Status Review Report

- NOAA Fisheries’ ongoing assessment to determine whether to list 82 Caribbean and Indo-Pacific coral species under the Endangered Species Act (ESA) is the most complex listing process NOAA has ever undertaken.

- We are taking additional time to publicly review the information gathered in our two reports to ensure that our findings and future decisions are based on the best available science.

- During this time, NOAA Fisheries will develop and execute a robust engagement process – and then use this additional input to develop our 12-month finding.

- All public submission of additional information or comments should be submitted by July 31, 2102. Information on how to submit information is available on the web at http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov/stories/2012/04/4_13_12corals_petition.html.

Overview of Status Review Report as Prepared by the Biological Review Team

NOAA Fisheries established a team of federal scientists (the Biological Review Team) to prepare the Status Review Report that examined the status of 82 candidate coral species and evaluate extinction risk for each of them. The team chose to evaluate extinction risk as the likelihood of a species status falling below a Critical Risk Threshold by the year 2100. The team was comprised of: Russell E. Brainard (NOAA), Charles Birkeland (USGS), C. Mark Eakin (NOAA), Paul McElhany (NOAA), Margaret W. Miller (NOAA), Matt Patterson (NPS), and Gregory A. Piniak (NOAA). The Status Review Report was independently peer reviewed by the Center for Independent Experts.

Normally, the information contained a Status Review would include a ‘Management Report’. In the instance of corals, however, the team did not feel it had the expertise to compile and review regulatory mechanisms. Therefore, others experts within NOAA Fisheries prepared a draft Management Report as a separate document. Collectively these two reports constitute the best available scientific and commercial information that we have compiled to date.

Please note that releasing these documents is not a part of the normal rulemaking process – it is only an engagement process that allows us to be transparent and open in our decision making. Should NOAA Fisheries determine that a listing is warranted, it will publish a proposed rule in December 2012 for additional public comment.
Status Review Report of 82 Candidate Coral Species Petitioned Under the U.S. Endangered Species Act

Russell E. Brainard, Charles Birkeland, C. Mark Eakin, Paul McElhany, Margaret W. Miller, Matt Patterson, and Gregory A. Piniak

Pacific Islands Fisheries Science Center
National Marine Fisheries Service
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
U.S. Department of Commerce
About this document

The mission of the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) is to understand and predict changes in the Earth's environment and to conserve and manage coastal and oceanic marine resources and habitats to help meet our Nation's economic, social, and environmental needs. As a NOAA line office, the National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS) conducts or sponsors research and monitoring programs to improve the scientific basis for conservation and management decisions. The NMFS strives to make information about the purpose, methods, and results of its scientific studies widely available.

NMFS’ Pacific Islands Fisheries Science Center (PIFSC) uses the NOAA Technical Memorandum NMFS series to achieve timely dissemination of scientific and technical information that is of high quality but inappropriate for publication in the formal peer-reviewed literature. The contents are of broad scope, including technical workshop proceedings, large data compilations, status reports and reviews, lengthy scientific or statistical monographs, and more. NOAA Technical Memoranda published by the PIFSC, although informal, are subjected to extensive review and editing and reflect sound professional work. Accordingly, they may be referenced in the formal scientific and technical literature.

A NOAA Technical Memorandum NMFS issued by the PIFSC may be cited using the following format:


For further information direct inquiries to
Chief, Scientific Information Services
Pacific Islands Fisheries Science Center
National Marine Fisheries Service
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
U.S. Department of Commerce
2570 Dole Street
Honolulu, Hawai’i 96822-2396

Phone: 808-983-5386
Fax: 808-983-2902

Cover: Photographs courtesy of JEN Veron and MG Stafford-Smith, Coral ID 2002.
Status Review Report of 82 Candidate Coral Species Petitioned Under the U.S. Endangered Species Act

Russell E. Brainard¹, Charles Birkeland², C. Mark Eakin³, Paul McElhany⁴, Margaret W. Miller⁵, Matt Patterson⁶, Gregory A. Piniak⁷

¹Pacific Islands Fisheries Science Center
National Marine Fisheries Service
2570 Dole Street, Honolulu, Hawai`i 96822-2396

²U.S. Geological Survey
Hawai`i Cooperative Fishery Research Unit
Honolulu, Hawai`i 96822

³Center for Satellite Applications and Research
NOAA Coral Reef Watch
1335 East West Hwy, Silver Spring, Maryland 20910-3226

⁴Northwest Fisheries Science Center
National Marine Fisheries Service
2725 Montlake Boulevard East, Seattle, Washington 98112

⁵Southeast Fisheries Science Center
National Marine Fisheries Service
75 Virginia Beach Drive, Miami, Florida 33149-1099

⁶South Florida / Caribbean Inventory & Monitoring Network
National Park Service
18001 Old Cutler Road Suite 419, Miami, Florida 33157

⁷National Centers for Coastal Ocean Science
National Ocean Service
101 Pivers Island Road Beaufort, North Carolina 28516

NOAA Technical Memorandum NMFS-PIFSC-27
September 2011
The use of trade, firm, or corporation names in this publication does not constitute an official endorsement or approval of any product or service to the exclusion of others that may be suitable.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Many subject matter experts graciously offered their time and expertise when called upon by the Biological Review Team (BRT), particularly early in the process of initiating this status review of the 82 candidate coral species. While the technical input from each of the subject matter experts is greatly appreciated, some deserve particular recognition. Jean Kenyon (formerly with the University of Hawai‘i Joint Institute for Marine and Atmospheric Research-NOAA Coral Reef Ecosystem Division and currently with the United States Fish and Wildlife Service [USFWS], Honolulu, Hawai‘i) researched and prepared presentations about the process used to arrive at the list of petitioned species, and did extensive research into the distribution records of the Pacific coral species. Zac Forsman provided informative and timely updates on developments in the field of molecular systematics of corals. Charles Veron and Mary Stafford-Smith graciously gave permission for use of the photos from Coral ID, a CD set available from the Australian Institute of Marine Science that was very helpful as a centralized source of relevant information about the 82 candidate coral species.

Subject matter experts who gave presentations at workshops, or participated in phone consultations, in which they shared their expertise with the BRT include the following in alphabetical order:

Marlin Atkinson, University of Hawai‘i (UH) Hawai‘i Institute of Marine Biology (HIMB), Kāne‘ohe, Hawai‘i
Eric Brown, National Park Service, Molokai, Hawai‘i
Steve Coles, Hawai‘i Biological Survey, Honolulu, Hawai‘i
Dick Feely, NOAA Pacific Marine Environmental Laboratory, Seattle, Washington
Douglas Fenner, Dept. Marine & Wildlife Resources, American Samoa
Mike Field, U.S. Geological Survey, Santa Cruz, California
Zac Forsman, UH HIMB, Kāne‘ohe, Hawai‘i
Ronald Hoeke, UH Joint Institute for Marine and Atmospheric Research [JIMAR]-NOAA Coral Reef Ecosystem Division (CRED), Honolulu, Hawai‘i
Paul Jokiel, UH HIMB, Kāne‘ohe, Hawai‘i
Jean Kenyon, UH JIMAR-CRED, USFWS, Honolulu, Hawai‘i
Chris Langdon, University of Miami, Miami, Florida
Lynn Maguire, Duke University, Durham, North Carolina
Jim Maragos, USFWS, Honolulu, Hawai‘i
Richard H. Randall, University of Guam, Mangilao, Guam
Bernardo Vargas-Ángel, UH JIMAR-CRED, Honolulu, Hawai‘i

Three reviewers from the Center for Independent Experts provided very thorough independent external peer reviews and comments that greatly improved the manuscript:

Terry Hughes, Australian Research Council Centre of Excellence for Coral Reef Studies, James Cook University, Townsville, Australia
John McManus, Rosenstiel School of Marine and Atmospheric Science, University of Miami, Miami, Florida
Bernhard Riegl, Nova Southeastern University, Florida

The BRT acknowledges the exceptional assistance of Mariska Weijerman (UH JIMAR-CRED) and Matt Dunlap (UH JIMAR-CRED) with coordinating weekly meetings by phone, video, and web meetings, 3 in-person week-long workshops in Honolulu and Seattle, meeting notes, NOAA Wiki administration, preparation of drafts of coral individual species accounts (ISA’s), voting tabulation, document preparation, formatting, and editing. Mariska Weijerman performed much of the email coordinating, cheerleading, and occasional gentle reprimanding necessary to get such a large document to the finish line. Mariska also managed the Endnote library and the cross-country sharing of what grew to be 2000+ citations. Matt Dunlap and Chelsey Lahiff (Pacific Islands Regional Office [PIRO]) tracked down and consolidated all available PDF files for these citations. Megan Moews and Joyce Miller (UH JIMAR-CRED) attended weekly Corals BRT meetings and provided input learned from their participation as Endangered Species Act coordinators in prior and simultaneous Pacific Islands Fisheries Science Center (PIFSC) status review processes (false killer whale and bumphead parrotfish). Amanda Toperoff (UH JIMAR-CRED) prepared and presented a standard operating procedure guide to the BRT for document-sharing on the NOAA Wiki site, and prepared numerous graphs and figures that greatly enhanced the look of the final document, including ISA voting result figures, coral life history diagrams, and the front cover. Rodney Withall (UH JIMAR-CRED) coordinated BRT meetings and took meeting notes.
for several weeks during Matt and Mariska’s absence. Kathryn Dennis (UH JIMAR-CRED) assisted with editing and formatting of the final document.

Karen Sender (PIFSC) gave patient instruction on use and administration of the NOAA Wiki site for document sharing, editing, security, and version control. The BRT would also like to thank Francine Fiust, Audrey Rivero, and Jerry Wetherall of the Pacific Islands Fisheries Science Center editorial staff for their comments and suggestions, in addition to a quick turnaround for such a large document.

The BRT thanks many more for timely responses to our inquiries and for sharing access to photos, data, pre-prints of publications, and general expertise. Dave Burdick from the Government of Guam for photo permissions, Esther Peters of George Mason University for input on coral disease, Thad Murdoch of the Bermuda Zoological Society and Samantha dePutron of the Bermuda Institute of Ocean Sciences for information about the coral fauna of Bermuda, Chris Caldow and Sarah Hile from the NOAA Biogeography Branch, Marcia Creary from CARICOMP, Daniel Mauricio Rozo Garzon, Sven Zea, and Raul Navas from the Instituto de Investigaciones Marinas y Costeras in Santa Marta, Colombia, Judy Lang and Ken Marks from Atlantic Gulf Rapid Reef Assessment, Beth Polidoro of the IUCN Species Programme, Elizabeth (Liz) White of the CITES Species database, UNEP World Conservation Monitoring Centre, Mark Chiappone of the University of North Carolina-Wilmington and Key Largo, FL, Rob Ruzicka of Florida Marine Research Institute, Dwight Gledhill from NOAA’s Atlantic Oceanographic and Meteorological Laboratory, Andrew Baird from the Australian Research Council Center of Excellence for Coral Reef Studies, James Cook University, Joshua Voss of the Harbor Branch Oceanographic Institute, William Fischer of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, William “Jeff” Miller and Andrea Atkinson from the National Park Service, Todd LaJeunnese of The Pennsylvania State University, and Jennifer Smith of the Scripps Institution of Oceanography, University of California San Diego.

Finally, the BRT would like to thank the various NOAA resource managers and General Counsel who patiently provided guidance to the scientists on the BRT about the many nuances of the U.S. Endangered Species Act, including Jennifer Moore (NMFS Southeast Regional Office [SERO]), Marta Nammack (NMFS Office of Protected Resources), Lance Smith (NMFS PIRO), Jon Drake (NMFS Northwest Regional Office), Sarah Garvin (NMFS SERO), Elena Onaga (NMFS PIRO Office of the General Counsel), and Cheryl Scannell (NMFS SERO Office of the General Counsel).