about it a
12 bit.

13 So, the NOAA Strategic Energy
14 Review Plan was requested in 2009 by the NOAA
15 Executive Council. That Executive Council is
16 basically all the most senior-level SESers
17 that we have within the agency.

18 And you can see the objectives
19 there. The report of the group is being
20 currently finalized. It got slowed down just
21 a little bit because we had some major changes
22 within the agency in December of this last

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 year related to the next-generation Strategic
2 Plan and the Annual Guidance Memorandum that
3 came out kind of as direction. And so, we had
4 to rework the report just a little bit.

5 But two things I just wanted to
6 mention. I am going to talk about the
7 recommendations next. But in terms of the
8 inventory, all of the NOAA line offices are
9 involved in energy issues. It is everything
10 from Fisheries, where we are working on
11 environmental consultations, the Endangered
12 Species Act, Magnuson, the Essential Fish
13 Habitat, and, also, the siting issues, to the
14 dry side of NOAA, where we have got our
15 satellites and our Weather Service and OAR,
16 who are working on modeling and ocean
17 currents, and all types of different things
18 that really impact both ocean and land-based
19 renewal energy in terms of helping understand
20 the resource and trying to better integrate
21 that resource into the electrical grid.

22 The second thing there -- or excuse

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 me -- the third, the non-federal partnerships,
2 the federal partnerships opportunity. We had
3 held a series of federal workshops that were
4 broken down by energy sector. This was a very
5 interesting thing. I think we held eight
6 different workshops.

7 And we just sat down with our
8 federal partners to talk about what everybody
9 was doing related to energy, and this was both
10 onshore and offshore. It was real impressive
11 to me because I was expecting it to be a
12 little turfey. In reality, there was very
13 little overlap between the different federal
14 departments and agencies as to what everyone
15 was working on. It was a very collaborative,
16 cooperative-type atmosphere where people were
17 really looking to NOAA saying, "We need your
18 help on" things like these forecasting issues,
19 some of these offshore issues. So, I think
20 there is a lot of room within the federal
21 government to keep working together.

22 I am just going to run through.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 These are draft recommendations because they
2 haven't been formalized by the senior
3 leadership yet, but we are expecting,
4 hopefully, that to happen in June.

5 This first one is really directed
6 at NOAA leadership and the idea that we need
7 better recognition that these are important
8 issues in order for us at line-office-level to
9 really be kind of moving forward with
10 expanding our activities and focusing on them.

11 One of the first things that we
12 have already started to work on, even though
13 this hasn't been formally approved yet, is to
14 formalize a NOAA energy team. So, we are
15 working on that. It is across the entire
16 agency. We have got budget people. We have
17 got policy people, the technical people. So,
18 a good mix of folks that are really working on
19 trying to coordinate the issues across the
20 agency, make sure everyone is talking.

21 The second item there is really
22 focused on more of the dry-side issues, the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 weather/water forecasting for renewable
2 energy.

3 The third recommendation, up at the
4 top, this is something that is probably a
5 little more of interest to this group. It is
6 definitely more focused on the Fisheries
7 Service.

8 And it is the idea that we need to
9 be balancing both the need to keep energy in
10 the United States moving forward with a need
11 to protect the environment and to protect user
12 groups that are relying on the ocean for other
13 activities as well.

14 So, these are going to be things
15 that we are going to look at kind of moving
16 forward with an Action Plan. But I would say
17 keep No. 3 in mind as you are thinking about
18 the Action Plan and the types of things that
19 NOAA might be able to do in order to make
20 something like this happen in a way that you
21 guys think would be appropriate.

22 So, the Energy Plan that I have

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 kind of mentioned already, it has its origins
2 back in the 2010 -- there are two different
3 kind of budget guidance documents that are
4 listed there. It isn't really important what
5 exactly they are, but I do have links to them
6 if people want to see the actual references.

7 It originally started off as a very
8 weather-focused tasking to do this Energy Plan
9 that looked at how NOAA could improve its
10 forecasting and modeling all of these things.

11 A decision was made that made a lot more
12 sense, given the interest in energy activities
13 across the Administration as a whole, to
14 broaden this plan.

15 And so, we have until the end of
16 this fiscal year -- we haven't started yet.
17 So, it is going to be a pretty hectic
18 activity -- to look at energy issues across
19 the entire agency, and to come up with a plan
20 that has components that can be fed into the
21 SEE budget formulation cycle, the budget
22 process.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 And it can be used by the line
2 offices to prioritize the activities that they
3 are undertaking. Partnerships are encouraged
4 across the different line offices as part of
5 this task.

6 So, this is one area where it would
7 be really helpful, if MAFAC was interested, I
8 would love to receive just your thoughts, your
9 guidance, as to what you think are important
10 priorities for us to be looking at.

11 It would probably need to come, I
12 would say, within about the next month, month
13 and a half, because we are going to be on a
14 fairly quick turnaround for this. But if it
15 is something that you are interested in, I
16 definitely would enjoy either having the
17 opportunity to engage more with folks or just
18 hearing what your thoughts are.

19 So, moving on to some of our
20 activities with partners, Mark talked earlier
21 this morning about the National Ocean Council
22 and how that is moving forward. One thing

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that I wanted to note, how its activities are
2 related to energy.

3 First, they are working on the
4 tools and policies, particularly the data
5 portals, which is going to be very important
6 for these siting issues related to kind of
7 resolving user conflicts eventually, and the
8 CMSP component, which is moving forward in
9 terms of the workshop and a number of other
10 activities, which will, hopefully, eventually
11 help out with some of these different -- these
12 are conflict siting issues that we have.

13 Next up, and this is hot off the
14 presses, last Thursday we had an MOU that was
15 signed between technically the Department of
16 Commerce and the Department of Interior, but
17 really NOAA and BOEMRE, related to offshore
18 energy. This covers both renewable and oil
19 and gas activities.

20 You can see some of the main points
21 of the MOU there. But, from a NOAA
22 perspective, it doesn't give us any new

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 authorities, but what it does do is it
2 provides us with a framework where we can, I
3 think, better integrate ourselves into the
4 BOEMRE structure and processes for doing these
5 environmental reviews, for looking at the
6 science. So, I really do think it will,
7 hopefully, be a very helpful kind of framework
8 for us to move forward on.

9 A lot of this was brought up by the
10 oil spill, but I think it gives us a really
11 good place to move forward in a very
12 cooperative way. So, I know we are looking
13 forward to continuing to engage more.

14 Unfortunately, we don't have the
15 new resources to go with this. It does
16 potentially pose some potential issues for us
17 because, if we are looking at being more
18 involved in the NEPA process or doing more
19 environmental consultations, but doing that
20 with our current staff, it is not going to be
21 an easy balance to strike. So, we are going
22 to be trying to figure out how to kind of do

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 that over the coming months and years.

2 The next thing here, we had a
3 second MOU that was signed back in January
4 that I wanted to mention as well. This one is
5 really focused on the weather-dependent
6 renewable energy, more of the Weather Service,
7 our Satellite Service-type activities.

8 The idea is to promote advancements
9 in the characterization of renewable energy
10 sources. This particular MOU does not cover
11 environmental or socioeconomic impacts of
12 renewable energy, but it has brought up the
13 question as to whether, moving forward, it
14 might be a good idea for NOAA to look at doing
15 an MOU with DOE, who puts a lot of money into
16 research on renewable energy, that would more
17 specifically look at socioeconomic impacts.
18 So, that is something that we might be looking
19 at moving forward.

20 You are going to hear a
21 presentation coming up about Smart from the
22 Start. I just wanted to mention that NOAA is

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 involved in this process. There are, I think,
2 13, possibly more, state task forces. NOAA
3 sits on all of them. In fact, Fisheries has a
4 representative on all of those task forces.

5 It is a little overwhelming because
6 there are so many. I know presentations have
7 be made to at least two of the Fishery
8 Management Councils. I do think it is really
9 good that we have got the Fishery Management
10 Councils engaging.

11 I went to both the Mid-Atlantic
12 Council meeting and the New England Council
13 meeting to hear the thoughts of the fishermen.

14 I am looking forward to seeing kind of what
15 this group has in terms of comments specific
16 to this back to the Department of Interior
17 because I know there was some idea of
18 providing maybe a little feedback from this
19 group. So, I think at NOAA we are going to be
20 really interested to hear what the thoughts
21 are on this issue as well.

22 Another thing I just wanted to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 mention, the National Oceanographic
2 Partnership Program, which is basically a
3 group of federal agencies that can get
4 together and fund projects, we got together.
5 Department of Energy, NOAA, and BOEMRE got
6 together just last year and put out almost \$5
7 million in awards, eight different projects,
8 each for two to three years in duration.

9 These are just a couple of examples
10 of some of those projects, so you have an
11 idea. But these were looking at the
12 environmental impacts and how to do monitoring
13 and other types of protocol.

14 Because we have got this big flood
15 of potential ocean energy projects, but I know
16 from just the Fisheries side we are starting
17 to run into problems because we don't know
18 what the impacts are going to be. As you
19 start to grow these things out, it is tough to
20 know how the impacts are going to be scaled as
21 you are moving forward.

22 So, hopefully, this funding that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 will go into these projects will kind of
2 provide us a little bit more framework and
3 something that we can move forward from, as we
4 start to see more of these things come to
5 fruition and potentially go in the water. So,
6 I think this is a really good, proactive
7 activity.

8 I just wanted to close with just a
9 reiteration that I would love to hear -- I am
10 going to be the NOAA Fisheries representative
11 to the Steering Committee that is working on
12 the NOAA Energy Plan. If this group has any
13 feedback that you would like to provide
14 formally/informally, I would be really happy
15 to hear it and would be happy to kind of
16 integrate that into what we are doing,
17 assuming that it is things that we actually
18 can control.

19 And that is one thing that would be
20 important. If you can try to focus on
21 feedback that are things that Fisheries itself
22 can implement versus things that we would need

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 to ask other people, whether it is Congress or
2 other folks to do, I think that would be
3 particularly helpful.

4 And if there are any other
5 questions, please feel free to ask them now.

6 MR. NARDI: When you are looking at
7 the opportunity of putting in energy equipment
8 offshore, did you give consideration to sort
9 of clustering other activities such as food
10 production or aquaculture? If you are going
11 to be making sort of an impact in an area,
12 cluster that impact and marry up the
13 activities?

14 MS. LINDOW: Are you talking about
15 the projects that were funded?

16 MR. NARDI: Right. Or just in
17 concept or in terms of your policy thinking.

18 MS. LINDOW: I don't know if we
19 have made it that far yet. But I do think
20 that that is a good kind of point that should
21 be raised.

22 MR. NARDI: It is much of the same

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 experimenting activity you will have to go
2 through, the same activity --

3 MS. LINDOW: Yes.

4 MR. NARDI: -- that another
5 operation will have to go through. You could
6 minimize the impact and maximize the output in
7 a given area.

8 MS. LINDOW: Yes, and I have been
9 in contact with our Coastal and Marine Spatial
10 Planning people, and energy issues seem to be
11 coming up a little more frequently with that
12 group. I think one of their hopes is the idea
13 that, through these regional planning bodies,
14 you are going to have the different federal
15 agencies talking to each other on all of the
16 different possible permitting activities, and
17 that you could start using some of the same
18 information to help speed up these processes,
19 particularly if you did have clusters of
20 activities that are going on.

21 So, I have a feeling that is really
22 going to start coming up in the Coastal and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Marine Spatial Planning context, but it is a
2 good point as we are thinking about our
3 activities internally.

4 Yes?

5 MR. RAFTICAN: While you were in
6 transit this morning, we had a presentation
7 regarding the Sanctuaries here and working on
8 the removal of a wall that had coral growing
9 on it.

10 We did a lot of work in California
11 over the past couple of years on rig stories
12 and decommissioning, and I have done
13 substantial studies on the value of the
14 structures.

15 Has anything been done to look at,
16 as you are putting in significantly-new
17 structures, ways that you can utilize that to
18 enhance marine resources and actually being
19 proactive on something like that?

20 MS. LINDOW: It is not something
21 that I have been involved with. I am actually
22 wondering if that has been done in any of our

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 regional offices or in a regional context.

2 DR. CRABTREE: I'm sorry.

3 MS. LINDOW: In terms of while
4 people are thinking about putting structures
5 in, are we thinking about impacts on the
6 fishery stocks in terms of enhancement, kind
7 of --

8 DR. CRABTREE: No. I mean we can
9 talk about enhancement, but I don't think
10 there would be any enhancement credit out of
11 it.

12 MS. LINDOW: Yes. Okay.

13 DR. CRABTREE: Because there is as
14 much of an argument that it is --

15 MS. LINDOW: Aggregation?

16 DR. CRABTREE: -- an aggregation
17 process.

18 MR. RAFTICAN: And the second part
19 of the question is that NOAA/BOEMRE MOU
20 available?

21 MS. LINDOW: I think it is online,
22 but I need to check.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. RUSSIN: I work for BOEMRE, by
2 the way. And a press release went out
3 yesterday, which should be on the boemre.gov
4 website, which has a link to the MOU. I don't
5 have it handy, but it should be on our
6 website.

7 MS. LINDOW: I had let Heidi know,
8 too, that once I had a chance to get back to
9 my computer, I would look for a link, so that
10 we can link you guys to it on your MAFAC page.

11 MR. RAFTICAN: Thanks.

12 CHAIR McCARTY: You go ahead.

13 MS. LINDOW: Okay. Go ahead then.

14 MR. O'SHEA: Oh, thanks. Thanks,
15 Emily.

16 I am just repeating what I have
17 heard in other fora and just so MAFAC knows,
18 but from the fishery perspective, there is a
19 high interest in the remaining infrastructure,
20 that the permitting process and the policy
21 going forward fully address what happens when
22 those structures, those cables, whatever, that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 they get addressed. Because I think there is
2 a history with other cable-laying and other
3 things, the use of the cable. That has come
4 back to, then, Dave Wallace on the end, the
5 clam fishery, scallop guys, draggers.

6 So, maybe the intersection for NOAA
7 Fisheries is to stake out that issue of what
8 happens when the infrastructure is no longer
9 being used. Is that NOAA's policy that that
10 be fully addressed with a performance bond, or
11 whatever?

12 So, I am not advocating that you do
13 that. I am just saying that the groups that I
14 have been traveling with, people seem to bring
15 that up consistently.

16 MS. LINDOW: Yes, and that would be
17 an issue as well for BOEMRE as part of their
18 decommissioning regulations. We can kind of
19 play in that process.

20 MR. O'SHEA: I mean BOEMRE's guys
21 will be doing it.

22 MS. LINDOW: Yes.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MR. O'SHEA: But I think that,
2 naturally, Fisheries Service has an issue in
3 promoting or being the agency advocating to
4 make sure that those things get addressed in a
5 deliberate way.

6 MS. LINDOW: Okay.

7 CHAIR McCARTY: Tom?

8 MR. RAFTICAN: Yes, I guess I
9 backed off a little bit from where Vince is
10 coming from and saying, you know, right at the
11 moment, at least on the East Coast, the little
12 bit that I know from the Mid-Atlantic and the
13 Northeast, the National Ocean Policy and
14 Marine Spatial Planning were all going good.

15 But, then, you have the Energy
16 Policy Act from 2005. Unfortunately, that is
17 within the federal agencies, and input is
18 actually received in communications addressing
19 proposed regulations. And I am seriously
20 worried about fisheries being phased, or
21 fisheries management being phased out by other
22 energy justifications. In particular, things

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 like wind energy farms, where the exclusion
2 zones are going to create a massive marine
3 protected area zones where there is going to
4 be no input from the Fisheries Councils who
5 manage that area. And I am afraid there is
6 not going to be any pushback even from NOAA,
7 who is ultimately responsible for enforcing
8 all of these fisheries regulatory processes.

9 And so, yes, I am worried about
10 what happens 25 years from now when a
11 hurricane blows down the windmills off of New
12 Jersey on the most vital fishing grounds in
13 New Jersey. And, then, nobody is going to
14 want to go back there and try to clean that
15 up, especially things like if they are driven
16 down to the bottom 180 feet. Who is going to
17 take care of all those deep pilings? The
18 scalar pads are 200 feet in diameter, big rock
19 formations. Who is going to remove all those?

20 And the answer is nobody is going to want to
21 remove them.

22 So, in the short term and in the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 long term, we are going to be very excluded
2 from our current fishing ways.

3 MS. LINDOW: So, just a couple of
4 things on that. We are sitting the task
5 forces in terms of NOAA. But I think then we
6 will be able to kind of talk more about the
7 public process, how the Fishery Management
8 Councils can kind of engage in the process in
9 that.

10 MR. RAFTICAN: Well, I can tell you
11 the two Fisheries Management Councils that I
12 know of have asked for seats on the regional
13 planning bodies and have been turned down
14 because it is only for government agencies,
15 and they are not a government agency.

16 DR. CHATWIN: Hi, Emily.

17 On one of your earlier slides, you
18 had one of the bullets to clarify NOAA's
19 energy rule, the legislation.

20 MS. LINDOW: Yes.

21 DR. CHATWIN: I wonder if you can
22 tell us more about that?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. LINDOW: Yes, that is getting
2 at a couple of pieces of legislation. One is
3 the Ocean Thermal Energy Conversion Act. It
4 was passed back about 1980 or so.

5 There has been some interest in
6 Hawaii, actually, off the southeast coast, for
7 OTEC projects. We could use some changes.
8 The Act really does need to be updated.

9 The second piece was the Coastal
10 Zone Management Act. There are some energy-
11 related provisions that could potentially be
12 helpful in the CBMA.

13 And, then, the third piece of
14 energy legislation that we were specifically
15 thinking about was related to explicitly
16 authorizing NOAA's weather forecasting
17 capabilities to be used for promotion of
18 energy, because right now it is a little vague
19 as to NOAA can do weather forecasting and
20 modeling for the law benefit, but not for a
21 single sector.

22 And so, I think people would be

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 happy to see it, just acknowledge that it
2 could be a very valuable service that would
3 allow us to maybe tailor our products a little
4 bit more from the weather side.

5 So, those were the three that are
6 hidden in that bullet.

7 MS. DOERR: So, the funding
8 opportunity you mentioned at the end, was that
9 the one-shot deal or is that to provide --

10 MS. LINDOW: That was a one-shot
11 deal. Basically, the agencies passed a hat to
12 put up the money. The NOAA component of that
13 was fairly small. I think NOAA probably put
14 in about 500K or so, roughly. The big bulk
15 came from the Department of Energy and from
16 BOEMRE.

17 But we were happy that we were able
18 to at least put a little bit in and be sitting
19 at the table to help and choose the projects
20 and focus the topic.

21 MS. DOERR: Do you know if there
22 are plans to try to do that again?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 MS. LINDOW: I have not heard any
2 interest being expressed in a second one. My
3 guess is that probably we will wait to see
4 what comes out of this.

5 But DOE has a lot of different
6 activities going on, just themselves, in terms
7 of different energy, particularly their Office
8 of Energy Efficiency.

9 So, if you are interested in
10 funding, they are a really good group to reach
11 out to. But that whole wind and water power
12 program integrates that.

13 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you.

14 We were talking about time up here.
15 We may want to have more discussion about
16 this afterwards.

17 MS. LINDOW: Yes.

18 CHAIR McCARTY: But I believe that
19 Ned and Leah are time-constrained.

20 MR. FARQUHAR: Yes, we are.

21 (Laughter.)

22 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you. Thank

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 you.

2 (Applause.)

3 MR. FARQUHAR: Hello. My name is
4 Ned Farquhar. I am Deputy Assistant Secretary
5 of Interior in Land and Minerals Management.

6 Land and Minerals Management
7 oversees the Bureau of Land Management, the
8 Bureau of Ocean Energy Management, and the
9 Office of Surface Mining.

10 My role is mostly energy. So, I do
11 oil and gas and renewables, and would be happy
12 to talk more about those as well.

13 I am happy to be here today with
14 Leah Russin, who is the Advisor to the
15 Director of BOEMRE on renewables. And she
16 will also participate in the presentation.

17 I want you to know that we deeply
18 respect the opinions that the NMFS and the
19 NOAA delivered today. I took a very serious
20 interest, extremely casually. I do business
21 causal.

22 (Laughter.)

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 So, you guys are setting a great
2 role model for us.

3 Secretary Salazar and the President
4 are very interested in working in offshore
5 wind development, which is really where the
6 majority of our activity is right now on
7 renewables. Obviously, they are mostly in the
8 Atlantic, but there are other things happening
9 in other geography. So, I think we will touch
10 a little bit on those as well. I know there
11 is probably national interest from this group
12 as well.

13 I did go to meet with the New
14 England Fisheries Management Council probably
15 a month ago, I'm guessing. We have gone to
16 the Mid-Atlantic Fisheries Advisory Council as
17 well. We are trying to get out and meet with
18 them as often as they are interested and
19 update them and participate however we can.

20 So, this is a very welcomed
21 opportunity for us and we appreciate your time
22 and attention.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 The first thing I want to do is
2 quickly just talk about the process for how
3 BOEMRE, which is also known as "BOMBER",
4 "BOOMER", "BOOMRAY". We don't call it
5 "BUMMER", but --

6 (Laughter.)

7 So, it has got a bunch of names.
8 But it is going to split in October, and it
9 will be down to BOEM, Ocean Energy Management,
10 and a new Safety and Environmental Enforcement
11 Bureau. So, you don't have to remember that
12 for very long.

13 But what we are doing on renewables
14 is very different from the way we have gone at
15 oil and gas, where there is a history,
16 particularly in the Gulf, and there's a lot of
17 information. By that time that lease is
18 issued to an oil and gas lessee, there is
19 pretty much a guarantee of some kind of
20 development. You know, that lease can be
21 developed.

22 In this case for wind activity, we

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 have a different process. We are moving
2 toward leasing, but the lease itself is going
3 to be a different kind of an instrument. That
4 is one of the main things I want to get across
5 right now.

6 We are going to do major
7 environmental work on individual projects as
8 they are presented and proposed. And at that
9 point, the activities under the lease will be
10 subject to modification. You know, the new
11 steps, we can drop blocks out; we can reject
12 projects, et cetera.

13 So, we are looking at really a two-
14 stage sort of a leasing vestiture of the
15 rights. That is the way we need to do it
16 because of the status of the information and
17 the way the developing community sees -- what
18 they want to do is collect information and
19 propose projects exclusive to an individual
20 developer, rather than have a whole bunch of
21 people collecting information and bidding on
22 things after and having the lease after people

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 have gone through a process of working up
2 proposals. So, it is different and it is
3 something that is very important for the way
4 we are looking at it.

5 So, earlier -- I don't know the
6 name over here; I couldn't see it -- but you
7 mentioned the state task forces, which are not
8 original bodies. We have the state-level task
9 forces that we have put together with
10 governmental participants because of the
11 Federal Advisory Committee Act, which I am
12 sure you are all very familiar with. We are
13 working through those task forces to try to
14 identify areas to put out for public review
15 for proposals for eventual leasing,
16 consideration for eventual leasing.

17 So, there is plenty of public
18 process later that I am going to describe to
19 you for non-governmentals, as the proposals go
20 forward for leasing. But we also welcome
21 information in different listening sessions
22 that Leah I think can describe a little more,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 but, also, through the Governors' offices.

2 One of the reasons we have these
3 set up at the state level is that we are able
4 to get good, strong commitment from most of
5 the Governors that we are dealing with to
6 provide information to convene people to do
7 things that we can't do without tremendous
8 investment of time and money and FACAs. So,
9 we are relying heavily on these state
10 structures.

11 The second thing we are doing is
12 through these public documents that go into
13 The Federal Register, and we have agreed to
14 try to keep the Regional Fisheries Management
15 Councils advised as we go along of any of
16 those kinds of notices, try to get public
17 information back from non-task force members.

18 So, as I mentioned before, there is a lot of
19 opportunities for that that I will go through
20 in a few minutes.

21 So, we are trying to conduct the
22 appropriate level of environmental analysis

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 for the different stages of the process. We
2 are doing, for instance, in the Mid-Atlantic
3 right now a regional Environmental Assessment
4 to support the leasing process itself and some
5 of the site assessment activities that a
6 potential developer may have to do to be able
7 to put forward a project.

8 So, we are starting out with an EA
9 at the regional level. That EA in the Mid-
10 Atlantic is expected to be released in mid-
11 June and would go out for some kind of public
12 comment period. People will be able to react
13 to it and send their list back.

14 At that point, we will be moving
15 toward leasing in some of the states. For
16 instance, in Delaware at that point we might
17 be able to move forward with a non-competitive
18 lease by the end of the year. The four states
19 in that Mid-Atlantic EA are Delaware,
20 Maryland, New Jersey, and Virginia.

21 After the areas have been
22 identified, we go through a process of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 identifying through a call for information
2 when the energy areas where potential lessees
3 say, well, we are interested in this area and
4 that area, and where the public comes back and
5 makes comments. And we put out kind of a
6 public opportunity of comment on the actual
7 area that might be offered for lease.

8 Once we actually develop the lease
9 proposal, that will also go out for public
10 notice. I think that one is going to get 45
11 days of notice before the lease sell is held.

12 Then, we actually issue the leases.

13 As I mentioned before, they convey
14 the right for the successful lessee to pursue
15 and propose a project and to present a plan
16 for a project, but there is no guarantee that
17 the project will be able to proceed or that it
18 will proceed in a way that the developer
19 suggests. And at that point, we would go into
20 a full EIS.

21 So, in sum, we try to involve the
22 government, the stakeholders, the tribes, the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 locals, the state, federal agencies, and get
2 them to the table thinking about the issues
3 early and provide the information that they
4 might have.

5 We try to involve the public
6 through these listening sessions and through
7 comment in these areas. The document is
8 described. We identify possible leasing
9 areas, conduct appropriate levels of
10 environmental review, and, then, as we narrow,
11 we get to an actual lease area where a lease
12 will be offered.

13 So, we are in the very first stages
14 in most of the states of the process. A lot
15 of people maps with blocks on them already,
16 but what we are finding is that the public
17 reacts to those as though they were oil and
18 gas leasing maps, you know, that we are
19 actually offering these blocks right now.

20 So, I think it has been a little
21 confusing for people, and we are trying to be
22 a little clearer in our documents and in our

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 presentations that these maps do not yet
2 propose specific leases and leasing areas, or
3 anything like that, or lease sales or
4 anything. And, then, we are not going to
5 permit development until we have had a full
6 review of individual projects and any
7 evidence.

8 The task force states are mostly in
9 the Atlantic right now, but Oregon, Hawaii,
10 and in the West and mostly North and Mid-
11 Atlantic are active right now because that is
12 where the best wind is.

13 BOEMRE, as you know, is responsible
14 for offshore energy in most areas from three
15 miles out to the Exclusive Economic Zone
16 really off 200 miles. Our energy management
17 includes both oil and gas and renewables. And
18 the Energy Policy Act of 2005 impact that
19 transferred, made clear that the Minerals
20 Management Service, now BOEMRE, would be
21 managing this renewable energy. It says that
22 we need to consider uses, including fisheries.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 So, it is actually specifically mentioned as
2 something that is important for us to do and
3 do correctly.

4 This is a general feel for the
5 resource itself. You will see, looking
6 onshore, you can see the little dots and
7 specks of wind potential in higher mountain
8 areas. Compare that to the wind potential in
9 the offshore jurisdictionally. Obviously,
10 there is a consolidated jurisdiction in the
11 offshore. So, it is much easier for a
12 developer to work with a single right-of-way
13 issuer and with the agencies than with all the
14 different owners and jurisdictions onshore.

15 So, between the quality of the
16 resource and the fact that there are many
17 fewer parties to deal with as far as ownership
18 and transmission, and such, it is an
19 attractive area for investors to consider.

20 Further, the states on the East
21 Coast have been very excited about renewables.

22 They have renewable portfolio standards and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 greenhouse gas initiatives and such where they
2 are concentrating on offshore on renewables
3 development, and offshore tends to be really
4 the best option that they have got for
5 renewables. So, they tend to look offshore.
6 They are excited about it.

7 Secretary Salazar initiated Smart
8 from the Start in November and said let's try
9 to consolidate this process; let's try to make
10 sure other federal agencies are involved. He
11 created an Interagency Working Group. He said
12 let's eliminate unnecessary steps, try to
13 create a logical flow toward consideration of
14 both leases and eventually development, and
15 let's establish Wind Energy Areas rather than
16 reacting to multiple proposals from
17 developers, which obviously is a CMSP-like
18 idea to try to identify the appropriate areas
19 that have high potential and the most
20 manageable conflicts, rather than just letting
21 the development really decide the areas that
22 we ought to be paying attention to.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Cape Wind, which people know by
2 reputation at least, was preexistent in this
3 process that the Energy Policy Act (EPAct)
4 transferred to the Minerals Management Service
5 and was done under different rules, and was
6 grandfathered, effectively, by Congress in the
7 EPAct. So, it was different from the examples
8 of what we are doing right now.

9 Wind Energy Areas is probably the
10 biggest distinction. We will still accept
11 proposals from outside Wind Energy Areas, but
12 it won't be as high priority. Our real
13 priority is to try to figure out the best
14 areas and, then, consider leasing and
15 eventually development of those areas.

16 So, we targeted, for instance, in
17 February of last year, the Secretary announced
18 -- actually, that should be February of this
19 year -- announced the Wind Energy Areas in the
20 Mid-Atlantic. And those are, again, not
21 leasing areas. Those are areas where we are
22 beginning to narrow to what is the appropriate

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 areas that we would offer for a lease.

2 So, these are the areas where
3 agencies and the public can begin to say,
4 okay, well, rather than looking at the entire
5 offshore, we have got a smaller place to look
6 at and to consider the conflicts and the
7 issues.

8 Site characterization and site
9 assessment is going to include these kinds of
10 activities. I am not going to go through the
11 list. But these are things that the developer
12 is going to have to do that will have some
13 impacts.

14 These are the kinds of things where
15 NOAA, NMFS, the fisheries community will first
16 engage in the actual impacts of possible
17 development. This is where the developer is
18 going out trying to figure out the engineering
19 and the construction plan for an individual
20 project, and, obviously, some impacts that
21 need to be considered ahead of time, and in
22 some cases things that are permanent, in some

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 cases things that are not, but obviously
2 things that we want to be looking at the
3 Environmental Impacts Zone and user conflicts.

4 Some of the first places where we
5 will do consultation on site assessment plans
6 and eventually on construction/operations
7 plans as well, obviously, things that are
8 important in this room, but there is a number
9 of others as well.

10 We do have a good study effort and
11 research projects going on right now. A
12 couple of them that were mentioned a little
13 earlier.

14 We are trying to cooperate with
15 other agencies to look at the opportunities
16 for coordinated research for the development
17 data, trying to build a Multipurpose Marine
18 Cadastre in close cooperation with NOAA, and
19 trying to advance science and rely on good
20 science in this process as well, which is, as
21 Leah will mention, one of the main things we
22 need to do to respect CMSP.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 This is just to quickly show kind
2 of a real laundry list of the public
3 stakeholder involvement opportunities. It is
4 pretty small type. I am not going to go
5 through it line by line, but there are
6 multiple bites at the apple for formal
7 comments besides the informal opportunities
8 and the opportunities through other
9 governmental stakeholders and the state task
10 forces.

11 So, we are trying to build a
12 process that is very responsive to public
13 concerns and public interest. For instance,
14 when the question of Exclusion Areas came up
15 for wind arrays, I don't think we have decided
16 at all what kind of exclusions, if any, there
17 ought to be and how they ought to be managed.

18 The European example might not be what we use
19 here, and we need to work on figuring that
20 kind of thing out.

21 So, we will do that through these
22 kinds of processes, and we will be able to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 hear people's ideas. And we will be able to
2 get formal comments as well.

3 So, thank you very much.

4 And, Leah, why don't you go ahead
5 and try to go through?

6 MS. RUSSIN: Okay.

7 MR. FARQUHAR: We will take
8 questions at the end.

9 CHAIR McCARTY: How long do you
10 guys have? When do you have to take off?

11 MR. FARQUHAR: We ought to leave a
12 little before 3:00.

13 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. Go ahead.

14 MR. FARQUHAR: But, actually, Leah
15 was saying she wouldn't mind missing the
16 plane.

17 (Laughter.)

18 MS. RUSSIN: So you have already
19 gotten a little bit of an overview on CMSP and
20 a lot of you are very familiar with it. But
21 what I was asked to do, and thought might be
22 helpful, would be to try to orient you with

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CMSP and some of the projects that we are
2 doing at BOEMRE, like the Smart from the Start
3 Initiative that Ned just talked about and our
4 Multipurpose Marine Cadastre, which our people
5 are developing jointly with NOAA's people, so
6 as to build a robust database with layers of
7 mapping. And I will show you what that is.

8 Okay. So, CMSP is from the
9 Executive Order, the President's Executive
10 Order, and the recommendations of the National
11 Oceans Commission. It is this comprehensive,
12 adaptive, integrated, stakeholder-driven
13 process. Some people think of it a little bit
14 as zoning the oceans. Some people don't like
15 to think of it that way.

16 But the idea is to get a whole lot
17 of information about how the oceans are used
18 and use that information to better manage the
19 oceans going forward. That is particularly
20 important for an entity like BOEMRE, which is
21 bringing a new use to the ocean on top of a
22 number of existing, robust uses, as well as a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 number of existing, but poorly-understood uses
2 like ecosystem services, which we are just
3 beginning to really understand fully or gather
4 that knowledge from the many stakeholders that
5 have it, and pull it into one area.

6 The goal of CMSP, as the goal of
7 our Smart from the Start Initiative, is to
8 reduce user conflict, understand user
9 conflict, reduce impacts of conflicting uses,
10 and facilitate compatible uses. So, for
11 example, the exclusion idea that, if you have
12 wind turbines, you can't have anything else.
13 Understanding, well, what does it mean to have
14 a bunch of wind turbines? Is that going to
15 interfere with radar on our ship? Is that
16 going to interfere with the ways that people
17 conduct fishing?

18 We can't know that until we learn
19 more about how the existing uses would
20 interfere, so that we can decide, well, maybe
21 if we require a developer to space their
22 turbines further apart, maybe we can minimize

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 those impacts and that process. Maybe we
2 can't, but we don't know unless we find out
3 the information. And, then, preserve the
4 critical ecosystem services, which include the
5 fisheries.

6 So, we have crowded oceans.

7 It came up bit by bit. Okay. So,
8 some of those are recognizable.

9 The CMSP framework guiding
10 principles are: be precautionary; learn what
11 you can; ecosystem-based management;
12 understand we have this current that comes
13 here that forms a natural ecosystem boundary
14 with that current that comes there. They mix
15 in this way, but not in others. How we do
16 take that information and use it to inform our
17 process?

18 Geographical scope. The CMSP that
19 is happening with the National Oceans Council
20 is both federal and state waters. What BOEMRE
21 is doing in Smart from the Start, we don't
22 have regulatory over state waters, regulatory

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 authority. We only have regulatory authority
2 over the Outer Continental Shelf, three miles
3 to the EEZ, as Ned had mentioned. We don't
4 have regulatory authority over the OCS of the
5 territories. So, we are not looking at doing
6 anything off the Virgin Islands right now.
7 Congress would have to give us some authority,
8 I think.

9 DR. DANA: What does OCF stand for?

10 MS. RUSSIN: Outer Continental
11 Shelf, "S". Sorry.

12 DR. DANA: "S".

13 MS. RUSSIN: The regional bodies
14 that have been mentioned, that is the CMSP
15 National Ocean Council. We imagine we will be
16 participating in that. That is the big
17 meeting in June and some of the stuff that was
18 discussed earlier today.

19 We have state-driven, or not state-
20 driven, but state-focused interstate
21 governmental task forces at BOEMRE. So, our
22 Smart from the Start Initiative has all the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 task forces within each state. Those will
2 inform the forthcoming regional bodies that
3 will be doing CMSP.

4 I guess I am foreshadowing myself a
5 little bit.

6 So, the regional planning bodies
7 will be created. Some of them I think are
8 already out there. We know who some of the
9 leads will be. We know who some of the
10 participants will be.

11 It is going to be this big, huge
12 planning process to bring stakeholders
13 together and figure out what to do with the
14 oceans. Federal agencies will be at the table
15 or are at the table. NOAA, as you heard, is
16 right there.

17 These are the nine regions, I
18 think, that are going to be the CMSP bodies.
19 As you can see, they are very different from
20 our stakeholder interstate task forces, which
21 right now shows eight states here. We have
22 got Oregon. We might have Hawaii soon. We

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 might have Florida soon. So, it is very
2 different than CMSP, but what we are doing is
3 fundamentally very similar.

4 So, you heard that this morning.

5 We have got the exercise which will
6 be at Interior this June. The Strategic
7 Action Plan and listening sessions going out
8 across the country, and you guys have
9 information on how to participate in that
10 through your FACA.

11 This is another example of a CMSP-
12 type process that was driven by the State of
13 Rhode Island. Rhode Island decided to get
14 ahead of the game and really gather a lot of
15 information about the use of its coastal
16 waters. That information was plugged into
17 this mapping tool that they, then, provided to
18 BOEMRE to use in the interstate task force
19 that they formed with us.

20 And we ended doing a joint task
21 force with Massachusetts because of the
22 geography, so that we could talk about the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 area off Rhode Island including south of Cape
2 Code, because it affected both states equally.

3 And so, this data that was gathered
4 through two years of task force meetings
5 within the State of Rhode Island, the fishing
6 community, the ecosystem services people, the
7 marine biologists, all the users of the ocean
8 coastal communities, the tourism industry,
9 that data as well as the hydrogeology was very
10 useful to us in having some basic information
11 to start from when we pulled together our
12 interstate governmental task force.

13 So, Multipurpose Marine Cadastre,
14 this is something that was mandated by EAct,
15 the Energy Policy Act of 2005. The Congress
16 directed the Department of the Interior and
17 NOAA to work together to prepare this mapping
18 tool. And it is exactly that. It is not a
19 decision tool. It is a decision information
20 tool.

21 So, we get information from NOAA on
22 where critical fisheries habitat is. We can

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 plug that in as a layer into a map. We can
2 also plug in where transportation separation
3 is being maintained by the Coast Guard. So,
4 we know where the big ships are going and
5 where they are not going.

6 We can plug in where, if we were in
7 Florida, where the coral reefs are. Some of
8 the mapping data that was shown earlier today
9 about the Sanctuary here, that looked a lot
10 like the type of information that we are
11 plugging into our Multipurpose Marine
12 Cadastre.

13 So, the idea is that we gather
14 reliable data. We have, hopefully, an ability
15 to assess that data because a mapping tool is
16 only as good as your data. However, right now
17 we are still in the gathering phase. So, some
18 of our data is better than others. Some of it
19 is more rigorous. Some of it has been more
20 peer-reviewed. But we are putting it in there
21 so that it can inform our decisionmaking.

22 It is for screening level, the more

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 robust the data, the more useful it is to
2 decisionmaking at this stage because our data
3 is not the end-all be-all. We are using it to
4 inform a process, so that we can exclude some
5 areas, keep some other areas in.

6 It is a tool to quickly decide this
7 is the best fishing habitat off Cape Code.
8 So, that really would not so much be the first
9 choice for a low-user conflict area to go with
10 wind. That is the kind of decisionmaking you
11 can do with this tool.

12 Also, it is a way to share maps
13 with others. So that, when you guys say, "So,
14 where are you thinking of going and what have
15 you looked at", we can tell you what
16 information we have, so that you can, then,
17 figure out, well, shoot, I know about all this
18 other stuff here; can I bring that information
19 to you?

20 These are the layers that we have.
21 We can put in the jurisdictional boundaries
22 to understand which communities we need to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 talk to, what federal agencies have an equity
2 in the area, so that we make sure we bring in
3 the right players. For example, the Army
4 Corps of Engineers has a lot to talk about
5 when you talk about Outer Continental Shelf
6 and energy. The Coast Guard certainly has a
7 lot to talk about. DoD has a lot to talk
8 about.

9 Figure out what the geology of the
10 area is, the marine infrastructure, habitats,
11 the diversity, who's out there already, is
12 this a great windsurfing area, in addition to
13 commercial and recreational fishing.

14 This is a page out of it. I wanted
15 to show you what it actually looked like. So,
16 this is the Channel Islands off of California.

17 This should look familiar to the gentleman
18 right there, hopefully.

19 So, this shows us some of the data.

20 So, this is another Sanctuary, a Marine
21 Sanctuary, in the Channel Islands. There is
22 another one up here.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 And that enables us to say, okay,
2 that is an area that the federal government
3 has decided is going to be a low-impact area.

4 Let's go find out more.

5 Also, offshore-California we have
6 just finished, not we, the State has just
7 finished rolling out a series of Marine
8 Protected Areas under State law, working from
9 the south up to the north coast. We will be
10 able to plug that data in as well, and that
11 will also inform our process.

12 These are some of the sources of
13 where we get data. I know it is really small
14 type, but I think the idea is to show you that
15 we get our data from a lot of people. And
16 NOAA is in here. So, our Marine Sanctuaries
17 are here, the monuments.

18 I didn't know this, but BLM
19 maintains a coastal monument all the way up
20 and down the coast of California. I had no
21 idea of that. So, we get data from BLM on
22 that as well.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Data sources, here are some of the
2 agencies we talk to in the federal family.
3 The Renewable Energy Lab gathers data and gets
4 that to us. And that goes into our Marine
5 Cadastre.

6 And, then, there is information
7 that we still need. We know we don't have as
8 robust data as we would like. So, to go down
9 the list quickly, since it looks like you
10 can't see, marine mammals is a big hole,
11 partly because we don't know a lot. So, that
12 is an area to identify some more information.

13 Turtle data, avian data, this is
14 going to be very big. We know from onshore
15 that turbines can have big impacts with birds.

16 We want to know more about the potential user
17 conflict offshore.

18 Geospatial-intelligence with the
19 Navy, we will be talking to the Navy.

20 State planning data. So, for
21 example, Rhode Island, that was a big chunk
22 that was helpful. Some other states may have

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 similar information.

2 So, those are just some examples of
3 the kind of things we get and that we need
4 more of.

5 Coming soon, we are going to be
6 improving our datasets. We are going to try
7 to make the user interface a little bit
8 more easy, user-friendly, so that you guys can
9 go on. People who are advising people outside
10 of BOEMRE can go in, figure out what we have,
11 what we don't have, and provide input to our
12 process as well as other processes at NOAA.

13 Links to decision support tools.
14 There are a number of CMSP decision support
15 tools already out there. We would like to be
16 able to integrate with them, make their
17 datasets more robust and piggyback off of what
18 they have.

19 I'm sorry, was there a question?

20 CHAIR McCARTY: No, someone is just
21 on the phone.

22 MS. RUSSIN: Oh, sorry.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 So, about the interagency
2 coordination that has been discussed a little
3 bit, we have existing MOUs now with the
4 Department of Energy, Fish and Wildlife
5 Service, and NOAA. Again, that link should be
6 on our website, boemre.gov. And it does have
7 a section on renewable energy, about how we
8 will work together more efficiently with NOAA
9 and BOEMRE on the renewable energy piece.

10 We do have NOAA representatives at
11 all of our intergovernmental task forces. One
12 of the outcomes of this meeting today, I hope,
13 for me personally will be that I now have some
14 names and faces to take back and say, "Okay,
15 we're having another task force meeting. Who
16 do you have coming? Is there any information
17 that I need to make sure they have? How do we
18 get feedback after the meeting, that sort of
19 thing? We would like to make our facilitation
20 of communication a little bit more robust with
21 a few other entities.

22 We are also still working through

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 some things with FERC. We have an MOU with
2 FERC. But with FERC, it is a little
3 interesting because, when it comes to
4 hydrokinetic energy, wave energy, tidal
5 energy, or underwater turbines to capture
6 ocean currents, FERC has the licensing power,
7 but we retain the leasing authority.

8 So, we would issue, as we are
9 considering doing, a lease to Florida
10 University to study whether the Florida
11 current can be captured for energy. But if
12 that moves forward, to get past just the
13 interim lease stage to an actual commercially-
14 viable project, that project would ultimately
15 be permitted by FERC.

16 So, we are still working through
17 that. We don't have any of those up and
18 running yet. So, when we do, when we get
19 there, we will be working closely with FERC to
20 make that go as smoothly as possible with a
21 robust public process.

22 Just another example, again, of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 some of our space-use conflicts in mapping.
2 So, you can see what it looks like. This is a
3 vessel tripper port. It is somewhere in the
4 Northeast, but I don't know exactly where.
5 But we had this vessel go out and report back
6 on where all the fishing was, and that, then,
7 gets plugged into our own Marine Cadastre.

8 And I think that's it.

9 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you.

10 MS. LOVETT: We are going to bring
11 a couple of chairs around to you. So, you are
12 going to sit this way to answer questions.

13 MS. RUSSIN: Okay. That works.

14 MS. LOVETT: Sorry.

15 MS. RUSSIN: No, no problem.

16 CHAIR McCARTY: My question is to
17 either one of you. I am having a little
18 trouble understanding the jurisdictional
19 issues and the sort of legal background for
20 the decisionmaking.

21 And I understand you have the
22 leasing authority for offshore energy areas.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 And so, when you talk to other agencies such
2 as NOAA, that is a consultative kind of
3 process? There is no actual jurisdictional
4 ability at NOAA to say no or yes or anything
5 like that? I mean I am oversimplifying it, of
6 course.

7 MS. RUSSIN: Sure. Sure.

8 CHAIR McCARTY: But I just want to
9 try to understand the process a little bit
10 better from the jurisdictional authority point
11 of view.

12 MS. RUSSIN: Sure.

13 Do you want to take that?

14 MR. FARQUHAR: The jurisdiction
15 resides with BOEMRE to permit. Now NOAA and
16 NMFS have their own permits that they issue
17 separately for some types of activities. But
18 that is for harassment, or whatever.

19 So, those, obviously, we try to
20 post the ones that we are aware of, but NOAA
21 plays the same role in our processes, or the
22 Coast Guard, or whatever, where we are hearing

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 advice about what ought to happen out there,
2 and we are trying to make sure that we respect
3 the conflicts that can't be managed and manage
4 the conflicts that can. So, it is very much
5 of a consultation.

6 Is that fair?

7 CHAIR McCARTY: Yes. The Coastal
8 and Marine Spatial Planning process is over
9 here, and your process is over here. And the
10 juxtaposition of those, can you talk a little
11 bit more about the juxtaposition --

12 MS. RUSSIN: Sure.

13 CHAIR McCARTY: -- of the Coastal
14 and Marine Spatial Planning with your process?

15 MS. RUSSIN: Sure.

16 CHAIR McCARTY: That is another
17 part I don't quite get yet.

18 MS. RUSSIN: Sure. They are
19 separate, but they are very closely related.
20 The easiest way to describe it is Coastal and
21 Marine Spatial Planning, capital C-M-S-P, now
22 means a specific process authorized by the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Executive Order, as recommended, blah, blah,
2 blah.

3 But the regional planning, that is
4 going to happen, but it is on a slower
5 timeframe than Smart from the Start. Smart
6 from the Start is an Administration priority
7 to stand up renewable energy, including the
8 offshore and Great Lakes.

9 And so, the idea of CMSP is based
10 on the fundamentals of ecosystem-based
11 management and community/stakeholder process-
12 driven decisionmaking with adaptive
13 management. Those underpinnings with CMSP are
14 the same underpinnings for our
15 intergovernmental task forces, and the data
16 that we generate will feed into the CMSP
17 Initiative.

18 And so, I view them as
19 complementary. It would be great if CMSP had
20 been done 10 years ago, but it wasn't, so that
21 we could have that to inform us. Instead, it
22 is going to be the other way around.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 But it shouldn't be viewed as that
2 the two processes conflict with each other.
3 If we do our job right, what we are doing with
4 Smart from the Start is identifying the low-
5 hanging fruit in terms of locations.

6 When you talk to people who lived
7 through the onshore solar deployment in the
8 desert Southwest, the No. 1 most important
9 criteria in determining whether a project is
10 going to be successful, whether it is going to
11 be built, whether it is going to get funded,
12 whether it is going to be a useful part of the
13 economic viability of the area, is siting.

14 We are trying to learn from that
15 and choose the places where we can make good
16 siting decisions, low user conflict, so that
17 we actually have a chance of not running the
18 gauntlet of litigation for two decades, but we
19 can steel in the water.

20 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. Thank you.
21 That is very helpful.

22 I know there are lots of other

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 questions. Do you want to just call on
2 people?

3 MR. FARQUHAR: Let's start right
4 here.

5 MS. MORRIS: So, you said that you
6 were establishing Wind Energy Areas based on
7 high wind potential and lowest probable
8 conflict. So, what criteria or data are you
9 using to determine the lowest probable
10 conflict?

11 MR. FARQUHAR: The question about
12 how we judge conflict is a state-by-state
13 initiative. So, a lot of it depends on the
14 quality of information we are able to generate
15 in that state context.

16 For instance, Rhode Island SAMP we
17 had described a little bit -- I think they
18 spent \$8 or \$9 million doing research and
19 accessing databases and compiling things.
20 They had a lot of stakeholder involvement.

21 Plus, as we used to say in Alaska,
22 it is a state the size of a glacier. So, it

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 is not that big as far as the challenge of
2 trying to figure out a great area for wind.

3 So, in that case, good data,
4 relatively-good data, and good public
5 involvement started moving toward adoption of
6 a plan, I think it was in October of 2010.

7 Other states the information level
8 is much more primitive. So, it really depends
9 on what is available and who is at the table.

10 In Maryland, we put out a very
11 preliminary, what is called a Request for
12 Interest, which isn't even required under the
13 rules. But it is an early opportunity to say
14 here's kind of a general area we're looking
15 at.

16 In addition, that announcement, it
17 is a pretty small area; I think it was 30-some
18 blocks that were 3x3. So, that is not a huge
19 area. And, really, you could put a wind
20 project or two in an area like that and
21 probably a total of 1,000 megawatts, is what I
22 am guessing for that kind of area, if you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 figure that some of the area is not going to
2 be usable.

3 We said in the RFI, the Request for
4 Interest, there are concerns because we don't
5 really have data yet about navigation. We
6 know that there are navigation concerns. So,
7 this thing goes out public, and the navigation
8 community, sure as heck, came back with the
9 data very quickly because there are a lot of
10 areas in there where they are shipping up and
11 down the coast and overseas as well.

12 So, these announcements of an RFI,
13 Request for Interest area, or for a call area,
14 are going to generate tremendous response and
15 information as well.

16 So, we are not at the point yet in
17 any case of knowing the area we want to lease
18 because we have not yet gone through that
19 process fully in any case. We are trying to
20 do a good job, if we can, of making people
21 aware and getting their comments back both
22 formally and informally on the areas we ought

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to be avoiding or have a condition.

2 Does that answer your question?

3 MS. MORRIS: It sounds like it is
4 going to be a state-by-state process and you
5 are going to go ahead and request, put out a
6 Request for Information if you feel like you
7 don't have enough information on the lowest
8 possible conflict --

9 MR. FARQUHAR: Yes.

10 MS. MORRIS: -- part of it. But
11 you don't have a set of criteria that you are
12 going to apply in every state?

13 MR. FARQUHAR: No. We are not
14 saying you have to have "X" amount of
15 information, or whatever, because we are just
16 trying to find the best areas and get them up
17 for people's awareness. Because we don't have
18 standard information, so it is different in
19 different places.

20 And looking at the regional
21 Environmental Assessment for the Mid-Atlantic,
22 we know there is regional issues as well as

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 environmental, in particular, that we ought to
2 be looking at. And so, in some cases we are
3 able to get regional data and regional
4 information, and try to assemble that as well
5 state by state.

6 We will go ahead here, and, then,
7 we will come here. Go ahead.

8 MR. WALLACE: I guess I want to
9 make two comments. The first one is that for
10 the list of the states that are involved, the
11 Coastal Zone Management folks are the people
12 who are involved. They actually don't have
13 anything to do with the federal zoning. They
14 have to do with the intersection between the
15 water and the land. So, I think you have got
16 the wrong folks, first.

17 In Massachusetts, Nantucket Shoals
18 is a classic example of how fisheries wasn't
19 considered at all and shipping wasn't
20 considered at all. The people who would like
21 to build windmills want to build them where
22 they are the easiest to build, the closest to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 populations, because it is all about dollars
2 to them.

3 And they are only going to want to
4 charge 18 or 20 cents a kilowatt hour and,
5 also, get another 4 cents rebate in a tax
6 rebate, which is three times what I pay for
7 electricity in Maryland now. And so, we just
8 sort of wonder what the logic is.

9 But, in Massachusetts, the Coastal
10 Zone folks blocked out this whole huge area.
11 It took them a couple of hundred million
12 dollars worth of scallops that are a renewable
13 energy.

14 I am going to give you a real quick
15 example of why we are going to have an
16 Exclusion Zone. There is weather right out
17 here and there is a Northeaster blowing, and
18 there is an oil barge and a tug, and the tug
19 has it under tow. It has 1,000 feet of wire
20 out. And he is running downwind. And the tug
21 is just barely keeping in front of the barge.

22 The barge is on one side, and there is a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 windmill on this side. Guess where it is
2 going to end?

3 You are going to turn the barge
4 over. You are going to turn the tug over.
5 You are going to rupture the barge and it is
6 going to dump all this stuff in the Atlantic
7 Ocean. There is going to be a huge hue and
8 cry over it.

9 So, they are going to say, well,
10 you have to stay at least three-quarters of a
11 mile off of those areas, so that we reduce
12 that possible problem. And it is logical that
13 you would do that.

14 We in the commercial fishing
15 industry have been told, "If the government
16 doesn't do it, your insurance policy is going
17 to say you have to stay out there because we
18 are not going to be responsible for you
19 damaging an unmanned platform."

20 And the other thing is, then, there
21 is a huge terrorist threat because they are
22 unmanned platforms. If you want to go blow

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 things up, they would be like perfect things
2 to blow up because there is nobody around to
3 pay attention.

4 So, your blocks came out. They
5 went into the shipping lanes. You just do not
6 bind the shipping lanes. But, then, you went
7 down into the separation zones for the New-
8 York-to-Boston in both corners. It goes down
9 to Nantucket, and then it goes from
10 north/south to east/west. And if you had
11 granted those, we would have windmills
12 literally in the shipping lanes.

13 And, then, the thing that makes me
14 the most unhappy was -- and I chair the New
15 England Habitat Advisory Committee. Nantucket
16 Shoals is designated as an environmentally-
17 sensitive place. And so, it is protected.
18 So, there is no fishing there by regulations.

19 But what you don't know is that was
20 supposed to actually be in the Bay South
21 Channel, the deep water where all the fish
22 are, and the fishermen put up enough political

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 pressure that they moved it up on Nantucket
2 Shoals.

3 Nantucket Shoals has a lot of
4 shellfish on it, but it hasn't been fished.
5 So, if you use your formula, well, there is
6 nothing going on there. Therefore, the impact
7 is negligible.

8 The fact of the matter is that the
9 New England Fisheries Management Council in
10 the next short period of time is going to lift
11 a lot of those closed areas which fishing is
12 not permitted in. And so, then, your formula
13 without fisheries' input is all distorted
14 because you are using Coastal Zone Management
15 folks.

16 And, then, the other thing on the
17 Nantucket Shoals, when the fishing industry
18 actually found out about it, they made so much
19 noise to their Senators and Congressmen that,
20 then, you reduced the blocks down in southern
21 Massachusetts by a third or 50 percent.
22 Because, all of a sudden, you did hear from

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 the people who are the most impacted.

2 And one more point about
3 stakeholder input. I don't consider NEPA a
4 good stakeholder input vehicle because
5 somebody sits down or a whole team of people
6 sit down and write this thing, and they do as
7 much research on the most topics as they can.

8 But I keep trying to find out when
9 these original stakeholder meetings are going
10 to be. I usually find out after they have
11 happened because I don't read The Federal
12 Register every day, and I probably should.

13 And most of the people, because if
14 you look at then who showed up, most of them
15 are the people who want permits to build these
16 things. And so, they are stakeholders, I
17 agree. But the people who are going to be
18 negatively impacted don't necessarily even
19 know that they are taking place.

20 MR. FARQUHAR: Well, we are now
21 going to try to answer everything that you
22 just raised.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 (Laughter.)

2 But you should keep a list, and,
3 then, after we finish, remind us of the things
4 that we didn't answer.

5 So, I think, first, Cape Wind,
6 Nantucket Shoals, like I said, is an example
7 of a developer proposing something, not of us
8 trying to sit down and identify an area ahead
9 of time. And it was done under a direct
10 process --

11 MR. WALLACE: Cape Wind is not the
12 one I am talking about.

13 MR. FARQUHAR: I'm sorry.

14 MR. WALLACE: I am talking about
15 the one south of Nantucket, not north of
16 Nantucket.

17 MR. FARQUHAR: Oh, okay. Okay.

18 So, the same thing about the
19 composition of the state task forces. I think
20 all state agencies are welcome. We do tend to
21 say to the Governor's office, "Just make sure
22 you have the right agencies there." And very

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 often, they choose the Suzy-M.-type people to
2 attend, but it is okay since we are seeing
3 fisheries people or you get the ports
4 authority, or whoever it might be, showing up
5 as well. A lot of State parks, a lot of State
6 DNRs are showing up.

7 So, we are welcoming that, and we
8 are certainly not trying to narrow it to a
9 single representative of the state, or
10 anything like that. Because it is actually a
11 totally bona fide effort to get the best
12 information we can.

13 So, if you have ideas of people who
14 ought to be there, I think that would be
15 great. And if you can convince them that they
16 ought to come, then they are totally welcome.

17 I think we also are trying to
18 convene these state-level task forces in a way
19 where -- and Leah can talk a little more about
20 this -- where we are hearing from non-
21 governmental stakeholders as well. We are
22 having these listening sessions and such. It

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 is very valuable.

2 The Massachusetts example of the
3 RFI that we did there, it showed the processes
4 are working from my perspective. And it is
5 not because there was congressional pressure
6 -- in fact, I don't remember congressional
7 pressure -- to drop areas out of that proposed
8 RFI area.

9 That was an example of a state task
10 force saying, let's go ahead and throw it out
11 for the public to look at, a large map that
12 has a lot of areas, and get the most feedback
13 we can.

14 We heard a lot about scalloping,
15 especially in the eastern end of that RFI, as
16 I recall. It was compared to a West Highland
17 Terrier, that area. It looked like terrier,
18 and there was a lot of scallops in the tail,
19 in the back legs of the terrier.

20 Right now, we are moving toward a
21 significant reduction when we go with a call
22 for information. The next step, which is

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 still short of leasing because we are still
2 getting information -- what we did, that
3 succeeded in getting public awareness. It
4 didn't succeed in the message that we are not
5 leasing yet, but it did succeed in getting a
6 heck of a lot of good information about it.

7 So, I think it is a good effort to
8 try to gather that kind of information. I
9 think people ought to have some confidence
10 that we are able to get information by all
11 these different avenues we are going through.

12 The last comment I would make
13 before Leah starts, and to make sure we get to
14 the rest of the things, is when I went up to
15 the New England Council meeting a month ago,
16 or whatever, Karen Roy and the group there
17 said, "We will be a distribution point."
18 Because nobody reads The Federal Register,
19 you're right. I am not trying to make it
20 sound like everybody ought to read The Federal
21 Register.

22 So, we need to keep finding ways to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 get the word out to people who aren't
2 represented on the state task forces about
3 what steps we are going through and where
4 information is available and when they can
5 make a comment, and what they are being asked
6 to comment about.

7 So, for instance, Karen is now the
8 distribution point, a distribution for us to
9 be able to say we can get information to a lot
10 of people by making sure we include Karen Roy
11 on an email.

12 If you have other people that you
13 want to receive information about a state or a
14 region, we are totally happy to try to make
15 sure they are on the early end of getting the
16 information about what we need to hear back.

17 Go ahead.

18 CHAIR McCARTY: Leah, can I
19 interrupt you just for a minute?

20 I am trying to manage the very
21 little time that you have left.

22 MS. RUSSIN: Sure.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIR McCARTY: And I don't want to
2 spend it all on a rebuttal kind of thing.

3 MR. FARQUHAR: Yes.

4 CHAIR McCARTY: So, I think I am
5 going to ask, unless you have some burning
6 answers or comments --

7 MS. RUSSIN: Well, I do want to say
8 that some of the data on when our meetings are
9 is on our website. On the left hand side when
10 you go to boemre.gov, on the left side it has
11 got Renewable Energy as one of the click-on
12 buttons.

13 One of the things that I am working
14 on getting us to do is actually putting up
15 calendars, so you can see it. But we have
16 press releases announcing every one when they
17 come up to the newsroom that is on there as
18 well. And you can find out when they are if
19 you scan through those.

20 One of the "to be done soon" should
21 be a calendar that literally just shows you
22 and, also, a link for you to get on a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 listserv, an email list, to find out about
2 them.

3 But we do rely on the state to
4 figure out which people they want there, too.
5 That is just how it works.

6 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you.

7 MS. RUSSIN: We can't tell them who
8 to bring.

9 CHAIR McCARTY: So, let's take a
10 couple more comments before you have to
11 disappear.

12 MR. FARQUHAR: We have one here,
13 and, then, let's go back around.

14 MR. DYSKOW: They are both short.

15 Do you believe that these zones
16 will have a similar level of saturation to
17 what we see in wind farms on land? Is that
18 what we are talking about, that level of wind-
19 generator density?

20 MR. FARQUHAR: There are all kinds
21 of onshore densities, you know, from Altamont,
22 which is elbow to elbow, and the industry is

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 tending to move to farther spacing with larger
2 turbines. And especially offshore, I think it
3 is likely that this spacing will be, what I
4 have heard is a mile, I think.

5 MR. DYSKOW: Okay. So, nothing
6 like a land-based wind farm?

7 MR. FARQUHAR: I don't think it
8 will be the same. They are talking about 5-,
9 10-, 15-megawatt turbines in the next --

10 MR. DYSKOW: So, how big will these
11 zones be, then? What kind of spacing?

12 MR. FARQUHAR: Probably -- what? --
13 nine or ten blocks per 500 to 1,000 megawatts,
14 depending on what the other issues are, is my
15 guess right now.

16 MR. DYSKOW: So, will a zone be 50
17 square miles, 100 square miles?

18 MR. FARQUHAR: Probably sort of in
19 the range of 50 to 100, eventually, for a
20 large wind farm --

21 MR. DYSKOW: Got it.

22 MR. FARQUHAR: -- I am guessing.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 That is really off the cuff.

2 MS. RUSSIN: And, remember, if we
3 designate a Wind Energy Area, it doesn't mean
4 that every inch is going to have windmills in
5 it. It just means that those are the areas
6 where if somebody applies for lease for part
7 of it, they will get priority over somebody
8 who applies for a lease further away that is
9 in the middle of a high fishing area.

10 MR. DYSKOW: Right. So, the
11 purpose of all this was multi-use is a
12 possibility --

13 MR. FARQUHAR: Yes.

14 MR. DYSKOW: -- because of the
15 density being as low --

16 MR. FARQUHAR: Yes. Exactly. And
17 a lot of the developers are saying, "We think
18 we are going to apply to lease a larger area
19 than we need to because we know there are
20 going to be places where there are different
21 concerns," archeological, ecological,
22 fisheries, whatever it might be, navigation,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 where we are going to need to work around
2 issues within the leasing process.

3 Go ahead.

4 MR. RAFTICAN: Transmission locks
5 are going to be important, subsurface, above
6 the surface. Is that included in the
7 Blueprint?

8 MR. FARQUHAR: Yes. Any
9 application for a project is going to have to
10 have all the transmission included. Most of
11 the early developers are going to look at
12 direct ties onshore. So, they will come
13 through the federal zone into the in-state
14 shores that is controlled by the state and,
15 then, the onshore as well.

16 And there are proposals for mutual
17 backbone transmission structures and such that
18 we are looking at as well, but I think it will
19 take a while to finance those. And those
20 probably aren't as imminent.

21 Does that answer your question?

22 MR. RAFTICAN: Yes, pretty much.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 You know, the other thing that
2 crosses my mind is there is a substantial
3 amount of power lost in every one of the
4 lines, too.

5 MR. FARQUHAR: People will often
6 talk about transmission being a problem
7 onshore or offshore. In fact, if you are
8 trying to get renewables into New England, for
9 instance, there is probably significantly more
10 loss from hydro competitors, something that is
11 a further distance, depending on whether it is
12 an AC or DC line.

13 The regional backbone they are
14 talking about is going to be DC, and there is
15 almost zero transmission loss there. So, it
16 kind of depends on what the technology is and
17 such. There is no thumbnail really for the
18 transmission loss.

19 Go ahead.

20 MR. CLAMPITT: Well, I was just
21 kind of curious, I mean, how this pans out
22 with the discovery of all this natural gas we

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 have.

2 MR. FARQUHAR: Well, you know, that
3 is a huge issue. I think we are not in the
4 market of trying to price this stuff or do
5 your economics. The marketplace will do that.

6 The state BUCs, et cetera, will do that.

7 We are sort of in the role of, if
8 there is going to be a real estate decision
9 made that allows development in the offshores
10 and these resources are so fantastic as a
11 renewable, well, it ought to be done right,
12 and let's try to do it the right way. So, we
13 are not getting involved in the pricing issues
14 and things like that.

15 Go ahead.

16 DR. CHATWIN: So, my understanding
17 was that those areas that you identified on
18 the map already, your -- what do you call
19 it? -- Wind Energy Areas, all the areas that
20 you listed there are going to be used to
21 prioritize areas within those geographic
22 areas?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 MR. FARQUHAR: Among, yes, all the
2 different comments we get, that is sort of a
3 sample of --

4 DR. CHATWIN: Okay, and I know from
5 my experience with conservation planning and
6 the environment that, for each of those
7 datasets, there are decisions that need to be
8 made of what constitutes a high-priority area
9 and a low-priority area.

10 Those decisions are made by this
11 interstate panel? So, for example, if you
12 have Essential Fish Habitat, which was one
13 that was mentioned, and the Essential Fish
14 Habitat, you can either use the distribution
15 of adult fish or distribution of juvenile
16 fish, who makes those decisions? Is it this
17 task force? Or do you go to NOAA and request
18 them to prioritize those layers for you?

19 MS. RUSSIN: So, the decision on
20 what will be a Wind Energy Area and whether to
21 issue a lease within that area is made by
22 BOEMRE. But that decision is informed by the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 data and informed by the consultations with
2 NOAA and the others.

3 The task forces, the interstate
4 governmental task forces, interagency --
5 what's the right name?

6 MR. FARQUHAR: Interagency Working
7 Group.

8 MS. RUSSIN: The Interagency
9 Working Group, but it is all governmental,
10 that is an additional vehicle on top of NEPA
11 to feed additional information to BOEMRE or to
12 make a better decision.

13 And in terms of assessing what is
14 critical fish habitat and what is not, we have
15 some of our own biologists, but we are not
16 saying we are the best experts on this. That
17 is why we are getting data from NOAA. That is
18 why we are counting on the Regional Fisheries
19 Councils. That is why we are going to them
20 and asking them for their data, to inform our
21 process.

22 MR. FARQUHAR: And I think, in

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 addition, that we are working on protocols for
2 the federal agencies about what is
3 satisfactory in the way of information for the
4 eventual environmental documents, et cetera.
5 So, we are not going to have state-by-state
6 decisions about what is acceptable and what
7 isn't in the actual data and the science that
8 we need down the lane.

9 So, they are setting our target.
10 At the state level, they are talking about
11 their concerns. We are checking that back
12 with NOAA or Fish and Wildlife, or whatever
13 other agencies, as we try to see, is that
14 adequate? We don't want to be in a situation
15 where some state comes up with something and
16 we are going, what?

17 DR. CHATWIN: If I may just follow
18 up, with these areas, the management, these
19 areas of high fishing use, these are areas --
20 there are no layers out there, at least for
21 the public to see what is considered an area
22 of high fishing and what is not.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 If you gather such information, is
2 that information going to be listed
3 information there? It will be made available
4 to the public?

5 MR. FARQUHAR: Anything that we ask
6 for is public.

7 MS. RUSSIN: It's public.

8 DR. CHATWIN: Is it downloadable?

9 MS. RUSSIN: I don't know, but it
10 is an interface. It is like a web portal --

11 DR. CHATWIN: Interface is great
12 for visualization, but as you really need to
13 analyze and form an opinion on what you are
14 presenting, you have to make that information
15 available, so that we can work --

16 MR. FARQUHAR: Yes, that is the
17 kind of thing. I want to get more questions
18 in. I think that is the kind of thing we
19 might have NOAA and BOEMRE talking about it
20 because they are trying to build the same.

21 So, let's go over on this side a
22 little bit.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. RUSSIN: Did you get the
2 website? I flashed it in the middle. You can
3 go to the website and see if it meets what you
4 are talking about. I just don't know exactly
5 what you mean, but I think it is
6 marinecadastre.gov, or something. And you can
7 check it out and see if it does what you want.

8 And if it doesn't, let us know. We
9 can try to figure it out.

10 MR. FARQUHAR: Go ahead.

11 MR. CATES: A comment about one of
12 the biggest problems we have in this country
13 is let's not do it in our backyard. And I
14 have heard that a couple of times today, as we
15 are all sitting in the AC, the lights are on,
16 and we say, "Well, we're not going to have
17 offshore drilling."

18 The reality is we need more energy
19 and we need more seafood. And it is wrong for
20 our industry to say, "Don't affect our
21 fishing."

22 So, my advice, I have a couple of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 comments, opinions and advice for you folks.
2 One is try to include as many uses as you can
3 in that area, multi-use, instead of saying,
4 "This is our fence. Stay out."

5 And I have gone through this with
6 offshore aquaculture. I was the first company
7 in the U.S. to get a lease. So, I experienced
8 our own industry saying, "But not in our
9 backyard." And if you allow that, it helps.

10 And the only other concern I have
11 is, if you are a government agency that is
12 deciding on where these areas are going to be,
13 make sure you involve the industry that you
14 expect to be there as much as you can.
15 Because that happened to me, where both
16 federal and state government said, "Well,
17 great idea, but we are going to put you here."

18 And economically, it doesn't work there.

19 MR. FARQUHAR: We consult with them
20 in the same kind of process where they get to
21 come back and say how this is wrong. A lot of
22 times the state task force members are talking

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to the developers about where the developers
2 are interested.

3 Go ahead.

4 MR. JONER: I am going to follow up
5 Randy's thought. I am somebody who does want
6 it in the backyard.

7 MR. FARQUHAR: Well, it's nice to
8 meet you.

9 (Laughter.)

10 MR. JONER: I represent the Makah
11 Tribe in Washington State. They were
12 partnering with an applicant who wanted to put
13 in a pilot project for wave energies.
14 Unfortunately, we have the National Marine
15 Sanctuary there. And they put up so much
16 resistance that the people, the applicants,
17 just ran out of money and went away.

18 MR. FARQUHAR: Well, there are
19 places that you want to do it and places you
20 shouldn't. We are very clear about that.

21 But the point about energy that is
22 really important, in this country a lot of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 people bear energy effects. My mother grew up
2 in West Virginia in the coalfields. Everybody
3 on her side of the family died in their
4 fifties.

5 You know, New Mexico, where I
6 worked most recently, there are villages and
7 the Indian reservations and such that are
8 carrying a huge burden of producing energy for
9 the rest of this country.

10 So, being a political appointee who
11 works on energy issues across the board, I
12 exhort everyone in the country, you know,
13 remember that somebody is bearing an impact
14 somewhere for what you use in the way of
15 energy.

16 We need much more energy
17 efficiency. We need to do things right. We
18 need more domestic supplies, so we are not
19 subject to these crazy price spikes that
20 really debilitate the economy and cost jobs,
21 et cetera. So, we need a much more stable,
22 diversified energy economy.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 So, I tried to do that in a
2 microburst, and I apologize for wasting time
3 at the end of our session.

4 MR. JONER: And that was adjacent
5 to the Reservation and the tribe's
6 reservational waters. They would very much
7 like to see that developed. So, we need some
8 help bringing these different agencies
9 together.

10 MR. FARQUHAR: We are really trying
11 to find the right areas to do this, and to do
12 it right. So, your groups can play a huge
13 role in that. And if it is just the wrong
14 area, we need to know it and avoid it. But if
15 we can work it out, we are going to try to
16 work it out.

17 CHAIR McCARTY: We have Keith, who
18 has been waiting a long time. We have got
19 Martin, who has been waiting a while. And,
20 then, I think Billy wants to say something, if
21 he has time.

22 MR. FARQUHAR: So, in other words,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 three? I'm counting three. That's great.

2 MR. RIZZARDI: Ned, we thank you.
3 I learned a lot from your presentations.

4 I notice that your program is very
5 comprehensive. You are really trying to
6 assemble and consolidate the statutory
7 responsibilities and all the information. And
8 I appreciate that its whole focus is to get it
9 right from the beginning, but we have also
10 learned that people make mistakes. Disasters
11 are going to happen.

12 One of the big lessons we learned
13 from BP is how to plan or else you are going
14 to wait for weeks for the top hat to get
15 constructed or for the junk shop that doesn't
16 work.

17 What I didn't see in this
18 presentation was any addressing of risk
19 assessment, disaster planning, or disaster
20 response. Where does that fit?

21 MR. FARQUHAR: That will probably
22 be mostly in the context of these

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 environmental documents, as we do this
2 regional and state-by-state Environmental
3 Assessments, looking at the leasing, and then
4 in the Environmental Impact Statements.

5 You know, we went through the Gulf
6 spill. I am tremendously scarred from it
7 personally, but, obviously, there are other
8 people that have much huger issues than I do.

9 But we are aware that we need to do
10 a really good job of that.

11 MR. RIZZARDI: So, you are
12 envisioning it coming out of the NEPA process
13 or the Endangered Species Act process?

14 MR. FARQUHAR: NEPA.

15 MR. RIZZARDI: NEPA?

16 MS. RUSSIN: So, some of this stuff
17 is part of the construction and operation
18 plan. So, for example, Cape Wind, which is
19 not an example of Smart from the Start, but
20 they had to do a construction and operation
21 plan as one of their final stages after they
22 were granted the lease. The lease gives you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the opportunity to submit a construction and
2 operations plan in an area where no one else
3 has that right.

4 So, they, then, submit their
5 construction and operations plan, and we
6 review it. And that construction and
7 operations plan has to include the risk
8 assessment. It has to include, for example,
9 avian and bat monitoring and adaptive
10 management to assess the plan, to assess
11 impacts on birds and bats, and a plan to
12 address them, if they turn out to be bigger
13 than anticipated.

14 They also have to have it, believe
15 it or not, an oil spill response plan because
16 some of those unmanned platforms have tankers
17 of oil, little ones. We are not talking, you
18 know, a bizillion barrels of oil, but enough
19 to keep the turbines lubricated. And they had
20 to have an oil spill response plan. That
21 meant that they had to talk to the nearest
22 communities and the Coast Guard to figure out

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 who was going to get there, how long it was
2 going to take them, what deployment plan they
3 were going to use, what type. Did they have
4 contracts for it? All of that had to be
5 approved before Secretary Salazar approved the
6 construction and operation plan.

7 MR. RIZZARDI: Will there be any
8 new guidance on that point? Any federal
9 guidance?

10 MR. FARQUHAR: I don't know what
11 guidance we are going to have for that. There
12 might already be some in there, in the
13 guidance document. So, I can't characterize
14 it.

15 But I do think we will have a
16 threshold, and, then, that will go out in the
17 EIS for the project, and people will get a
18 chance to look at it.

19 But thank you.

20 MR. RIZZARDI: Thank you.

21 MR. FISHER: My question is
22 certainly a nuts-and-bolts question, maybe

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 even below the weed line.

2 Clearly, these things create an EMF
3 footprint, an electromagnetic field. Is there
4 a protocol for shielding them? Is there any
5 kind of research being done to see what kind
6 of effect that is going to have on the
7 features, the marine environment, what have
8 you?

9 MR. FARQUHAR: BOEMRE is doing
10 research on it. I don't know the --

11 MS. RUSSIN: We have a TARP
12 program. There are areas for research and it
13 funds or does that research. It is more often
14 funds it.

15 And I know that I have seen studies
16 on the electromagnetic impacts on, I want to
17 say, fish, but I am not sure.

18 MR. FISHER: Well, do we know what
19 they actually generate, what kind of field?

20 MR. FARQUHAR: I can't answer that
21 question.

22 MS. RUSSIN: So, it would have to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 be site-specific because each project will be
2 different and in a different area. We will
3 have some knowledge. When they come in, we
4 will model it. We will figure it out.

5 We can't say a generic offshore
6 turbine farm because we don't have a generic
7 offshore turbine farm yet.

8 MR. FISHER: There's not so many
9 whatever per megawatts that you know is being
10 emitted?

11 MS. RUSSIN: Not that I am aware
12 of, but there may be. I am just not aware of
13 it. I just know we are doing more research to
14 find out.

15 CHAIR McCARTY: I think Patty had a
16 question or a comment, and, then, if we have
17 time, Billy.

18 MR. FARQUHAR: Okay.

19 CHAIR McCARTY: Do you have
20 something, Patty?

21 MS. DOERR: I am from New Jersey.
22 So, there is a little bit of activity going on

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 off our coast.

2 Heather mentioned this before,
3 organizational framework and the regional
4 planning bodies. You have the Smart from the
5 Start. I know you have been working with the
6 State of New Jersey individually and the other
7 states in the region.

8 Has there been any discussion of
9 using Smart from the Start in the Mid-Atlantic
10 and incorporating it with the regional
11 planning bodies of MARCO, and use it almost
12 like a pilot for marine and spatial planning
13 in the area?

14 MR. FARQUHAR: We think the process
15 for CMSP is going to go too slowly for this
16 Administration to have wind development before
17 the plans are adopted. So, we are trying to
18 work with those bodies. We are trying to work
19 on the principles. We are trying to make sure
20 that stakeholders -- we are trying to feed
21 back information.

22 But in the Executive Order that was

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 sent, the President, because the agency knows
2 these kinds of questions, said proceed with
3 activities as you already have in your agency
4 plans. The reason the President said that is
5 that he wanted to make sure we didn't stop.

6 I mean here's, from our
7 perspective, a really great energy source that
8 helps us get potentially away from some
9 carbon-based fuels. So, if we can do it, and
10 do it responsibly, we want to get it going
11 faster than the regional plans are going to
12 happen.

13 So, there is some dynamic tension
14 there, and we are trying to work back and
15 forth with the people in the planning, in the
16 CMSP process, particularly with the states who
17 are interested and the other federal agencies.

18 But we can't hold them up until those are
19 done.

20 Does that answer your question?

21 MS. DOERR: Yes, I guess, and I can
22 maybe just get your cards and you can email

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that later. I don't want to hold you guys up.

2 But just in terms of how you
3 coordinating, not just with New Jersey, but
4 with Delaware and Maryland, because we are all
5 so close, and everything.

6 MS. RUSSIN: Just in short, we have
7 individual state task forces, and we have our
8 Multipurpose Marine Cadastre. And that is
9 being informed by our state task forces.

10 All the data, all the work we are
11 doing, that will get looped into the CMSP
12 process as it moves forward. So, I see them
13 as leveraging each other, frankly.

14 MS. DOERR: Right.

15 MR. FARQUHAR: And actually, it
16 would be great if you guys want our contact
17 info; people could call afterwards.

18 CHAIR McCARTY: Well, thank you.

19 MR. FARQUHAR: Billy?

20 CHAIR McCARTY: Billy, do you still
21 want to do it?

22 MR. CAUSEY: I think I will pass.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 I will answer Steve's question on the side.

2 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay.

3 MR. FARQUHAR: Thanks so much.

4 MS. RUSSIN: Did Ed have his hand
5 up for a while, or were you on behalf of --

6 CHAIR McCARTY: He was trying to
7 help Keith.

8 (Laughter.)

9 MR. FARQUHAR: So, thanks to Heidi
10 and Mark for supporting us in getting here,
11 and to all the people who all make this
12 happen.

13 MS. RUSSIN: Thank you for inviting
14 us.

15 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you for
16 coming. It was very, very good.

17 MR. FARQUHAR: We are happy to come
18 back, and especially to Key West.

19 (Laughter.)

20 (Applause.)

21 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay, guys, have a
22 10-minute break and we will come back.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 (Whereupon, the foregoing matter
2 went off the record at 3:05 p.m. and went back
3 on the record at 3:21 p.m.)

4 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay, guys, we are
5 going to hear from Eileen in just a minute.
6 But, Eileen, with your permission, we are just
7 going to take a couple of minutes to discuss
8 that last suite of issues because it is a
9 little bit different than what we are going to
10 hear from Eileen.

11 I would like your thoughts (a)
12 where or if, No. 1, if we should park this set
13 of issues with a Subcommittee for discussion
14 in a Subcommittee breakout. I think we
15 should. If so, which Subcommittee?

16 Second, do we have particular
17 questions or pieces that we want to suggest to
18 that Subcommittee for discussion to bring back
19 to us?

20 I think there's a lot of things
21 that people are worried about and concerned
22 about and have comments on in this whole set

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of the energy use of the oceans, the Coastal
2 and Marine Spatial Planning, how this Smart
3 from the Start fits into that, what's going to
4 happen, generally speaking, and really what we
5 can do by way of advice to the agency as to
6 what their role needs to be to make us feel as
7 comfortable as possible with this process, I
8 guess is the way I would put it.

9 No. 1, what do people think about
10 parking it in a Subcommittee for further
11 discussion? Because I think we have a lot to
12 discuss. I am not sure we have time to do it
13 right now. I think it would be good to get it
14 kind of distilled in a Subcommittee setting,
15 so that people could bring it back.

16 Dave?

17 MR. WALLACE: Yes, I think that we
18 should have the Subcommittee do it, speak to
19 it. It is going to get more complex and not
20 less complex as time goes on.

21 CHAIR McCARTY: Uh-hum. Do you
22 have a suggestion as to which Subcommittee?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 We have the Ecosystem. We have the Strategic
2 Planning, Budget, and Program Committee. The
3 Ecosystem Committee is Mr. Raftican's. The
4 other one is mine at the moment, but I could
5 assign it to somebody else. Then, we have the
6 Protected Resources, the Commerce, and
7 Recreational. Those are the Subcommittees
8 that we have.

9 So, we are having a joint meeting
10 of the Ecosystem and Strategic Planning,
11 Program Development Subcommittee. That might
12 be a choice. I don't know.

13 Mr. Raftican?

14 MR. RAFTICAN: Tom, please.

15 CHAIR McCARTY: Tom?

16 MR. RAFTICAN: The issues we are
17 dealing with here are, I mean, they do fall
18 within a broad-scale ecosystem. But the other
19 thing is they are far broader than just
20 ecosystem. I mean they touch almost every
21 piece of every area of what we are doing.

22 And perhaps an ad hoc committee

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 might fall better, you know, where people who
2 may not necessarily want to be involved either
3 in strategic planning or protected species or
4 ecosystem, but really are concerned about
5 marine and spatial planning.

6 I just throw that out on the floor.

7 This is something that is clearly not going
8 to go away.

9 No. 2, it is going to be very, very
10 important.

11 No. 3, we are not going to be the
12 grand players here, either. You know, you
13 have to understand that it is not like the
14 tail is going to wag the dog here, but the
15 thing is staying engaged is very important.

16 But I think that perhaps having a
17 very set ad hoc committee that speaks to this
18 might make sense.

19 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. Other
20 opinions on this?

21 MS. FOY: I would like to agree
22 with Tom.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIR McCARTY: An ad hoc?

2 MS. FOY: I mean there is going to
3 be winners and losers in this process,
4 regardless of whether we do or not. I think
5 it is important that at least we attempt --

6 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. Other
7 comments?

8 MR. DEWEY: I don't disagree. I
9 think that is probably appropriate. I am just
10 kind of curious what you had in mind for how
11 that group would meet. Would they try to meet
12 at this meeting? Would they try to do it
13 after this meeting electronically? How do you
14 see them engaging? Because we have got a
15 pretty full agenda, as it sits now.

16 CHAIR McCARTY: Yes, we do, and
17 that was exactly what was running through my
18 mind. I think that we have some scheduled time
19 for the other Subcommittees to meet at this
20 meeting. We are clearly not going to get to
21 it at 4:00, I don't think, but maybe 4:30 or
22 so, maybe later. We may not have time

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 tonight. We may have to stay late, if we
2 wanted to have that Subcommittee meeting.

3 But if we had another ad hoc
4 committee during this meeting, it would have
5 to take time away or it could be early in the
6 morning. It could be at lunch. Those are the
7 only times, I think, that we have unscheduled
8 right now.

9 I agree that it should be an ad hoc
10 committee perhaps, and I think it should be
11 something like National Ocean Policy
12 Implementation or something like that, you
13 know, to cover that suite of issues.

14 MS. FOY: Can I make a suggestion?

15 CHAIR McCARTY: Yes, Cathy.

16 MS. FOY: And this is with the
17 permission of my Subcommittee members on
18 Protected Resources. At this next
19 Subcommittee meeting that we have coming up on
20 Wednesday, we were just going to be suggesting
21 items for the upcoming agenda in the D.C.
22 meeting. Perhaps that time slot, Wednesday

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 afternoon, 2:45 to 3:45, we could take this
2 time to address this issue.

3 CHAIR McCARTY: That is a very nice
4 approach. Thank you.

5 MS. FOY: Perhaps, then, you would
6 submit your suggestions for the Protected
7 Resources Subcommittee agenda.

8 CHAIR McCARTY: Mark, did you have
9 a comment?

10 DR. HOLLIDAY: So, we are running
11 parallel committee meetings at 2:45 tomorrow.

12 CHAIR McCARTY: Right.

13 DR. HOLLIDAY: Some of the
14 Recreational Committee members might want to
15 be a participant. So, I think you need to
16 check with them.

17 CHAIR McCARTY: Yes. Good point.

18 Tom and then Keith.

19 MR. RAFTICAN: I think as far as
20 the Ecosystem Subcommittee meeting, basically,
21 we are doing the same thing this afternoon,
22 probably more than anything else, some

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 discussion of what goes on here.

2 Perhaps tying this and this group
3 together and start setting up the groundwork.

4 So that, by the time we get to your slot, we
5 could put together something that would at
6 least get people kind of oriented in a
7 direction. It might be a really good way to
8 start off this afternoon.

9 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. I think that
10 is good. If you look at the schedule for the
11 Subcommittee, the joint Subcommittee meetings
12 this afternoon, National Ocean Policy is part
13 of that. Scientific needs and priorities are
14 slightly different.

15 But we probably could at least
16 begin the discussion and, then, maybe go from
17 there. Maybe we could even arrive at a
18 recommendation as to whether there needs to be
19 an ad hoc committee that takes it further, and
20 so on, and then bring it back to the group in
21 the morning. Should we just leave it at that?

22 Okay. Good. That's that question

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 answered. Thank you.

2 Is there any advice -- I'm sorry,
3 Keith.

4 MR. RIZZARDI: Just an observation
5 on each of the last few presentations. They
6 all had a very significant public feedback
7 component, the spatial planning, the energy
8 one. There was a National Ocean Policy. They
9 are all looking for public participation.

10 As our committees go back, I would
11 encourage people to think about how can MAFAC
12 use that public process and participate
13 directly in that public process. What
14 documents can we develop that we would submit
15 to the entities as part of that process? Can
16 we send a representative to go to those
17 meetings and make an appearance at one of
18 those meetings, and be a voice for MAFAC and a
19 voice for fisheries? Because if this entity
20 is going to have relevance, it needs to find
21 ways to participate in those kinds of forums
22 when they are available.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIR McCARTY: I have several
2 things listed as to questions that were raised
3 where we might have that feedback. I have got
4 four or five things on that list already. I
5 think Tony had a couple of things that I
6 wanted to capture, but I didn't.

7 So, perhaps people who have that
8 list started could give them to me or Tom at
9 the end of the meeting today.

10 MR. RAFTICAN: I like where you are
11 going, Keith. But let's put together a
12 platform. We could do it formally probably.
13 It would underline how we got information into
14 these public processes.

15 CHAIR McCARTY: Sounds good. So,
16 let's do that.

17 And, Keith, I believe you have some
18 information about lunch tomorrow. Let's do
19 that now before everybody breaks up.

20 MR. RIZZARDI: I have opportunities
21 for both lunch and dinner. Dinner can wait.
22 But, for tomorrow, Ricky's Blue Heaven has

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 agreed to take us at 12:30. Our lunch break
2 starts at 12:15. So, we can walk from here
3 straight to Ricky's. And it has got outdoor
4 gardens that will seat everybody.

5 And on Thursday, Kelly's, also
6 having outdoor dining, has agreed to take us
7 for lunch. So, as many people as want to go,
8 I have got reservations lined up for 30 of us.
9 I have a friend who is very well-connected
10 here in Key West who hooked us up.

11 CHAIR McCARTY: Yes. Thank you.

12 MR. RIZZARDI: And there is an
13 opportunity for dinner at the Conch Republic
14 on Thursday evening. We need to have some
15 chats about what we want to do for dinner
16 arrangements.

17 CHAIR McCARTY: Yes, because we
18 have a dinner arrangement, I understand, for
19 tomorrow. Is that right, Mark?

20 DR. HOLLIDAY: We have tentative
21 plans to go to El Siboney for dinner tomorrow.

22 CHAIR McCARTY: And that is a great

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 place, yes, a great place.

2 MR. RIZZARDI: And that's fine.
3 And, then, tonight is also a possibility. So,
4 if there is a large group of people who would
5 like to check out Conch Republic, I can
6 contact this person and get a reservation.

7 CHAIR McCARTY: Let's try for lunch
8 tomorrow. Raise your hand if you want to go
9 to --

10 MR. FISHER: What are the details
11 for this?

12 MR. RIZZARDI: Ricky's Blue Heaven
13 is about as Key West as it comes. The
14 roosters are actually walking around, an
15 outdoor garden. It is really close. It would
16 be a little walk from here and a pretty
17 eclectic menu.

18 Kelly's, a number of us actually
19 ate there Monday night, and it is more
20 traditional, but Key West kind of place, right
21 on Duval Street, with outdoor dining and lots
22 of good seafood on the menu.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 CHAIR McCARTY: How about tomorrow
2 lunch? Everybody, raise your hand if you want
3 to do the group thing.

4 MR. FISHER: Come on, Dave, raise
5 your hand.

6 MR. RIZZARDI: I got the count.

7 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay.

8 MR. RIZZARDI: I had 21.

9 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. Do you need
10 another count?

11 MR. RIZZARDI: Thursday lunch.

12 CHAIR McCARTY: Thursday lunch at
13 Kelly's?

14 MR. RIZZARDI: Thursday lunch at
15 Kelly's.

16 CHAIR McCARTY: Sounds good. It
17 makes it easy because, then, we all know we
18 can get there and get back in time.

19 DR. HOLLIDAY: Do you want to ask
20 for dinner tonight?

21 MR. RIZZARDI: Okay. That's fine.
22 All right. So, how about dinner for tonight?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 DR. HOLLIDAY: Does anybody want to
2 go out to dinner tonight, the Conch Republic?

3 MR. RIZZARDI: The Conch Republic
4 for dinner tonight.

5 DR. HOLLIDAY: Seafood, it's on the
6 water.

7 CHAIR McCARTY: Conch Republic is a
8 good place.

9 MS. LOVETT: I think we tried to
10 call them and --

11 MR. RIZZARDI: I have an in.

12 MS. LOVETT: Okay.

13 MR. RIZZARDI: So, if we want to be
14 in, we can be in. So, I will try for seven or
15 eight o'clock.

16 Okay. Got it. Thank you.

17 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you.

18 Okay. Now I think we are ready for
19 you, Eileen.

20 And I am sorry for the delay.
21 Thank you for being so patient.

22 DR. SHEA: I have actually been

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 having flashbacks here all day. One of the
2 first things I did as a graduate student 36
3 years ago was help my major professor, Bill
4 Hargis, get ready for a MAFAC meeting. So,
5 like I said, I am having flashbacks here. I
6 also revealed my age.

7 (Laughter.)

8 So, I know that we are running
9 behind time. In putting together this talk
10 and talking to folks about this sort of
11 combination of Climate 101 and what are we
12 doing in climate and how are we responding,
13 and what does adaptation mean, I put together
14 a one-hour, or actually a 40-minute talk with
15 20 minutes for discussion. It is based on
16 what I was told. Clearly, I am going to fly
17 through this conversation now.

18 And what I would like to do at the
19 beginning is just offer that. I am happy to
20 come back again or work with one or more of
21 the Subcommittees to pursue any of the issues
22 that come up during the discussion that you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 would like. So, I would really like to set
2 the stage. But based on the guidance I got,
3 this presentation that you all have access to
4 on the website has a lot more information.

5 As I get started, I want to do two
6 things that are not in the slides. The first
7 is a definitional issue. What is climate?
8 There are two functional and complementary
9 definitions of climate that are equally valid.

10 The way I describe them, one is the
11 statistics of weather over time. All right?
12 That is the very traditional way of thinking
13 about climatology. It is the study of weather
14 patterns as they have occurred over time, very
15 static.

16 The second definition of climate is
17 one that has developed over the last 30 to 40
18 years. That is the definition of the
19 processes in the ocean, in the atmosphere, and
20 on land, and that includes ice areas, that
21 drive the way the earth moves energy.

22 Basically, there are two things

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that happen to move energy around. The earth
2 spins and there are currents in the ocean and
3 the atmosphere that move energy around. If we
4 didn't have that combination of climate
5 processes, dynamic processes, the equator
6 would get a whole lot hotter, the poles would
7 be extremely cold, and we wouldn't have the
8 weather patterns we have because you are not
9 moving energy around.

10 So, weather patterns are a
11 reflection of how the earth itself is storing
12 and moving energy around. So, that is sort of
13 the two definitions of climate.

14 The second is just to give you a
15 sense of the fact that NOAA has been in the
16 climate business since the beginning of the
17 Weather Service at the beginning of the
18 century, the 1900s. In 1890, when the Weather
19 Service was created, one of the missions of
20 the Weather Service was to keep records of
21 weather conditions for perpetuity.

22 The part of NOAA where I work, the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 National Climatic Data Center, is where we
2 keep those records. We are the repository of
3 every weather record that has been taken
4 anywhere in the world for as long as they have
5 been taken, which dates back to around the
6 late 1800s, early 1900s.

7 So, a part of what we do in climate
8 is maintain that record that gives us that
9 statistical look that we sometimes talk about,
10 the historical pattern of weather.

11 We have also been engaged in
12 understanding what is driving weather, those
13 processes in the earth's climate system, the
14 ocean, the atmosphere, since the 1960s or
15 1970s.

16 When we think internally, when we
17 think about climate, it is climate on a
18 variety of timescales. It is everything from
19 a seasonal outlook for hurricanes or a monthly
20 drought outlook to long-term projections of
21 what might happen in 20 to 30 years because
22 you are building a dam or you are building a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 road, and you want to have some perspective on
2 what the climate is going to be 20 to 30 to 40
3 years down the road, in order to make those
4 decisions.

5 In my career, the questions I
6 usually get asked are: what the heck is
7 happening right now? How does it relate to
8 what has happened in the past? What is going
9 to happen in the next few months to a year?
10 And what is going to happen in the next 5, 10,
11 15, 25, 30? Depending on the issue someone is
12 trying to address, the decision they are
13 trying to make defines the timescale of
14 interest.

15 The climate system operates on that
16 entire suite of timescales. What captures the
17 attention between what we call seasonal
18 variability or year-to-year variability or
19 long-term climate changes, the timescale of
20 interest to a decisionmaker making a decision
21 and addressing an issue?

22 So, what do we do in climate at

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 NOAA? We take observations in the ocean and
2 the atmosphere, steward those data, analyze
3 those data, and provide what we call
4 monitoring products, what's happening today;
5 outlooks, seasonal, monthly, out a year. We
6 investigate and learn how to predict patterns
7 of variability or change over short
8 timescales, like El Nino, southern
9 oscillation, one we have learned a lot about
10 in the last 20 to 30 years. And make
11 projections of future conditions which are
12 used to meet international obligations as well
13 as government-to-government responsibilities
14 inside the United States. So, that is the
15 background.

16 I want to touch on these patterns
17 of natural variety because understanding
18 things like El Nino has actually helped us
19 place climate in context. So, 35 years ago, I
20 went into my physical oceanography exam, and
21 as I was taking off my coat because it was
22 December in Virginia, the professor says,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 "What does El Nino have to do with the price
2 of eggs?" Now this guy was a jokester. So, I
3 figured he was getting ready to tell me a
4 joke. He wasn't. That was the first question
5 in the oral exam. "What does it have to do
6 with the price of eggs?"

7 The timing, for those of you
8 thinking about the mid-seventies, the timing
9 was related to early studies about sardine and
10 anchovy death, and the relationship between
11 them and this unusually warm water condition
12 along South America that we were coming to
13 call El Nino in western science, the way it
14 had been referred to locally in South America
15 for many, many decades. What does El Nino
16 have to do with the price of eggs?

17 Well, since then, we now can say
18 that we have gotten to a point now where there
19 is a really, really rich tapestry of research
20 going on around the world, particularly in the
21 Pacific, but not limited to the Pacific, that
22 relates to how this tango between the ocean

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 and the atmosphere in the Pacific Ocean
2 actually affects fisheries.

3 In this case, this is a scientist
4 in Honolulu who is looking at tuna. The tuna
5 and El Nino/southern oscillation connection is
6 one of the most dramatic and most easily seen
7 because, what are they doing? They are
8 following that edge of warm and cold water,
9 right? So, if that warm water is expanding
10 eastward, we know where the fish are going.
11 And that insight is helping us understand why
12 climate matters to marine ecosystems and the
13 fish who live in them.

14 Another one is a real interesting
15 story. Were it not for fishery scientists,
16 the climate scientists would never have
17 discovered that historically we have seen
18 these little roughly 20-to-30-year periods of
19 warm in the northern Pacific, cold, warm,
20 cold, roughly every 20 to 30 years.

21 It was salmon biologists in the
22 University of Washington and the Fisheries

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Service in Washington and Oregon who came to
2 the climate scientists and said, "Can you help
3 us figure out why we are seeing periods of
4 time when coho and chinook are really good
5 returns for us and periods of time when it
6 really sucks in terms of what we are getting
7 with coho and chinook?"

8 And the answer, it turns out, had
9 everything to do with water temperature
10 conditions and current conditions in the north
11 Pacific and what kind of feed, what kind of
12 food animals were being brought up the coast.

13 Or were they being driven away from the
14 coast?

15 So, in cold conditions, coho and
16 chinook do well because of this mixing of
17 physical conditions in the climate system and
18 biological conditions. But if it were not for
19 the fisheries biologists coming to the climate
20 scientists and saying, "Can you help us figure
21 it out," the climate scientists would not
22 probably have seen that pattern for another 20

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 to 30 years because they weren't looking for
2 it.

3 It has a lot to do with how
4 important this business of working with
5 decisionmakers is all the time. You have
6 reference and had discussions on ocean
7 acidification. So, a long time ago, people
8 were talking about coral bleaching. And the
9 assumption going in was the only thing you had
10 to worry about was how warm the sea surface
11 was. How warm was that ocean water?

12 Well, it turns out, to get a good
13 bleaching event, like any of us would want
14 one, you not only need the warm water, but you
15 need the winds to stop blowing. You need
16 doldrums. You need to have very little in the
17 way of ocean circulation because you are not
18 bringing nutrients in and you are not bringing
19 cold water in. You need the sea surface
20 temperature to go up. You also need low cloud
21 cover.

22 These are insights that have

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 evolved over time by a combination of fish
2 scientists and climate scientists thinking
3 about how and why climate matters to fisheries
4 and marine ecosystems over time.

5 So, those are all patterns in a way
6 of natural variability, periodic changes in
7 the way things work.

8 So, what is climate change?
9 Climate change is a word that the
10 international policy community and, to a
11 lesser extent, the international scientific
12 community use to describe one particular
13 segment of how climate is changing. And that
14 is long-term changes that are affected by how
15 many greenhouse gases we have in the
16 atmosphere.

17 Aristotle used to think about a lot
18 of things. One of them was weather. And one
19 of the things he said was, you know, it is not
20 always wet or dry. Where the water hits the
21 land on the coast is sometimes here and
22 sometimes here. It is not always the same,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 but I bet there are some patterns to this
2 behavior; I'm sure there are patterns. That
3 is what Aristotle did, is encourage us to look
4 for patterns, to look for reasons that things
5 happen.

6 The issue of climate change as an
7 international policy issue and an
8 international scientific issue has to do with
9 how we understand what is going to happen
10 several decades from now. And we know that
11 the physics of the way the earth's climate
12 system works involves having in the atmosphere
13 water vapor, carbon dioxide, methane, nitrous
14 oxides, and a number of other greenhouse gases
15 that essentially keep and track heat.

16 Energy comes in from the sun, hits
17 the earth, does one of two things, reflects
18 back out, if it is a white surface, a
19 reflective surface, or it hits the earth and
20 it warms the earth.

21 Once you have warmed the earth,
22 that energy has been converted to infrared

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 energy. That energy is re-radiated, and,
2 theoretically, without greenhouse gases, it
3 would go right back out into space.

4 Without greenhouse gases, the
5 average temperature of this planet would be
6 zero degrees Fahrenheit. The average
7 temperature of this planet with greenhouse
8 gases in the atmosphere is about 60 degrees
9 Fahrenheit. Without the greenhouse gases in
10 the atmosphere, we wouldn't have the
11 conditions that we know set the stage for life
12 as we know it here.

13 So, the process of greenhouse gases
14 trapping energy, holding onto that heat energy
15 and not letting it leave the surface of the
16 earth, is a natural part of the way our
17 climate system has evolved.

18 What is changing now is our ability
19 to increase the concentration of greenhouse
20 gases. It is not just carbon dioxide,
21 although that is the one that human beings
22 seem to have the most ability to affect. We

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 seem to be able to really increase carbon
2 dioxide in the atmosphere through fossil fuel,
3 through deforestation, activities like that.

4 So, what has changed is our role.
5 Are we, in fact, human beings, playing a
6 significant enough role to see the earth's
7 climate system change in some ways? Some
8 good, some bad, some known, some unknown.

9 Oh, I am sorry, this is not going
10 to show very well.

11 Population, carbon dioxide, nitrous
12 oxide, and methane. So, these three are all
13 greenhouse gases. And this is temperature
14 change.

15 So, do you see this red line,
16 squiggly red line? It goes back to 1,000, up
17 to a little past 2,000. The squiggly red line
18 is what a climate model tells us the
19 temperature probably was. That is based on
20 tree rings, coral rings, coral core rings. It
21 is based on what we know about growing
22 patterns, about plants and where they grew and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 where they didn't grow. It has to do with
2 pushing back the temperature and the carbon
3 dioxide record through ice cores to understand
4 what the carbon dioxide and temperature
5 conditions were and how they evolved together.

6 And, then, over here, you can
7 hardly see it, but starting here around 1890
8 is our actual observed record of temperature.

9 And it coincides pretty well with what the
10 models say, based on what we know, of how the
11 earth's climate system works, the processes in
12 the ocean, the processes in the atmosphere.

13 And the other thing that the
14 particular images there show you is the
15 connection, the apparent connection, between
16 human activities, which are also increasing,
17 greenhouse gas emissions, and temperature. We
18 know there is a correlation between carbon
19 dioxide and methane and temperature from ice
20 cores. We know they do this. They move in
21 sync. When carbon dioxide is high,
22 temperature is high. When temperature is low,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 carbon dioxide is low. So, we know they move
2 in sync.

3 This is a look at the actual
4 observed temperature record and how it has
5 changed from 1880 into the 2000s, so until the
6 end of the century. And what you see is
7 superimposed on it is carbon dioxide
8 concentrations in the white line.

9 So, you see we kind of go along,
10 roughly, in the 56.5 to 57 degrees Fahrenheit
11 global average. And, then, we cross over into
12 a period of persistently warming conditions.
13 That is part of what is driving not just
14 scientific interest, but the interest of
15 public policy officials to, quote, "do
16 something about" climate change.

17 We know it is getting warmer from
18 observations, from these other analogs, from
19 shrinking sea ice, from melting glaciers, from
20 the temperature observations. So, we also
21 know carbon dioxide is going up.

22 This is another way of showing it,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 just showing you the temperature record from
2 1880 to 2009. So, this is just looking at
3 observations of temperature from land. So,
4 observing systems that are put in place for
5 weather, conditioned to protect them so that
6 you know the record is -- excuse me -- climate
7 quality. That means the record is not moved
8 around from an airport to a forest every 10 or
9 15 years. You know that the instruments are
10 solid, and they are constantly validated.

11 So, you take a look and you get the
12 same type of image in surface, land surface
13 temperature globally. And what you are
14 getting here is what is interesting in some of
15 the recent studies is the discussion about how
16 we seem to be having one warm decade after
17 another. So, each decade seems to be warmer
18 than the decade before it.

19 What's causing that? Is it some
20 combination of natural processes in a system
21 like El Nino, like PDO? Is that plus the
22 increase in CO₂. Those are the kinds of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 questions that scientists ask when they look
2 at a record like that. And you can see 2010
3 was right up there. The same thing in sea
4 surface temperature. Again, you see the same
5 pattern.

6 The other thing is you do a little
7 measuring of the atmosphere, measuring of the
8 surface. You know the relationship between
9 carbon dioxide and heat. So, you know how
10 much warming there should be in the
11 atmosphere. Well, it's not there. So, where
12 is it?

13 And the answer from the scientific
14 community is it is probably in the body of the
15 ocean. Probably 30 percent of the heat that
16 has been trapped is in the ocean.

17 So, when the scientific community,
18 like the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate
19 Change, or in this report, which this is just
20 the policymaker's highlights, when scientists
21 talk about what kind of scenarios might we see
22 in the future based on our emissions of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 greenhouse gases, they tend to present three
2 scenarios.

3 One is what the policymakers
4 internationally have consistently called
5 business as usual, meaning the same kind of
6 emissions we are doing now. Nothing changes,
7 right?

8 Then, there is the lower emissions,
9 meaning we get a little good at energy
10 conservation. We get a little bit better at
11 energy efficiency, and we drop that down a
12 little bit. Or we just keep going along the
13 path we are on, but we have a higher demand
14 for energy, so a higher emissions scenario.
15 And, then, super-high, but even higher is the
16 purple.

17 What we choose to do in mitigation,
18 which is how much greenhouse gas we put out,
19 or how much energy we conserve, or how much
20 more efficient we are with energy, will
21 determine a lot about this path.

22 Now if you look at the white line,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 this is the actual temperature record right
2 here. The green line is a model simulation.
3 So, that is a model that is telling us that is
4 what the temperature should have been from
5 1900 to about 2010. And it is pretty
6 consistent with what is in the temperature
7 record.

8 This is a messy one, but it is an
9 interesting story. So, there are a lot of
10 flaws in the models that scientists use, the
11 climate models that scientists use.

12 The light green represents clouds,
13 much better than it was 10 years ago, but it
14 is still not very good. And clouds are very
15 important because some of them do a great job
16 of reflecting sunlight right back out in the
17 atmosphere. So, it never actually gets down
18 to the earth's surface. So, it is important
19 to get those things right.

20 But when you take every single
21 climate model that is used in things like the
22 Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change or

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 national assessments, and you run them from
2 1900 to today, and you say, I'm going to play
3 some games because it's a climate model you
4 can play some games, you can say, "I want you
5 to tell me what the temperature should be
6 today and historically for the last 100 years
7 if the only thing at play is natural
8 variability in the system."

9 And what you get is the blue line.

10 And what you see is, right around the
11 sixties, this projection of temperature
12 diverges from the actual observations of
13 temperature change that we have seen.

14 When you put human factors like our
15 emissions of greenhouse gases into those
16 models, you get the red line. The red line is
17 human plus natural together, and it looks a
18 lot like natural variability.

19 These are the kinds of maps that
20 you see in assessment products like the Global
21 Climate Change Impacts in the U.S. Report,
22 tends to start with present-day and, then, you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 move out, usually in multi-decade samples, to
2 look at how the country -- this is the U.S.
3 report. So, it looks at how the country
4 looks.

5 Temperature globally averaged is
6 not something anyone in this room will ever
7 feel. First of all, you and I will only feel
8 what is happening around us right where we
9 live and work. We are not going to feel the
10 global average.

11 And it is important to notice, even
12 in the U.S., there are some parts of the
13 country that get warmer than other parts of
14 the country. It is very important to
15 remember, as we think about how we provide
16 information about changing climate to support
17 decisions, to recognize that the way we feel
18 and see changing climate varies from place to
19 place, and so does our ability to adapt,
20 respond. Our ability to respond also varies.

21 Rainfall is less certain than
22 temperature. The two things in climate models

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that you should be willing to take to the bank
2 are the temperature increases, because that is
3 basic physics. That is the physics of
4 greenhouse gases tracking temperature.

5 The other tends to be projections
6 of sea-level rise. Because, largely, until
7 the last eight to ten years, the sea-level
8 rise projections were based on the fact that
9 warm water expands. That was the primary
10 principle in looking at sea-level projections.

11 Warmer water expands. So, you will see a
12 rise in sea level.

13 One of the things that is most
14 difficult to capture in these climate models
15 is rainfall, and not just rainfall, but the
16 difference between rainfall and snowfall.
17 That has a significant impact, as we have seen
18 just this year with the flooding.

19 So, one of the things we are decent
20 at, but not great at, in these models for the
21 future is precipitation, rainfall and
22 snowfall. But, even if you just look at what

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 has actually happened with precipitation,
2 rainfall and snowfall, over the United States,
3 it has increased about 50 percent over the
4 last half century. That is the observed
5 changes.

6 Projected change, it is, again --

7 DR. DANA: Fifty percent or 5
8 percent?

9 DR. SHEA: I'm sorry, 5 percent
10 over the past 50 years. Sorry.

11 DR. DANA: Okay. Thank you.

12 DR. SHEA: But, again, look where
13 it is happening. It is not happening in the
14 same places the same way.

15 The simplest way, when we were
16 working on assessing the consequences of
17 climate variability and climate change in
18 Pacific islands, the thing we discovered is
19 places that normally get dry during an El Nino
20 year are going to get a lot drier. Places
21 that get floods will probably get more floods.

22 It is not a switch. It is not going to go on

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 and off, wet and dry.

2 So, for example, in the Southeast
3 and much of the West, we have seen frequency
4 of drought increased. But we have seen heavy
5 rainfall or snowfall in the Midwest and the
6 Northeast. So, again, place matters. It
7 matters when you are managing a fishery and it
8 matters when you are thinking about climate.

9 The other thing about climate that
10 I have learned in my discussions with folks,
11 particularly in the islands, is, just like we
12 won't feel climate change through that global
13 average temperature increase, we are mostly
14 going to feel climate change, changing
15 climate, through extreme events.

16 It is also a great way to talk
17 about it because enhancing our resilience to
18 an extreme event or patterns of extreme events
19 helps us enhance our resilience long term,
20 regardless of that threat, whether it is
21 manmade or not.

22 Pacific islands, sea level rise.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 This caption up here is part of the findings
2 of the Global Climate Change Impacts in the
3 U.S. We happened to use a Federated States of
4 Micronesia image in the report.

5 This is sort of a look at how our
6 thinking about sea-level rise has changed
7 historically. So, we don't really know until
8 around the 1700s. We have some fairly
9 interesting evidence that helps us feel a
10 little bit confident about the range of sea
11 level.

12 But, beginning in the late
13 1800s/early 1900s, we actually began to
14 measure sea level. Tide gauges all around the
15 world, tide gauges particularly around the
16 United States.

17 In the 2000s, in addition to that
18 ground-based tide gauge, we added satellite
19 data. So, this black curve is global average
20 sea level. Now you are going to start
21 projecting into the future. And
22 interestingly, where we are today is where the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 models used in the last Intergovernmental
2 Panel on Climate Change Assessment said we
3 should be at the highest of the emission
4 scenarios. So, right now, we are tracking on
5 the IPCC high emissions scenario.

6 Again, remember that the early
7 belief was the only thing you had to worry
8 about in sea level was, if water is warmer, it
9 expands. Then, we said, oh, no, warm water
10 expands and sea ice starts to diminish and
11 glaciers start to melt. And those factors are
12 starting to be built into these model
13 projections in the future.

14 So, here, this is largely a
15 combination of warmer water, sea ice
16 diminishing, glaciers diminishing. But in the
17 Global Climate Change Impacts, in the U.S.
18 report, there was some really significant new
19 research that talked about what happens if the
20 Greenland ice sheet actually begins to calve
21 off huge portions of this continental mass of
22 ice. What happens then? And that is why some

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of these sea-level projections in the last
2 five years have been much higher than in the
3 past 20 years.

4 Right here in the Florida Keys --
5 Billy Causey sent me this one -- this is the
6 tide gauge record in Key West. And you can
7 see it going up, and you heard this morning,
8 roughly nine inches in the last century here.

9 That is basically the global average, both
10 observed and what you might expect.

11 This is one of those pictures of,
12 well, what would that mean? Where would the
13 water be if we continued down? You have got a
14 one-year sea-level rise, which is what those
15 models predict at that high emissions
16 scenario. So, here we are in Key West
17 potentially under water.

18 Climate, whether it is climate
19 variability, month-to-month, year-to-year, or
20 long-term change, doesn't matter in and of
21 itself. It is climate in context. It is the
22 one message I learned over 30-some years.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 It is trying to find a way to weave
2 the climate thread through the tapestry of how
3 fisheries management does its business, of how
4 someone worried about disaster management does
5 their business. It is one of the reasons that
6 both the National Marine Fisheries Service and
7 the Coastal Zone Management programs are
8 interested in weaving that climate thread. It
9 is a factor in what the future holds. So, we
10 ought to look at it.

11 So, when we talk about climate
12 variability and climate change, we want to
13 remind ourselves, as climate scientists, it is
14 not happening in a vacuum. It is happening
15 along with a whole lot of other changes,
16 socioeconomic changes, ecosystem changes,
17 natural resource changes, cultural changes,
18 and in this case this happens to be changing
19 population and changing energy demand
20 associated with that changing population. You
21 can see a lot of the growth, as it has been
22 for quite some time now, is along the coast,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 which has implications for things you do.

2 Another example of the interaction
3 is, if you change rainfall and bring more
4 rainfall into the Mid-Atlantic, which is
5 likely what we will see, according to the
6 climate models, you are going to have more
7 spring runoff, meaning you are bringing in
8 more nitrogen fertilizers. So, you might
9 expect to see more dead zones in the
10 Chesapeake Bay. That is one of the sites.

11 Another one is just a temperature-
12 related scenario with salmon in the Pacific
13 Northwest. This one has to do with ocean
14 acidification. Since I now know you have all
15 heard about ocean acidification before, I am
16 not going to talk about that much.

17 So, in the report, Global Climate
18 Changes Impacts in the U.S., if you read the
19 full report, you will find a chapter on coasts
20 and ecosystems, coastal and marine ecosystems.

21 These are some of the things that the report
22 says, based on the literature, at the time

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 that we did this report. It was released in
2 2009. That meant that those of us who were on
3 the team were writing this report in 2008.

4 So, based on literature published
5 up until 2008, we were able to point to a
6 number of issues that we thought were relevant
7 for an ecosystem. That you may change
8 patterns of ocean circulation, and certainly
9 you are going to change patterns of sea level.

10 There may be small- and large-scale
11 shifts in where species are. And we have a
12 little bit of evidence to the fact that we may
13 be seeing that.

14 And coastal and near-shore
15 ecosystems are already under a great deal of
16 stress in some areas, multiple stresses
17 already. Again, think about adding the
18 climate thread to that tapestry. Sea-level
19 rise, Arctic sea ice ecosystems, particularly
20 and uniquely a challenge, and that some of the
21 surfaces, the ecosystem surfaces, may not be
22 something that can come up.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 When we looked at these issues in
2 the Pacific Islands in the 1998-to-2000
3 timeframe, we talked about the implications of
4 changes in climate for two key economic
5 sectors, tourism and fisheries, which we have
6 heard today matter in this part of the
7 country, too, and I would hazard a guess in
8 the parts of the country where everyone around
9 the table lives and works. And so, you can
10 see just sort of a listing of those kinds of
11 risks and, then, what the implications are.

12 When Steve Murawski was Chief
13 Scientist for the Fisheries Service, he did a
14 study in 2008 and said, from his perspective
15 as the Chief Scientist at NMFS, ocean
16 warmings, changes in the temperature of the
17 water in which the fish are swimming, sea-
18 level rise, which will affect habitats as well
19 as if you are worried about coral reefs,
20 whether the reefs can keep up, ocean
21 acidification, the attribution of climate
22 signals, it would be a really big deal in

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 scientific agencies looking at changing
2 climate right now, whether it is natural
3 variability. How do I attribute it?

4 The floods going on right now,
5 threatening New Orleans and Baton Rouge right
6 now, and flooding the areas around them
7 because we opened the floodgates, so they
8 wouldn't threaten Baton Rouge and New Orleans,
9 is that because of climate change?

10 You can't attribute a single event
11 to climate change. What is happening with
12 those floods is a combination of natural
13 climate processes, like the state of the El
14 Nino. There was an El Nino last year, lots of
15 rain, tremendous snowfall, completely
16 saturated the soil along that basin. And that
17 means that, once that started to melt and you
18 got the rainfall we have had, again driven by
19 where the ocean temperatures in the Pacific
20 are, you get the kind of rainfall and
21 flooding, but it is of historic proportion.

22 People want scientists to be able

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 to attribute that historic event to something.

2 So, this scientific field of attribution is
3 something you are going to hear a lot about
4 over the next 20 to 30 years.

5 We know there are some connections
6 between loss of sea ice in Alaska. We know
7 it. And it is not just for fish, it is also
8 for marine mammals and the communities that
9 depend on them.

10 These are some of the Fisheries
11 Service studies that have been looking at
12 where stocks move if water gets warmer in the
13 ocean, the sea surface gets warmer.

14 This is actually a look at what has
15 actually happened from 1983 to 1987, 2003 to
16 2007, 1973 to 1977, 1993 to 1997, with a
17 couple of different stocks of fish.

18 So, again, signals that show a
19 connection between where a fish stock is and
20 what the temperature is. This is some work on
21 croaker and winter flounder, the same sorts of
22 things, in addition to the geographic change,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 that will bring changes in both where the fish
2 are and how much of the fish you might want to
3 take.

4 Again, ocean acidification. I am
5 not going to talk about it. But it isn't just
6 a tropical issue. My friends in the Northeast
7 fisheries lab remind me that there are lots of
8 calcareous species, species that need calcium
9 shells, and they are not all showing up in the
10 tropics. In this case, some shellfish in New
11 England.

12 So, as we think about what we know
13 about natural variability, what we are seeing
14 as today's trends, which all along just
15 projecting out from today's trends, would
16 present a different future than the past as we
17 have seen it, and questions about how much
18 greenhouse gas emissions we are going to put
19 in the atmosphere. You see different
20 implications.

21 So, there are two things that
22 communities are thinking about when they think

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 about responding to climate. The first is
2 called mitigation. Think about the idea of
3 reducing my threat by reducing the thing that
4 is causing the problem, right? So, that is
5 mitigation. That has to do with our energy
6 policy decisions, our greenhouse gas
7 emissions, that sort of thing.

8 Coupled with mitigation is
9 adaptation. Okay. We know that with the
10 greenhouse gases in the atmosphere today we
11 are committed to a certain amount of continued
12 warming. How are we going to adapt?

13 Even if what we are doing is
14 adapting to today, today is different than 50
15 years ago. There are groups who are working
16 with our Center because they are the folks
17 that set the building standards for energy
18 efficiency. They want to know what numbers to
19 use now because they have used historic
20 normals that don't seem to have any bearing on
21 what we actually see today in terms of
22 temperature, humidity, and rainfall.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 So, adaptation is what we choose to
2 do to make ourselves more resilient, make
3 ourselves less vulnerable and more resilient.

4 So, adaptation is a proactive step that we
5 can take to be prepared for the good and the
6 bad. Mitigation in a climate context is
7 really all about what are we doing with
8 greenhouse gases.

9 So, you can get this on the
10 PowerPoint, some take-home messages.

11 And I am going to stop there and
12 answer questions.

13 So, you have the short version.
14 There is a 92-page complete report, if you
15 want it, always accessible on the web. There
16 are handout materials. So, it is summaries of
17 what each chapter said. Those are also
18 available.

19 And the other document I want to
20 point you to is brand-new. This is from the
21 National Research Council, which is the
22 operating arm of the National Academy of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Sciences in the United States. It is called
2 "America's Climate Choices." It was a multi-
3 year study that Congress mandated for the
4 National Academies to basically take stock of
5 how the nation should think about changing
6 climate.

7 So, it has got everything in it
8 from a chapter, which is an entire volume this
9 big, on what is actually happening, what are
10 we seeing in the changing climate system, to
11 what are our options for mitigation, what are
12 our options for adaptation.

13 It was put together by, as most
14 Academy reports are, a panel of experts, but
15 more than any Academy report I have ever seen
16 in the last 30-some years, this one involved
17 public hearings. It involved people who are
18 trying to make decisions by making a change in
19 climate, like fisheries managers, coming to
20 the table and saying, "This is what we are
21 seeing and this is what we need in the way of
22 information."

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 So, I highly recommend this one.
2 This literally is a week old. This is the
3 synthesis of the overall one again.

4 That's it.

5 CHAIR McCARTY: I'm going to
6 control the questions this time around. I
7 think it is going to go much better if we do
8 that.

9 So, raise your hand if you have a
10 question.

11 DR. SHEA: Yes. Thank you.

12 CHAIR McCARTY: Randy?

13 MR. CATES: I am the skeptic in the
14 room.

15 DR. SHEA: That's okay. It means
16 you are like a scientist.

17 MR. CATES: I am very open-minded
18 to this issue. I became a great skeptic as I
19 started asking questions of NOAA many years
20 ago for the background of the science. And
21 what I have found, and I deal with a lot of
22 scientific issues in fishes, and I am a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 company that provides service to collect data
2 for research. So, I understand keenly how a
3 scientist can manipulate and get a result, the
4 end result --

5 DR. SHEA: Can interpret, yes.

6 MR. CATES: I have seen it
7 firsthand.

8 DR. SHEA: Yes.

9 MR. CATES: I have actually raised
10 the ethics question on the science and got in
11 trouble for that.

12 DR. SHEA: Yes.

13 MR. CATES: So, what raised my
14 concern with global warming, climate change,
15 is when I or others start asking questions for
16 the data, you almost get attacked, and that
17 status is getting increasing.

18 And I think that our communities
19 are getting very skeptical because, if anybody
20 questions it, there is this, "Why are you
21 asking for this data?"

22 DR. SHEA: Uh-hum.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MR. CATES: "Why?" And it is
2 coming across as more of a money-grab thing
3 than anything.

4 And this happened just recently in
5 Hawaii at a neighborhood Board meeting --

6 DR. SHEA: Okay.

7 MR. CATES: -- when a gentleman, a
8 NOAA representative, got a half a million
9 dollar grant to study.

10 DR. SHEA: So, he was a university
11 professor funded by NOAA?

12 MR. CATES: No. No, he was a
13 NOAA --

14 DR. SHEA: He was a NOAA lab
15 person?

16 MR. CATES: Right.

17 DR. SHEA: Okay.

18 MR. CATES: And he is presenting
19 his science, and someone on the neighborhood
20 Board asks about the data collection.

21 DR. SHEA: Uh-hum, uh-hum.

22 MR. CATES: And his response was,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 "Well, if you are not a scientist, you can't
2 interpret it, and, therefore, you can't get
3 the data."

4 DR. SHEA: Right.

5 MR. CATES: So, the problem that I
6 see with this is the message being delivered
7 by NOAA. That is No. 1.

8 DR. SHEA: Okay.

9 MR. CATES: It is, if these facts
10 are to be true, how you get the message out
11 needs corrective action.

12 The second is, and I questioned the
13 way the data was originally collected. My
14 interpretation of things is kind of like
15 cooking. Anybody can go cook a steak. You
16 can get a steak and you can grab the
17 ingredients, you can add it, and you will get
18 an end result that will pretty much taste like
19 a steak.

20 When you go to bake a cake, it is
21 different. If you add the ingredients in the
22 beginning and if you don't measure it

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 properly, you are not going to get a good end
2 result.

3 DR. SHEA: Okay.

4 MR. CATES: And how the temperature
5 readings were, you know, the question is, was
6 that information manipulated and how accurate
7 is that?

8 DR. SHEA: Okay. Yes.

9 MR. CATES: And, then, the other
10 thing in your presentation is we think in time
11 of man's presence on earth.

12 DR. SHEA: Yes.

13 MR. CATES: And you have a 1,000-
14 year thing.

15 DR. SHEA: Yes.

16 MR. CATES: Is that long enough?

17 DR. SHEA: Good question.

18 MR. CATES: Because the earth's
19 climate has been changing forever.

20 DR. SHEA: Yes, and some of the ice
21 cores, you will actually push that temperature
22 and carbon dioxide back 400,000 years. We

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 have never seen the rate of temperature
2 increase and the amount of carbon dioxide in
3 the planet in 400,000 years, based on ice core
4 data.

5 I didn't happen to show that ice
6 core data in my slides, but there is ice core
7 data that pushes that historical record back.

8 And you do see wide variations. They are
9 almost always, in fact, 98.5 percent always
10 tracking carbon dioxide and temperature
11 together. But we have never seen the rate or
12 the concentration. So, part of it is pushing
13 the record back, but, then, teasing out what
14 that record means.

15 Now, to go back to the question of
16 manipulating data, the scientific community is
17 no more or less prone to do that than any
18 other community is. But any individual
19 scientist who is trying to prove his or her
20 hypothesis will use a data analysis technique
21 that proves his or her hypothesis on occasion.

22 One of the things that happened

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 with the temperature record was that you began
2 to see different scientists using different
3 methods, and the range of observed temperature
4 was huge.

5 What has happened over the last 10
6 years, because people like you are raising
7 this question, is, okay, let's all use the
8 same method, and, then, we will use another
9 method, and, then, we will use another method.

10 But we will all use the same thing. And when
11 they all use the same method, they get the
12 same answer.

13 So, the observations themselves --

14 MR. CATES: That might be the
15 problem, though.

16 DR. SHEA: No, it isn't. In other
17 words, if you know that one of those methods
18 tends to give you a warmer answer, you would
19 want to know that that warmer answer is borne
20 out by the observations. So, there are
21 techniques that can be used.

22 Peer review is one of the ways in

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 which the scientific community in climate
2 science, just like in biological sciences,
3 says, is your methodology repeatable? If I
4 take that same temperature record, am I going
5 to get the same result by using by methods?
6 So, basically, you have to go through that
7 process.

8 And the other thing that happened
9 with the temperature record was satellite
10 data. Satellite data didn't seem to
11 correspond to what was observed from the
12 surface until they figured out that there was
13 a mistake in the algorithm through which they
14 were analyzing that data.

15 They made an assumption about how
16 energy waves in the atmosphere would behave
17 based on an old belief, an old hypothesis, an
18 old theory. And so, the temperature increase
19 that you saw, you still saw an increase, but
20 it wasn't dramatic; it is on the surface.

21 They went back and said, you know
22 what, based on basic research, they said that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 assumption was flawed. The algorithm we put
2 in to allow us to read that satellite data was
3 flawed. We need to correct that.

4 It is the same thing that happened
5 with the Antarctica ozone depletion. People
6 missed that springtime drop in ozone over
7 Antarctica for decades because it didn't fit
8 into our mental paradigm, our scientific
9 paradigm, of what we should be looking for.

10 So, we constantly have to evolve
11 that paradigm, and those evolving paradigms
12 have to change the way in which we interpret
13 data, we analyze the data.

14 The other thing I would like to say
15 is that this is a particular challenge for, in
16 my opinion -- this is me speaking, not NOAA
17 -- in the climate change arena we are
18 particularly challenged because many of our
19 scientists in this field are so convinced that
20 this is a threat to humankind that they become
21 scientist-activists when they speak about
22 things publicly. It is their choice to do

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 that.

2 There is a whole field of research
3 into science and how you do objective science
4 and when you choose, as an individual, as a
5 human being, to be an honest broker, is the
6 way this particular scientist, Roger Pielke,
7 Jr., talks about it. He says, "You can choose
8 to be an honest broker, and the other end of
9 the spectrum is you choose to be a science-
10 advocate or activist."

11 So, oftentimes, what you find is
12 there are a group of people in and out of
13 science in the climate world who are really
14 trying to get us to focus on changing our
15 behavior. And so, when they tell the story,
16 they are telling the story to achieve that
17 objective. It is the same thing that happens
18 in a lot of fields.

19 It is particularly damaging in the
20 climate science arena, and we definitely
21 recognize it. So, we try very, very, very
22 hard, when a NOAA certificate goes on data,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 that, in fact, it has met the highest quality
2 standards, not just of the observations, but
3 of the analysis. Are we going to make
4 mistakes? Of course. That is what science is
5 about, right? But we are really cautious
6 about saying that it is the politician's role,
7 the NGO's role, our role as individuals, but
8 not the science agency's role to take the data
9 and present it in a way that forces action.
10 We want to present data in a way that forces
11 the discussion that leads to action, if that
12 helps.

13 MR. CATES: All that other stuff,
14 the one thing I am finding working with a lot
15 of scientists is that climate change means
16 funding.

17 DR. SHEA: But it doesn't --

18 MR. CATES: For a lot of them, it
19 does. And the ones that are skeptics that
20 look at it will tell me, they will flat out
21 say, you know, "You lose funding if you
22 question this."

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 And when it comes to peer review,
2 that is the biggest concern, what I would
3 equate that a lot of scientists have with this
4 issue is, you are going to get peer-reviewed
5 for this --

6 DR. SHEA: Yes, yes.

7 MR. CATES: -- because so many
8 people, they are getting funding for this.
9 And so, it is not hard to get people to agree
10 with you on this subject.

11 And so much of our budget and so
12 much of our policy decisions are hinged upon
13 this. We cannot afford --

14 DR. SHEA: To get it wrong.

15 MR. CATES: -- to get it wrong.

16 DR. SHEA: I agree with you.

17 MR. CATES: Either way.

18 DR. SHEA: Yes, I agree with you.

19 It is a very important caution, yes.

20 We had a question on this side.

21 MR. CLAMPITT: Yes. Thank you,

22 Madam Chair.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 I am a skeptic also.

2 DR. SHEA: Okay.

3 MR. CLAMPITT: And there have been
4 some late editions of data coming out, and I
5 don't know if you respect where it comes from
6 or not; you might have a comment on that. But
7 Christy from Alabama, Huntsville --

8 DR. SHEA: Uh-hum, uh-hum.

9 MR. CLAMPITT: -- they keep track
10 of satellite data.

11 DR. SHEA: Uh-hum.

12 MR. CLAMPITT: And the temperature
13 has flattened out for the last 15 years.

14 DR. SHEA: Right.

15 MR. CLAMPITT: Which doesn't fit
16 well with the models.

17 DR. SHEA: Right. And there are a
18 couple of things about it. First of all, the
19 satellite data record is a limited record. It
20 is not nearly as long as the surface records.

21 So, it is difficult to place a short observed
22 record in a model scenario that is thousands

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 of years long. So, one thing is there is a
2 short record.

3 The second is, what exactly is the
4 satellite measuring? Is it measuring the
5 temperature at the same place, at the surface
6 of the earth, the land and the ocean, versus
7 in the atmosphere, in the troposphere, within
8 a certain range?

9 The land surface observing is right
10 there on the surface. So, there may be a
11 distinction between what is happening there
12 and what is happening several thousand feet
13 up, which is within the realm of what the
14 satellites are measuring.

15 So, one of the fields of research
16 is, how do we actually take satellite data
17 with land-based data and create a coherent and
18 credible record of climate as it has been
19 changing over the period of record where you
20 have satellites? It is one of the things that
21 is a new program inside my part of NOAA, is
22 specifically looking at the satellite data.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Christy is one of the guys that is getting
2 funded by this program to see if we can't
3 clarify why there is a difference.

4 MR. CLAMPITT: There is also, you
5 know, the controversy of the urban heat island
6 effect.

7 DR. SHEA: Yes. Now the urban heat
8 island effect is a little bit easier to deal
9 with because the surface temp records that you
10 use for climate studies, for these long-term,
11 100-year studies, those are stations that have
12 not moved and have not had cities grow around
13 them.

14 So, you can only use a subset of
15 the observance systems for weather to do
16 climate studies like this. You must choose
17 climate stations that have not been moved
18 significantly from a forest to an airport or
19 have not had a city or some development grow
20 up around them. So, you have to be very
21 careful about where you choose them.

22 So, you can get around the urban

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 heat island by choosing not to complicate your
2 life by using a station that 100 years ago
3 didn't have a city around it, and now, like
4 the station on top of the building where I
5 live in Asheville, it is in the middle of
6 downtown Asheville now. Well, 100 years ago,
7 downtown Asheville wasn't what it is today.

8 So, you want to make sure that when
9 you are building a climate network, a network
10 to observe these long-term trends, that you
11 are choosing stations that are not and have
12 not seen that kind of change.

13 MR. CLAMPITT: Are you saying that
14 they have eliminated those false stations --

15 DR. SHEA: What they do is they use
16 them, but they put an asterisk, like a good
17 scientist would, that says, "By the way, in
18 the last 50 years, there's this much growth in
19 asphalt around this station."

20 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay, one more,
21 and, then, we will go to Julie.

22 MR. CLAMPITT: All right. Well,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 okay, then, I will --

2 CHAIR McCARTY: That's okay.

3 MR. CLAMPITT: I guess I will have
4 to go with Richard Muller from Berkeley who is
5 a physicist --

6 DR. SHEA: Yes.

7 MR. CLAMPITT: -- and he studied
8 the IPCC finding models.

9 DR. SHEA: The IPCC models.

10 MR. CLAMPITT: And you know, there
11 is a lot of variability in how they handle
12 clouds.

13 DR. SHEA: Yes. Yes.

14 MR. CLAMPITT: And his point is
15 that, if they are wrong about a cloud to have
16 it come up that very -- they haven't done a
17 very good job, and that if there is some
18 negative feedbacks --

19 DR. SHEA: Right.

20 MR. CLAMPITT: -- in the clouds, it
21 would throw off their --

22 DR. SHEA: Projections of the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 temperature.

2 MR. CLAMPITT: By 2 percent, which
3 would actually eliminate it. It would make it
4 all natural, not human.

5 DR. SHEA: Yes, it could.

6 MR. CLAMPITT: What I am getting at
7 is these people, I mean to say that it is
8 unequivocal and that there is no --

9 DR. SHEA: I don't think I said
10 that.

11 MR. CLAMPITT: I mean, well, it is
12 right here, actually. It is right here,
13 "unequivocal."

14 DR. SHEA: Which is what the IPCC
15 said, right.

16 MR. CLAMPITT: And to say that, and
17 then, if you dig into the research, I mean you
18 could find hundreds of scientists -- Richard
19 Lindzen from MIT, John Christy from Alabama --

20 DR. SHEA: Right.

21 MR. CLAMPITT: -- Roy Spencer,
22 William Haber from Houston, Richard Muller

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 from Berkeley --

2 DR. SHEA: Right. They are all
3 getting funded --

4 MR. CLAMPITT: Yes.

5 DR. SHEA: -- to do this kind of
6 research, to help us get at this.

7 MR. CLAMPITT: But they disagree.

8 DR. SHEA: Yes, and they talk about
9 that very openly.

10 MR. CLAMPITT: So, what I am
11 getting at is that to say that you don't have
12 any controversy, and you haven't said that,
13 but --

14 DR. SHEA: But the IPCC did. No,
15 it is an important point. The IPCC report
16 did, the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate
17 Change, right?

18 MR. CLAMPITT: Yes.

19 DR. SHEA: It is important to
20 remember that where that statement appears is
21 in what is the called "the Summary for
22 Policymakers." The language in the Summary

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 for Policymakers in the IPCC is negotiated
2 word for word, comma for comma, semicolon for
3 semicolon by representatives of government,
4 not the scientists, who are in negotiation to
5 achieve an objective, which is the United
6 Nations Framework for Climate Change, which is
7 reduce emissions.

8 So, remember that some of those
9 statements are in what is written by
10 policymakers for policymakers to get at a
11 particular choice.

12 If you look at the Science Report
13 in IPCC, you would never see that language.
14 You would never see that language in the
15 Science Report.

16 And that is another part of this
17 communication issue. I take that one really
18 to heart. For me, my personal position on
19 managing risk in my life says I see enough in
20 the evidence for me to think we could take
21 some action. So, I do it myself in my own
22 life.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 But that doesn't mean that
2 everybody should do that. That's me making a
3 risk assessment, making a choice. That is
4 what this is about for all of us. It is about
5 risk assessment that we each go through, that
6 we collectively go through in the places where
7 we live and as agencies. And so, we have to
8 think about it as a risk assessment activity.

9 So, Julie has the last word.

10 CHAIR McCARTY: Yes, she is the
11 last one.

12 I have to say, Paul, I wish we
13 could go longer.

14 MR. CLAMPITT: Oh, that's fine.

15 CHAIR McCARTY: But I think we at a
16 certain point have to just admit that we are
17 in different places on the spectrum of belief
18 here.

19 DR. SHEA: But the interesting
20 thing is that these challenges that are
21 forcing the science to study the differences.

22 CHAIR McCARTY: Good. It is very

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 legitimate.

2 DR. SHEA: And that is important to
3 do.

4 MR. CATES: But there is one
5 problem with the statement that is made over
6 and over. In the past five years, we have had
7 countless presenters come in and say, "Well,
8 we all agree on this issue." And I guess the
9 point is we don't all agree, and particularly
10 with NOAA, who is spreading the message. I
11 think they are spreading the wrong message
12 because I personally heard through the IPCC
13 report stated in Hawaii just two months ago
14 from a NOAA employee saying, "It's
15 irrefutable. The research is right here."
16 And what she just explained is it is not
17 necessarily --

18 CHAIR McCARTY: No, what I said was
19 I think some of us are on different steps or
20 in different places on the scale of believing
21 what we hear about this issue. That is what I
22 said.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 I don't think -- and I could be
2 wrong -- but I don't think we are going to
3 reach consensus viewpoint as a group here in
4 order to give some clear directions to NOAA.
5 But I could be wrong. And if that is your
6 goal, then we can try for that kind of
7 discussion. But I actually think it would
8 probably be unsuccessful. I could be wrong.

9 I am just hearing that there are
10 people in the group who feel quite strongly
11 that perhaps the evidence is either wrong or
12 is being interpreted incorrectly or is being
13 communicated incorrectly. So, we, therefore,
14 I don't think can arrive at a consensus piece
15 of advice at all to the leadership here on
16 this subject.

17 So, that is kind of where I am at,
18 Randy. Again, I could be wrong.

19 But, Julie?

20 MS. MORRIS: Well, I just wanted to
21 say that my office is at eight feet above sea
22 level; my home is at 21 feet above sea level.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 My community has already spent millions of
2 dollars to retrofit the stormwater systems
3 that no longer operate at high tide because
4 they are full of saltwater from an ICC level.

5 So, I am completely onboard with
6 adaptation strategies for people living in
7 coastal areas. But, also, it seems like we
8 have a special responsibility, and it seems to
9 be addressed in the Action Plans, to advise
10 NOAA Fisheries and NOAA on adaptation
11 strategies for the living resources that NOAA
12 is responsible for managing, and thinking long
13 term about it.

14 We know in Texas that they don't
15 catch flounder in the south part of Texas as
16 much as they did before, and they are catching
17 more flounder in the north part of Texas. And
18 people are pretty clear that that is an ocean
19 temperature signal.

20 So, we should be helping NOAA
21 Fisheries to figure out, if they are going to
22 work on adaptation strategies for living

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 resources, what are the priority areas to be
2 doing that, and I hope that we can do that.

3 CHAIR McCARTY: Yes, I agree with
4 you. In Alaska, it is exactly the same
5 situation. There are multiple changes in
6 resource areas, I suppose you could call it,
7 and most people believe that it is because of
8 change-in-temperature issues.

9 So, whether or not you believe the
10 story of how it happens, that it happens seems
11 to be incontrovertible, at least off the coast
12 of Alaska. So, coping strategies or
13 mitigation strategies --

14 MR. CATES: I don't think there is
15 any dispute the climate is changing. The
16 question is, did man cause it, No. 1? And, so
17 what? The earth has been changing since its
18 existence.

19 You can go to Alaska in Kodiak.
20 When I first went there, they originally had
21 shrimp processing plants there. They are no
22 longer there. Well, that happened long before

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 all of this happened. Our fisheries didn't,
2 couldn't change.

3 So much of our budget is going into
4 this in NOAA and our fisheries management. I
5 don't think that it is necessarily man is
6 causing it, and adaptation is there, but
7 great. We have got to adapt. Man has always
8 done that. I mean, what's worse, warming or
9 cooling?

10 (Laughter.)

11 CHAIR McCARTY: No, I understand
12 your point.

13 MR. CLAMPITT: I just want to make
14 one comment about the sea-level rise. I have
15 got a peer-reviewed article that just came
16 out, 2010, from the Director Emeritus of the
17 University of Florida, of the Civil
18 Engineering Department, Civil Engineering. He
19 is with the Corps of Engineers.

20 He states that in this part of the
21 State, through two-level gauges, that sea-
22 level exploration has practically stopped at

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 .15 meters. He predicts it will rise .15
2 meters between 2010 and 2100.

3 So, this is peer-reviewed. This
4 man worked in the United States Government.
5 And I am looking at it right here. He is
6 saying that "the 20th century sea-level trend
7 of 1.7 millimeters would produce a rise of
8 only approximately 1.5".

9 So, my point is, you know, I think
10 we are scaring the children for no good
11 reason.

12 CHAIR McCARTY: Cathy?

13 MS. FOY: I think the popular press
14 kind of grabs hold of the scariest things,
15 actually. But what you are seeing are at
16 least ongoing sides of a dialog.

17 Eileen is saying somebody is taking
18 the data and they are looking at it with their
19 method. And, then, they report on it in the
20 scientific literature.

21 All that peer-reviewed means is
22 that other scientists have looked at that and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 said, okay, given what you did, you used
2 standard practices and you came up with it,
3 and your conclusions follow along with that.

4 Now that doesn't necessarily mean
5 that, because it is peer-reviewed, that it is
6 right. The whole thing about science is it
7 has to be repeatable. So, one person saying
8 it does not --

9 MR. CLAMPITT: I understand.

10 MS. FOY: I know you do, but all
11 you are seeing is he is saying, "This is what
12 I have found." And it is kind of like he is
13 putting it out there. "Okay, now what do the
14 rest of you guys see?"

15 So, if you keep watch on that same
16 topic, as time goes by, you will see other
17 scientists kind of following along the same
18 line. "Well, here is what I found when I
19 looked at this set of data" or "Here is what I
20 found in looking at sea levels somewhere
21 else."

22 It is the long-term flow that you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 need to be more aware of instead of the one
2 little case study.

3 MR. CLAMPITT: I have been paying
4 very close attention to this.

5 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. All right.
6 We are going to stop this discussion at this
7 point --

8 MR. CLAMPITT: Okay.

9 CHAIR McCARTY: -- because we are
10 75 minutes behind, approximately, close. I
11 think we were a little overambitious in our
12 agenda today.

13 Heather Young is here.

14 I guess what I need to ask you,
15 Heather, is --

16 MS. YOUNG: Yes?

17 CHAIR McCARTY: -- if you are going
18 to be available tomorrow?

19 MS. YOUNG: No, I am not.

20 CHAIR McCARTY: You're not? Okay.
21 Well, then, we don't have a choice.
22 I thought maybe we did.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 We have a joint committee meeting
2 scheduled for right now, but I think if we are
3 going to hear from you, we are going to need
4 to hear from you now.

5 MS. YOUNG: All right.

6 CHAIR McCARTY: And I'm sorry to
7 keep you waiting --

8 MS. YOUNG: No, that's fine.

9 CHAIR McCARTY: -- and wondering
10 when you were going to be on.

11 So, I would like to introduce
12 Heather Young. She works with NMFS in the
13 Southeast Region Habitat Conservation
14 Division, and she is the NOAA Coordinator for
15 the Gulf of Mexico Ecosystem Restoration Task
16 Force.

17 Now this was a presentation that
18 was going to be done by John Hankinson. We
19 are sorry he wasn't able to come, but Heather
20 is going to give the presentation that he was
21 going to give.

22 And, then, we will do the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 discussion on this tomorrow. We are not going
2 to go into anything more than the presentation
3 today.

4 MS. YOUNG: I am going to beg your
5 forgiveness on this.

6 So, thanks for the introduction.
7 John Hankinson is very sorry he could not be
8 here. I was asked yesterday if I could cover
9 this for him and to give you a little bit of
10 information about the Gulf Coast Ecosystem
11 Restoration Task Force.

12 So, my apologies I wasn't here this
13 morning for John. I look a little different
14 than John.

15 (Laughter.)

16 But I wanted to find out how many
17 of you are from the Gulf Coast Region.

18 I know you are from all over.
19 About three or four.

20 And, then, have any of you
21 participated at meetings for the Gulf Coast
22 Ecosystem Restoration Task Force at either

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 public meetings or listening sessions?

2 Some of you? Some of you have;
3 others haven't.

4 So, maybe some of this is new
5 information. I wanted to give you a little
6 bit of background about the effort and how,
7 then, the Task Force was organized, and, then,
8 to ask some questions, maybe stimulate a
9 little discussion, which it sounds like this
10 group, even though it is 4:30 or 4:40, might
11 still be prone to do, which is good. That's
12 what we want.

13 (Laughter.)

14 So, the Gulf Coast Ecosystem
15 Restoration Task Force and how it was
16 established, I know you are all painfully
17 familiar with the Deepwater Horizon incident.

18 The immediate emphasis for establishment of
19 this Task Force was this event. It was really
20 something that catapulted the Gulf Coast
21 region to the eyes of policymakers in
22 Washington, D.C.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 But this effort extends far above
2 and beyond response to the oil spill. It is
3 much broader in scope.

4 It was brought forth, though, it
5 was I guess highlighted out of this incident
6 that we really need to do a better job of
7 managing and restoring and protecting our Gulf
8 Coast region in partnership with the Gulf
9 Coast communities.

10 So, in June, President Obama, I
11 think you probably all were watching the
12 address when he mentioned that he had big
13 plans for the region, that he was looking to
14 do a restoration plan that would address the
15 long-term ecological declines of this region,
16 was part of his response, but extending
17 beyond.

18 The Gulf Coast is a working coast.
19 Ninety percent of our oil and gas comes from
20 the Gulf Coast, or of our nation's offshore
21 oil and gas. So, it is very important and it
22 is a way of life for us in the Gulf region.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 We have one-third of the seafood
2 production in the continental United States
3 comes from the Gulf. We have seven of the top
4 ten ports in the nation. So, it is pretty
5 important to the national economy. And a lot
6 of us love it and live there, and love to
7 recreate there, too.

8 This report, I think you have all
9 heard of the Mabus Report. President Obama
10 and the Administration charged the Secretary
11 of the Navy with developing a recommendations
12 report of how you might want to respond to the
13 spill, but, also, of how you would restore the
14 Gulf Coast related to these long-term
15 ecological and economic declines.

16 So, this report came out in I
17 believe September, late September. And some
18 of the conclusions you can see here. These
19 are the take-home messages from that report
20 back to the Administration about how to
21 approach Gulf Coast ecosystem restoration.

22 MR. CATES: Can I ask a question?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. YOUNG: Sure.

2 MR. CATES: Did you say the
3 Secretary of the Navy he asked?

4 MS. YOUNG: Yes, sir.

5 MR. CATES: Why would he ask him?

6 MS. YOUNG: Well, in this effort,
7 too, think about it coming off of the oil
8 spill as well.

9 DR. DANA: He is a former leader of
10 the one of the Gulf states. So, he just had
11 good relationships and experience.

12 MS. YOUNG: Right, and this effort,
13 too, is looking at both economic recovery and
14 ecological recovery.

15 But the conclusions that came out
16 of this particular report were basically kind
17 of a call to arms as far as saying what we
18 would recommend is that you would establish
19 immediately -- you know, you have a spill
20 response transitioning into a recovery-based
21 response and an assessment period. But we
22 need a body that is looking out for the Gulf

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Coast long term and that is coordinating
2 efforts.

3 And so, he recommended this effort,
4 not just the Secretary, but it was recommended
5 that we establish, congressionally
6 established, a Gulf Coast Ecosystem
7 Restoration Council. But in order to get
8 started on this effort, there was an Executive
9 Order that was issued to go ahead and get
10 started now, to start developing a restoration
11 strategy for the Gulf of Mexico region. And
12 that started as of October 5th, when this
13 Executive Order came out.

14 It was also recommended that
15 Congress establish a Gulf Coast Restoration
16 Fund. And the recommended source of funding
17 for that would be from the penalties from the
18 Deepwater Horizon incident that are levied
19 through the Clean Water Act penalties. So,
20 Congress hasn't done that yet, but there are a
21 number of bills in the House and the Senate to
22 do just that.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 And potentially, based on the
2 knowledge that I have, the low end of what
3 might be available, should that become
4 established, would be \$5 to \$6 billion.

5 CHAIR McCARTY: Billion?

6 MS. YOUNG: Billion, yes. But, you
7 know, that sounds like a huge amount of money.

8 When you start looking at a lot of the large-
9 scale ecosystem restoration projects that
10 might be proposed -- I don't know if they will
11 be proposed -- but major diversions or also
12 restoration projects along all the Gulf Coast
13 states, that money is spent really quickly.
14 Still, it is a lot more than we have ever seen
15 in a region coming from something like that,
16 but people are already ready to spend it, and
17 it will go quickly, should it happen.

18 (Laughter.)

19 So, this is underway. And the last
20 bullet there is that there should be
21 coordination between ecosystem restoration and
22 economic recovery and long-term ecological

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 health, health of the Gulf Coast.

2 So, here you have, and I got a
3 little bit ahead of myself, but we have an
4 Executive Order that came out after this
5 report was produced. And the Executive Order
6 recommended five things, or actually required
7 five things. Excuse me.

8 This strategy for the Gulf Coast,
9 which is due back to the Administration on
10 October 5th this, one year to the date of the
11 Executive Order, but that strategy -- and
12 these are pretty common-sense -- include
13 ecosystem restoration goals and a vision for
14 the Gulf Coast.

15 We have lots of ecosystem
16 restoration and recovery plans in the Gulf,
17 and there is a huge cry, and a good one, not
18 to just develop another plan, but, instead, to
19 utilize the existing plans to mine some of the
20 golden nuggets from those plans and empower
21 them and move them forward.

22 But to also utilize a task force

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 and some of the leadership in government to
2 really recognize, well, all these claims
3 exist; what is it that we are doing wrong?
4 Why aren't we moving forward with Gulf Coast
5 ecosystem restoration/protection like we think
6 we should? And to try to escalate that
7 forward. But it is not starting over.

8 The next one is to really identify
9 areas. We have so many federal agencies and
10 state agencies focused not only on the Gulf,
11 but on all of the regions in the U.S., but to
12 coordinate those efforts and to look at how we
13 are approaching them in the Gulf more
14 comprehensively, and, hopefully, much more
15 efficiently with the resources that we have
16 already at our disposal.

17 And in doing so, to look at what
18 can we do with the resources we already have?

19 Where are existing programs insufficient?
20 Are there areas of research or restoration or
21 protection that need to be proposed to augment
22 what we already have?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 And to really base this restoration
2 strategy on very sound science and adaptive
3 management, to where we start acting now, but
4 as we learn more information about alternative
5 energy, more information about working with
6 the oil and gas industry, more information
7 about coastal and marine spatial planning,
8 more information about climate, that we are
9 utilizing that information and changing course
10 along the way.

11 So, this might drive you crazy
12 looking at it. So, don't try to read the
13 words. But what I wanted to point out is kind
14 of the way the strategy is being developed and
15 some key dates that we have set internally for
16 the Task Force to make sure that we meet the
17 goal or meet the requirements set by the
18 President.

19 And the colors here represent, let
20 me see, so the kind of puke yellow here
21 (laughter), that was a bad description, but
22 that is the Task Force staff. And I will show

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 you how the Task Force is set up in just a
2 second. But those are what the staff that are
3 detailed to the Task Force are working on.

4 And the Task Force itself, meaning
5 the principal members, the heads of 11 federal
6 agencies or federal bodies and the five states
7 are in blue.

8 And, then, you have green as public
9 coordination efforts, either through listening
10 sessions or going out and meeting with
11 industry, meeting with fishermen, meeting with
12 local communities.

13 And, also, you can see on here the
14 natural resource damage assessment process is
15 going on separately at this whole time,
16 responding to the spill. But a lot of the
17 input that we are getting through the natural
18 resource damage assessment public meetings
19 pertains maybe not to the natural resource
20 damage assessment process, but a lot of that
21 public input is very useful. We are making
22 sure that we take that input and incorporate

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 it and utilize it, because these communities
2 get tapped and tapped and tapped again. We
3 want to make sure all that is being captured.

4 So, we just had it is called a
5 draft discussion document. It is really a
6 very small, three-page document. I sent it to
7 Heidi to make sure that she could forward it
8 to all of you, and I believe it is in your
9 annotated agenda already.

10 But that was a brief, three-page
11 document about overarching goals for the
12 strategy at this point, using all the
13 information that we have gotten from the
14 public and from the state and federal agencies
15 of what the overarching goals would be for a
16 strategy, and to try to get more input. Are
17 these the right goals? Are we going about
18 this in the right way?

19 So, it doesn't have any detailed
20 action steps in that document yet. Those will
21 be coming soon.

22 But the next version, June 30th, we

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 hope to have a more improved version of the
2 strategy that will set down those action
3 steps. July 30th, we should have a second
4 version of it. And, hopefully, then we can
5 get -- you know, there is a process that we
6 have go through to put this out by the October
7 5th deadline. So, that is kind of what the
8 dates are here.

9 This is just to talk a little bit
10 about the structure and the working groups.
11 You all might be interested in how you might
12 contribute to a working group or
13 recommendations or, if it is of interest at
14 all to you, how you might fit in.

15 Can you guys see behind me?

16 Well, here we have the Task Force
17 members themselves, the head of the state and
18 federal agencies supported by staff detailees
19 in Washington, D.C.

20 And the different level down here
21 is not a hierarchical level, but everything
22 below here are interagency teams that are

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 based in the Gulf Coast region primarily with
2 staff detailees that are working with them.
3 But all of these teams down here consist of
4 both federal members and state members.

5 And they are limited at this point
6 in that membership as set forth by the
7 Executive Order, but, also, by FACA. So, that
8 some members of the teams are state and
9 federal, but we are reaching out through
10 existing advisory committees. There is talk
11 about establishment, as part of the strategy,
12 of both science advisory committees and
13 regional citizens' advisory committees,
14 possibly restoration advisory committees. So,
15 there are going to be advisory committees set
16 up, and you might consider also contacting the
17 Councils themselves if you have an interest or
18 a role contributing information.

19 But here we have the science
20 coordination team, and it consists of seven
21 subgroups. I will read these because I don't
22 know if you can see them. But there's on

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 coastal wetlands and barrier shoreline
2 habitats, one on fisheries, one on community
3 resilience, one on sustainable storm buffers,
4 one on inland habitats and watersheds focused
5 primarily on watershed management, but, also,
6 water quality in the dead zone and hypoxia.
7 And, then, offshore habitats.

8 Then, this last one here is a group
9 that is designed or that is looking at having
10 an actual science program that would continue
11 to inform this restoration strategy throughout
12 the development and implementation. And that
13 would also be a body that would be looking at
14 comprehensive monitoring, long-term
15 monitoring, and making sure we have a
16 programmatic framework, similar to what has
17 been done for Everglades restoration or
18 Chesapeake Bay, and such, that have that
19 science-based program framework.

20 This is a sediment management
21 working group which I will talk about in a
22 minute.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 There is a cross-agency budgeting
2 team that is looking at how we would work
3 across all the federal agencies and, then,
4 hopefully, the state agencies, to direct some
5 of our existing resources to the Gulf, and,
6 also, to inform the federal budgeting process
7 in the future.

8 This is a coastal and marine
9 habitat conservation team that is looking at
10 networking existing protected areas or to also
11 look at how we might manage or work with
12 private landowners where we are doing a lot of
13 talking to the oil and gas industry about some
14 of the properties or the energy industry and
15 other big landowners, seeing how we might work
16 with them to manage for habitat-related
17 interests on their properties and consistent
18 with their energy production goals.

19 This is in an atrocious name.
20 Regional planning technical and policy
21 integration coordination team. So, that just
22 speaks Washington. It is real horrible name,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 but it is the strategy development team. And
2 it is the folks in the state and federal
3 agencies that are working with the Task Force
4 principals themselves to develop the strategy.

5 And, then, the communications team.

6 So, I talked a little bit about the
7 science coordination team, but this team right
8 now has been working straight on defining what
9 those restoration goals should look like,
10 defining baseline conditions for the Gulf, and
11 pulling from the existing ecosystem
12 restoration and planning documents, to say,
13 where are we at and where do we want to go?
14 What do resilient coastal communities
15 potentially look like in the future? What do
16 healthy fisheries look like? But, instead of
17 just bringing that up, pulling from a lot of
18 the existing reports to do that.

19 But, then, also, this team is also
20 charged with developing that scientific,
21 programmatic framework, which you can see in
22 that -- this is a new subgroup, but something

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that would be an existing -- or I'm sorry -- a
2 long-term scientific, programmatic framework
3 to underpin the restoration strategy.

4 The sediment management team. In
5 the Gulf Coast, you cannot do ecosystem
6 restoration without really tackling sediment
7 management issues. A lot of that is directly
8 related to the Mississippi River, but it spans
9 across all of the Gulf states.

10 We have sediment storage systems.
11 We also have nutrient problems. We have
12 freshwater limitations and challenges. So, we
13 are looking at river management, but we are
14 also looking at sediment management as it
15 relates to land.

16 But one thing that we noticed, as
17 we were mining all these existing plans, we
18 were looking at over 70. At least 30 of them
19 mentioned sediment management as a top, one of
20 the top priorities, in most cases one of the
21 top two or three priorities.

22 So, there was an effort that some

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of you might be familiar with that was called
2 the Louisiana/Mississippi Road Map. That was
3 an effort that came out about a year, right at
4 a year before the spill. It is kind of eerie.

5 But that effort was looking at
6 management of the Mississippi River and
7 restoration in those two states, and was
8 already an Administration-backed program.
9 Now, with this incident, essentially, they
10 have taken the work that that group was
11 working on related to sediment management and
12 they are expanding it to all five Gulf states.

13 So, that working group that exists
14 has taken those existing members. So, it is
15 not a duplication of effort. They have taken
16 those existing members, but they have also
17 brought in members from the other Gulf states
18 and federal agencies to look across all five
19 states.

20 There is also a team that I am
21 NOAA's habitat lead for the Gulf of Mexico
22 Alliance Habitat Conservation and Restoration

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 team, which is a group that was forged by the
2 five Gulf Governors to do ecosystem
3 restoration and economic recovery in the Gulf.

4 So, that effort was already ongoing, but
5 there are some key missing parts of that
6 effort that, hopefully, then, this Task Force
7 will take and elevate and get the attention
8 and the focus of resources. But they are
9 working closely together.

10 So, there will be a Gulf Coast
11 sediment management strategy that will become
12 a component of the overall Gulf restoration
13 strategy. This is that strategy development
14 team that I mentioned earlier.

15 And something that might be of
16 interest to some of you in the room is the
17 coastal and marine habitat conservation team.

18 This is led by the Fish and Wildlife Service.

19 And again, all the federal agencies and state
20 agencies are participatory on this team.

21 But it is looking at ways to more
22 effectively work with our existing protected

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 areas, or I shouldn't just say "protected,"
2 but areas that have some level of management
3 for habitat and ecosystem-related concerns,
4 but come out with better programs and also
5 better networks in those areas. In some cases
6 there might be reasons to expand those areas
7 or there might be, based on climate science or
8 new information that we have, we might have to
9 rethink about where those areas might be into
10 the future.

11 But it also looks at working with
12 existing private landowners and recognizing
13 that our land in the Gulf region is going to
14 continue to remain in private ownership, and
15 we have to work with these people more
16 effectively. So, this is something that some
17 of you might be interested in looking at.

18 So, this is just, where's the
19 money? How do you do all this stuff? It is
20 great to develop plans and strategies, but how
21 do you make them happen?

22 And so, these are two pieces of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 legislation that are currently proposed as
2 bills. These are both Senate bills. I put it
3 up here just to kind of let you know what is
4 being talked about on some of these. Again,
5 there's, I think it is, four bills in the
6 House, too.

7 So, we don't know what this will
8 look like, but both of these ask for -- you
9 know, you have this Task Force that is already
10 working, but they both recommend establishment
11 of a Restoration Council that would be a
12 longer-enduring entity to continue this work.

13 The one proposed on the left is the
14 one out of Louisiana by Senators Landrieu and
15 Vitter. That one, it is interesting because
16 it doesn't mention the Task Force in that
17 particular bill. So, you don't really know
18 what the thinking is. Are they thinking a
19 different makeup potentially of this body long
20 term?

21 Again, this is just me pulling
22 information from it and kind of looking at the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 differences. But it does propose to amend the
2 Federal Water Pollution Control Act to allow
3 for establishment of this restoration fund.

4 And it calls for 80 percent of the
5 penalties from the Clean Water Act to go to
6 Gulf Coast ecosystem restoration. If you look
7 at the one from Senator Nelson out of Florida,
8 it calls for 100 percent of those penalties to
9 go for Gulf Coast ecosystem restoration.

10 And that particular bill actually
11 throws out and says, okay, this Council would
12 be the Ecosystem Restoration Task Force. So,
13 they approach it a little bit differently.

14 And something that is really
15 interesting is, if you have this fund that
16 might be at a minimum \$4 to \$6 billion, 35
17 percent allocating it to the states to make
18 decisions with of how to restore their coast.

19 The other one proposes to put this into the
20 hands of local political subdivisions, kind of
21 similar to the Coastal Impact Assistance
22 Program. So, they approach it differently.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 This one would have 60 percent of
2 the funds be managed by this Council directly
3 versus 50 percent on the other side. Again,
4 both of these would be distributing according
5 to the strategy that comes out.

6 One calls for a science monitoring,
7 a technology program out of NOAA, with 5
8 percent of the funds. And another one calls
9 for a Fisheries Endowment to be managed by
10 NOAA and the Gulf of Mexico Fishery Management
11 Council.

12 So, again, these are just two
13 examples, and I wanted to put them out there
14 just to show you that they differ a little
15 bit, but there's a lot of similarities.

16 So, this is where the four goals
17 that are in the strategy right now, from
18 mining those 70-some-odd plans, from having, I
19 believe, about 10 public meetings so far in
20 the Gulf region specifically for this effort,
21 but, also, going to all of those and NRDA, the
22 Natural Resource Damage Assessment, meetings

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 and talking to the public there.

2 But this is how we chose to
3 organize the overarching goals for ecosystem
4 restoration for the plan, and revitalizing and
5 building resilient communities. One of the
6 key components of that is looking at storm
7 buffers and how natural ecosystems play into
8 minimizing impacts to residential communities,
9 and trying to look at areas where we might be
10 losing some of this protection with our
11 barrier islands eroding or also with just
12 exposure to sea-level rise and to more potent
13 storms in years to come, but trying to do risk
14 assessment and disaster planning with those
15 communities and, also, make sure we have the
16 science there to help them make informed
17 decisions.

18 The restore and conserve habitat
19 goal, that one is housing the sediment
20 management plans that I mentioned. The reason
21 we are looking at sediment management is how
22 sediments are used to rebuild our deltas, how

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 they are used to rebuild or to maintain our
2 barrier island systems. So, that is where
3 that gets rolled or binned, if you will, the
4 lumping and the splitting of the strategy.

5 And assessing and improving water
6 quality, and working with watersheds to do
7 that. This is supposed to be both a blue
8 water strategy and a coastal strategy.

9 And, then, replenishing of
10 protected living coastal and marine resources.

11 So, that will take into consideration and
12 overlap with the habitat goals and the
13 watershed goals, but it also brings in more
14 effective ecosystem-based species management.

15 So, with that, if you would have
16 this fund, and if part of it is administered
17 by this Council, this would be the overarching
18 goals that, then, projects or programs would
19 be identified to receive or benefit from
20 funding from that portion of the fund.

21 Also, the states would probably, or
22 the local political subdivisions, how that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 plays out would be developing, in accordance
2 with that strategy, how they would parse out
3 the resources.

4 So, these are some of the
5 foundational elements that the public has
6 called for and the federal and state agencies
7 have called for. They want a science-based
8 strategy, one that is not just policy- or
9 politically-based, but one that is really
10 based on what we do know about the Gulf Coast
11 and what it would take to restore Gulf Coast
12 ecosystems.

13 There is a big push for community
14 engagement and outreach and to work to make
15 sure that we stay in touch with what is
16 important to the people that live on the Gulf
17 Coast, and to make sure that we have ongoing
18 dialog.

19 There has been a real loud voice to
20 make sure that you are implementing existing
21 plans and not just starting over, but you are
22 doing it in a way that is bigger than the sum

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of the parts.

2 This is kind of interesting as far
3 as bi-national collaboration. We know that if
4 you are going to manage the Gulf of Mexico
5 region, you have to do it from an ecosystem-
6 based perspective and one that takes into
7 account working bi-nationally. So, we have a
8 lot of things underway, but this just came out
9 or that reaffirmation by the Task Force
10 members, that they do support us working with
11 Mexico to make sure the strategy is something
12 that will really make a difference. I think
13 we all saw with the spill, too, just how
14 important that is, to make sure that we are
15 communicating across our borders.

16 And there is also a big push to
17 coordinate formally with, and it is a part or
18 it is a requirement of the Executive Order as
19 well, to coordinate with federally-recognized
20 tribes in the Gulf region.

21 So, you are all probably exhausted.

22 So, I don't know how dynamic this session

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 will be. You might just want to get to the
2 bar in Key West.

3 (Laughter.)

4 But this is the five key questions
5 that were raised at this last Ecosystem
6 Restoration Task Force meeting in Mobile. Now
7 we have those four goals and the six
8 foundational elements, but really making sure
9 along the way that we are double-checking with
10 groups like this Advisory Committee. Are
11 these the right goals? Are we missing
12 something? And I know you have just seen a
13 skeleton at this point in about a 20-minute
14 talk, but to make sure that we are on the
15 right track.

16 Then, under each of those goals,
17 saying, well, it is nice to have lofty goals
18 that we are going to restore wetlands in the
19 Gulf Coast, but what actions? Where does the
20 rubber hit the road? What types of projects
21 do you want to see? What types of efforts do
22 you want to see put actually on the ground by

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 this? What new programs or actions do you
2 think would be necessary that we don't have
3 the ability to do with our existing resources
4 or that we are not doing right now, to make
5 sure that we don't leave holes?

6 Then, looking at key policy
7 changes, you know, there are some definite
8 problems or square pegs in round holes,
9 however you want to say it, that really kind
10 of limit our ability or have limited our
11 ability for ecosystem restoration and
12 protection on the Gulf Coast. What are some
13 of the areas that we need to get together and
14 really work on across our state and federal
15 agencies? So, as an Advisory Committee, that
16 would be nice to hear from you all as well.

17 And, then, what would success look
18 like at 5 years, at 10 years, at 15 years by a
19 Gulf Coast ecosystem restoration plan?

20 So, I left a slide there just
21 saying, hey, let us hear from you. And I have
22 dates for-- there are public meetings that are

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 set up in each of the five Gulf states. So, I
2 have the dates on here, and I can also, when
3 they come about, make sure that I am sending
4 them back and forth to Heather or Mark to let
5 you know that they are happening. There are
6 also academic sessions that can be
7 participated in.

8 We take comments via a web page as
9 well, and I will be forwarding the
10 documentation coming out for comments.

11 Also, this is an opportunity for
12 you to throw ideas at me that I can take back
13 to Mr. Hankinson and to the Task Force about
14 this effort.

15 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you.

16 I am going to say just kind of keep
17 this relatively short, and we may even get a
18 few minutes of the Committee meeting in before
19 we leave, if we keep it short. We can have a
20 discussion maybe in more detail later.

21 MR. RAFTICAN: And, then, we just
22 separately tee it up for --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIR McCARTY: We only have 15
2 minutes now, and I am not sure we can get
3 through the whole section.

4 MR. RAFTICAN: Right.

5 CHAIR McCARTY: Absolutely, ask
6 questions, as you will.

7 MS. YOUNG: And here's the dates; I
8 scrawled them down, but I will email them out.

9 CHAIR McCARTY: If you would like
10 to ask questions of Heather, I think it is a
11 good time to do it. But I don't want to go
12 into the full discussion of your ideas at this
13 time because I don't think we have time to do
14 it justice.

15 MR. RIZZARDI: So, I was just going
16 to suggest that we kick it to be simultaneous
17 with the Commerce Committee from 3:45 to 5:00
18 tomorrow.

19 CHAIR McCARTY: I think that is a
20 good idea.

21 MS. YOUNG: I'm sorry, I couldn't
22 hear you.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIR McCARTY: In the annotated
2 agenda, people will notice that there are some
3 ideas that Keith has put forward for
4 discussion in preparation to giving you our
5 comments. And that is the part that I don't
6 think we have time to fully discuss at this
7 point. For those of you who want to discuss
8 now other things, that would be great.

9 So, did you have a comment?

10 DR. CHATWIN: I have a question.

11 MS. YOUNG: Sure.

12 DR. CHATWIN: Thank you very much
13 for your presentation. I found it very
14 educational.

15 Just so you know, I am Tony
16 Chatwin. I work with the National Fish and
17 Wildlife Foundation. We will be making some
18 investments in the Gulf with recovered oil
19 funds.

20 MS. YOUNG: Sure.

21 DR. CHATWIN: So, a lot of these
22 questions we have been tackling I think at the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 smaller scale. When you go to the public with
2 these key questions, your four goals are
3 really broad. And so, I think the devil is a
4 bit in the details and it makes it valuable to
5 determine whether or not they are the right
6 ones.

7 MS. YOUNG: Sure.

8 DR. CHATWIN: I don't know; is
9 there a document that goes into more depth?

10 MS. YOUNG: There is not a document
11 that goes into more depth, but there are some
12 existing pre-decisional documents where we are
13 putting around ideas under each of them.

14 And I should have mentioned this,
15 too. There were listening sessions, but there
16 were also expert panels at our last Task Force
17 meeting that went into more detail on each of
18 these a little bit more, that also brought
19 forth to people's specific questions of, okay,
20 for instance, on restoring and conserving
21 habitat, one of the key actions that everyone
22 has put forth, and that we have heard in

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 multiple meetings, and you can look at the
2 comments that have been received to date from
3 the public, but everyone has really called for
4 restoring a distributory hydrology to the
5 Mississippi River as a key component of
6 ecosystem restoration. Now that is a long-
7 term goal.

8 One of the other short-term goals
9 has been beneficial use of sediments to
10 rebuild wetlands and, also, to rebuild barrier
11 islands. So, we had panel discussions and
12 facilitated public input on that. There is
13 not a document that outlines the specific
14 actions at this point.

15 So, I hear what you are saying,
16 that it is hard comment on four very general
17 goals without knowing the pieces.

18 DR. CHATWIN: Is the vision that
19 the end product will have that level of
20 detail --

21 MS. YOUNG: Absolutely.

22 DR. CHATWIN: -- and have

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 quantitative goals?

2 MS. YOUNG: Absolutely.

3 DR. CHATWIN: Qualitative outcomes
4 for each of them?

5 MS. YOUNG: Uh-hum, yes. The
6 strategy would definitely have the who would
7 do what by what time period, what percentage.

8 So, an example might be -- and I am keying in
9 just because I just got off a sediment
10 management call yesterday -- but maybe we come
11 up with a goal of, in order to restore the
12 Gulf Coast, we think that we need to look over
13 50 years of being able to use 80 percent of
14 available sediments and keeping them within
15 the systems, instead of maybe putting them in
16 upper disposal areas, where they are of no use
17 and are taking up land in our coastal zone.

18 So, who does that, how you would
19 get to it, how you would fund it, how you
20 would get local match, because the programs
21 that do that under federal navigation projects
22 require a state and local match, how you would

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 get it doing that. One of the things might be
2 utilizing a portion of these funds to be able
3 to match existing federal programs.

4 So, yes, there would be very
5 specific actions. That is something that,
6 too, if there are specific actions or goals
7 that you all as an Advisory Committee would
8 like to see included, hearing those either by
9 attending a meeting or submitting them in
10 writing or via email, you know, it would be
11 great. We would love to hear back.

12 DR. CHATWIN: May I just have a
13 final question?

14 CHAIR McCARTY: Sure.

15 DR. CHATWIN: You mentioned this
16 item, 70 plans, existing plans, that were used
17 as a resource. Is there a list of those plans
18 somewhere?

19 MS. YOUNG: There is a list.

20 DR. CHATWIN: Fine.

21 MS. YOUNG: I can send them out to
22 you --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 DR. CHATWIN: Yes, that would be
2 great.

3 MS. YOUNG: -- if that would be
4 helpful.

5 DR. CHATWIN: And, then, a final
6 question.

7 MS. YOUNG: Uh-hum.

8 DR. CHATWIN: You mentioned the
9 figure of \$5 to \$6 billion.

10 MS. YOUNG: Uh-hum.

11 DR. CHATWIN: It sounds to me that,
12 as you work through this, as you work through
13 this vision process, that you -- and when I
14 say "you", I mean the Task Force --

15 MS. YOUNG: Right.

16 DR. CHATWIN: -- are considering
17 more sources of funds in addition to the
18 penalties, right? Because it seems that the
19 job, the task is much larger than that.

20 MS. YOUNG: Yes.

21 DR. CHATWIN: That's right?

22 MS. YOUNG: That is the case.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 DR. CHATWIN: Okay.

2 MS. YOUNG: Yes, there is a lot of
3 talk about where there will be, I want to say,
4 more immediate actions and long-term actions.

5 There will also be a call for a discussion of
6 how those funds would be allocated. Would you
7 use a portion of them to get started right off
8 the bat? And, then, the rest of the funds
9 might be reinvested to where there is accruing
10 interest to be able to put toward efforts.

11 But there is also looking at
12 existing sources, existing agency budgets, but
13 trying to network them more efficiently to not
14 duplicate some of the things that we are all
15 working on, but to focus and work across
16 those.

17 DR. CHATWIN: Is there a committee
18 that is working on the finances side of it?

19 MS. YOUNG: Uh-hum. There is a
20 Budget Committee that is set up to look at
21 cross-agency, federal and state agency
22 budgets. Now, at this point, to my knowledge,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that doesn't really include a lot of looking
2 at, say, private industry or other sources
3 beyond either the fund, but long-term that
4 would be a committee that would also be
5 looking at that.

6 DR. CHATWIN: All right. Thank you
7 very much.

8 CHAIR McCARTY: I have a finance
9 question, too, Heather.

10 MS. YOUNG: Sure.

11 CHAIR McCARTY: You mentioned that
12 one of the bills set up the Fisheries
13 Endowment. Does that already exist or is it
14 just a new idea?

15 MS. YOUNG: That is a new idea.

16 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. Because in
17 Alaska --

18 MS. YOUNG: That was proposed in
19 the Nelson bill.

20 CHAIR McCARTY: And you can do
21 that? That is allowed, to do an endowment
22 fund that throws of interest that can be used?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 MS. YOUNG: I can't answer that
2 question. I just can't.

3 MR. REISNER: If there's
4 legislation, you can do it.

5 MS. YOUNG: That is a newly-
6 proposed, congressionally-established --

7 CHAIR McCARTY: But that is what
8 they did in Alaska in part, as you probably
9 know. They put a huge amount of money into an
10 endowment, essentially, and it throws off
11 interest, and that is used in perpetuity
12 thereafter, which works really well, but it
13 doesn't give you the big bump right at the
14 beginning.

15 Anyone else? Julie?

16 MS. MORRIS: You talked about bi-
17 national cooperation.

18 MS. YOUNG: Yes.

19 MS. MORRIS: So, let's not forget
20 about Cuba, and more and more we are
21 discovering resource connections with the
22 Caribbean.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. YOUNG: Absolutely.

2 MS. MORRIS: So, please include
3 those.

4 My understanding is that you are
5 going to be talking about sort of basic
6 research that can be done. Particularly on
7 the West Florida Shelf it is not just going to
8 be restoration, and that is within the scope,
9 right?

10 MS. YOUNG: Yes, it is. It is, and
11 now they are developing that scientific,
12 programmatic framework, but, also, a
13 monitoring, a comprehensive Gulf Coast
14 monitoring, using a lot of the existing
15 monitoring programs but really beefing them
16 up.

17 We saw that there were huge holes
18 with blue water monitoring, for instance, that
19 we really need to fill. So, that has been a
20 really big push. We have heard a lot about
21 that.

22 One of the other things that might

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 be of interest -- and I know we are wrapping
2 up here -- but are you all familiar, too, with
3 the Gulf Research Initiative that was funded
4 by BP and the Gulf of Mexico Alliance that is
5 out there? Did you see the RFP that came out
6 recently?

7 So, there was an effort that was
8 funded. Five hundred million dollars was put
9 forth by BP to respond to the incident, but,
10 also, to look at -- or not "respond," that is
11 the wrong terminology -- but for restoration
12 research, research-related restoration for the
13 Gulf Coast, looking at the fate of oil, the
14 fate of contaminants, its effect on fisheries,
15 its effect on health. And it would go out
16 through an academic consortia in the Gulf.
17 So, that is another source of research that
18 will be ongoing. Of course, that is not being
19 proposed by the Task Force, but information
20 from those peer-reviewed studies could also be
21 a source of information to inform restoration,
22 one of many.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 CHAIR McCARTY: I have a
2 question --

3 MS. YOUNG: Sure.

4 CHAIR McCARTY: -- if everybody
5 else is done.

6 One of the goals of replenishing
7 and protecting living coastal and marine
8 resources, you mentioned a couple of
9 subheadings under that. Could you talk a
10 little bit more about that part? You said
11 ecosystem management tools, I think, in part.

12 MS. YOUNG: Yes, there is a lot of
13 -- and again, that is still shaping. I am
14 going to look at one thing, too, because I
15 want to make sure. Some of these have changed
16 some.

17 But, right now, that is kind of
18 where a lot of offshore monitoring and
19 management components of the strategy for
20 species management would be looking at how we
21 can more effectively work with our existing
22 fisheries management, but, also, looking at

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 endangered species management and habitat
2 management, offshore and in the Coastal Zones.

3 So, that is one area of focus under
4 that, but, also, that is kind of where we see,
5 and it is a lumping and a splitting, but that
6 is kind of where we are defining how we would
7 work with the National Ocean Policy in the
8 Gulf Coast region.

9 And you had some presentations, I
10 think, on the Strategic Action Plans for the
11 National Ocean Policy. The Task Force is
12 working with the National Ocean Council,
13 making sure that they coordinate to where
14 these efforts in the region are consistent and
15 working together.

16 So, how those areas approach living
17 marine resource management is also kind of how
18 we are seeing and getting this together.

19 CHAIR McCARTY: And does that also
20 include potentially aquaculture initiatives?

21 MS. YOUNG: You know, in any of the
22 information that I have seen or put forth,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 that could. That certainly could, but I
2 haven't seen that proposed. I haven't seen
3 that suggested.

4 I take that back. In one of the
5 public meetings, that was proposed. We had
6 one comment to that effect or a couple of
7 comments to that effect in one of the Florida
8 meetings, in the first meeting in Pensacola.

9 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. Thank you.

10 MS. YOUNG: But I haven't seen any
11 robust actions related to aquaculture
12 proposed.

13 CHAIR McCARTY: Do we have any more
14 questions for Heather on this subject? We are
15 going to talk about it later, you know, in
16 more detail.

17 DR. HOLLIDAY: Just a clarification
18 on the timeline for when the strategy's target
19 completion date is, just a refresher.

20 MS. YOUNG: Oh, I am sorry. It is
21 due back to the Administration on October 5th
22 this year.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIR McCARTY: October 5th?

2 MS. YOUNG: Yes. So, again, that
3 is strategy development, not implementation.

4 DR. HOLLIDAY: Right.

5 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you. Thank
6 you very much.

7 I also wanted to give Eileen a
8 round of applause. So, this is going to be
9 for both of you.

10 (Applause.)

11 Okay. Oh, yes, you have a
12 question?

13 MR. DEWEY: I am just following up
14 on your aquaculture comment.

15 MS. YOUNG: Sure.

16 MR. DEWEY: I am from Washington
17 State. I fish in Washington State. I was
18 invited down by the Task Force that Garret
19 Graves chairs --

20 MS. YOUNG: Uh-hum.

21 MR. DEWEY: -- to talk about
22 aquaculture for the oyster effort there.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MS. YOUNG: Oh, great.

2 MR. DEWEY: That is something they
3 have been talking about, is using some more
4 intensive aquaculture techniques as part of
5 the oyster recovery, so that they may be more
6 mobile in the future. Sure, you have to do
7 freshwater conversions again, but, really,
8 that hurt the industry this past time.

9 MS. YOUNG: That is something I
10 will bring, too. That has been a huge push in
11 Texas as well that we have heard. That is one
12 of the things under the habitat management
13 component that has been really proposed. It
14 is really looking at how we can work with the
15 oyster industry, and we are really facing a
16 crisis with shellfish in the Gulf. That is
17 also where we might have our last big chance
18 to have sustainable oyster populations, would
19 be in the Gulf of Mexico region.

20 But there are areas that we have
21 had 90 percent loss of our oysters. For
22 instance, in my own backyard, today we have

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 lost about 90 percent of our reefs.

2 And so, we are looking at a lot of
3 the research, but we are kind of hitting the
4 tipping point to where we are getting to
5 conditions that we won't be able to recover
6 from, unless we do something really actively.

7 So, the aquaculture comment would fit in very
8 well with it.

9 CHAIR McCARTY: Thank you.

10 Anybody else?

11 (No response.)

12 So, we are done with that.

13 We have a couple of other things
14 that we need to talk about. One is the plans
15 for tonight. And second, sort of a timing
16 question.

17 So, Keith, would you like to
18 address the timing for tonight thing?

19 MR. RIZZARDI: Plans for tonight
20 probably don't need to be in the transcript.
21 So, you can do your other one.

22 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. You know we

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 are way behind. We were supposed to be in a
2 Subcommittee group now, but we are not.

3 So, I am wondering if people would
4 like to get together early in the morning for
5 that Subcommittee meeting, to try to catch up
6 with our vast receding schedule. How do you
7 feel about that?

8 Mark, do you have thoughts on that?

9 DR. HOLLIDAY: Yes. So, tomorrow
10 we have two hours set aside to talk about
11 Vision 2030.

12 CHAIR McCARTY: Yes.

13 DR. HOLLIDAY: The idea being that
14 we would spend a good bit of time
15 brainstorming content.

16 CHAIR McCARTY: Uh-hum.

17 DR. HOLLIDAY: But since there is
18 no pressing deadline on whether we do that at
19 the meeting or in a Subcommittee subsequent, I
20 think we could reserve back half of that
21 time --

22 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 DR. HOLLIDAY: -- to the work of
2 this more pressing time, and take advantage of
3 the momentum you generated.

4 CHAIR McCARTY: That sounds
5 reasonable.

6 DR. HOLLIDAY: One suggestion.

7 CHAIR McCARTY: That sounds good.
8 That sounds good.

9 I think you mentioned, Keith, that
10 we should put this discussion into the
11 Commerce Subcommittee?

12 MR. RIZZARDI: No, we could match
13 it. We could have it at the same time as
14 Commerce.

15 CHAIR McCARTY: That is what I was
16 thinking. So, we can kind of put it in the
17 joint Subcommittee Ecosystem and Planning
18 perhaps as well.

19 MR. RAFTICAN: That was where I was
20 going to go. I think we are looking at
21 putting them together. We could have the
22 Committee that is going to deal with some of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 these pressing issues that we talked about
2 today.

3 CHAIR McCARTY: Maybe.

4 MR. RAFTICAN: Maybe.

5 CHAIR McCARTY: Yes.

6 MR. RAFTICAN: But it would work
7 really well with protected species also, you
8 know, the time that they are together.

9 CHAIR McCARTY: Okay. So, let's
10 just figure, then, that we will take it as
11 part of the discussion for that joint
12 Subcommittee meeting tomorrow, this agenda
13 item.

14 MR. RIZZARDI: Right, and we will
15 have a time slot right off the bat, from 9:00
16 to 10:00, that would keep us in plenary over
17 it.

18 CHAIR McCARTY: Right. So, I think
19 that will work. So, we won't be as far behind
20 as we are now.

21 One of the other things I wanted to
22 mention is that people who are on the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 different Subcommittees, it doesn't really
2 matter because anybody can come to any
3 Subcommittee meeting. But the Ecosystem
4 Subcommittee currently is Patty, Cathy, Steve
5 Joner, myself, and Tom Raftican. And the
6 Strategic Planning, Budget, and Program
7 Management is Tony, Patty, Ed Ebisui, Martin
8 Fisher, myself, and Tom Raftican.

9 DR. HOLLIDAY: But everybody is
10 welcome.

11 CHAIR McCARTY: Anybody is welcome.

12 And again, the new members, I ask
13 that you sit in and see if you like it and see
14 what you would like to do in terms of being on
15 either one of those Subcommittees.

16 So, I would like to talk to you,
17 Tom, briefly, but we can talk after.

18 Okay.

19 (Whereupon, at 5:29 p.m., the
20 proceedings in the above-entitled matter were
21 adjourned for the day, to reconvene Wednesday,
22 May 25, 2011.)

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com